CHAPTER IV

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

The data of the study are EPG-enabling competence descriptors and existing curricula of English education study programs and pre-service teacher training program from five universities. EPG- enabling competences are divided into three sub competences namely intercultural competence, language awareness, and digital media. The EPG-enabling competences are the indicator of analysing the existing curricula. Therefore, in this chapter, the analysis of existing curricula will be presented in order to answer the research question of how and to what extent the EPG-based enabling competences are developed in the curricula of English education study programs and pre-service teacher training program.

4.1 The EPG- Enabling Competences

European Profiling Grid (EPG) is a project which was conducted by the European commission that was started from 2011 to October 2013 and involved partners from nine countries (Austria, Bosnia, Bulgaria, France, Germany, Ireland, Italy, Romania, Spain) which are leading national and international authorities on language education (European commission, 2013). The EPG is a reflective assessment for describing language teacher competence. It is shown in the form of table. One axis is list of categories of teacher competences; the other is a description of six phases of development ranging from novice teacher to experience and expert teacher

(European commission, 2013). Below is description of enabling competences in European Profiling Grid (EPG).

4.1.1 Sub Competence of Intercultural Competence

Intercultural competence is the first sub competence in enabling competences. There are 16 descriptors in this sub competence. The first development phase (1.1) of intercultural competence has one descriptor namely 'understands that the relationship between language and culture is an important factor in language teaching and learning'.

The second development phase (1.2) has three descriptors those are firstly 'is learning about the relevance of cultural issues in teaching'. The second descriptor is 'can in cultural behaviour and traditions. The third descriptor is 'can create an atmosphere of tolerance and understanding in classes where there is social and cultural diversity'

The third development phase (2.1) has three descriptors namely 'understands and is able to take account of relevant stereotypical views'. The second descriptor is 'can use own awareness to expand students' knowledge of relevant cultural behaviour, e.g. politeness, body language, etc. The third descriptor is 'can recognize the importance of avoiding intercultural problems in the classroom and promotes inclusivity and mutual respect.

The fourth development phase (2.2) has three descriptors those are firstly 'can help learners to analyse stereotypical views and prejudices'. The second descriptor is 'can integrate into lessons key areas of difference in

intercultural behaviour (e.g politeness, body language, etc.). The third descriptor is 'can select materials that are well matched to the cultural horizon of learners and yet extends this further using activities appropriate to the group.

The fifth development phase (3.1) has three descriptors those are firstly 'can use web searches, projects, and presentations to expand own and learners understanding and appreciation of intercultural issues. The second descriptor is 'can develop learners' ability to analyse and discuss social and cultural similarities and differences'. The third descriptor is 'can anticipate and manage effectively areas of intercultural sensitivity'.

The sixth development phase (3.2) has three descriptors namely first 'can use her/his extensive knowledge of intercultural issues when this is appropriate to assist less experienced colleagues'. The second descriptor is 'can develop colleagues' ability to deal with cultural issues, suggesting techniques to defuse disagreements and critical incidents if they arise'. The third descriptor is 'can create activities, tasks and materials for own and colleagues' use and can seek feedback on these.'

4.1.2 Sub Competence of Language Awareness

Language awareness competence has 14 descriptors. The first development phase (1.1) has two descriptors those are firstly 'can use dictionaries and grammar books etc as reference sources'. The second

descriptor is 'can answer simple questions about language that are frequently asked at levels she/he is teaching'.

The development phase 1.2 has two descriptors namely 'can give correct models of language form and usage adapted to the level of the learners at lower levels. The second descriptor is 'can give answers to language queries that are not necessarily complete but that are appropriate for lower level learners'.

The development phase 2.1 has two descriptors those are firstly 'can give correct models of language form and usage appropriate for the level concerned, except at advanced levels (C1-2). The second descriptor is 'can give answers to questions about the target language appropriate for the level concerned, except at advanced levels (C1-2).

The development phase 2.2 has three descriptors those are firstly 'can give correct models of language form and usage, for all levels up except at C2 on almost all occasions'. The second descriptor is 'can recognize and understand the language problem that a learner is having. The third descriptor is 'can give answers to questions about the target language that are appropriate for the level concerned except at C2'.

The development phase 3.1 has three times those are firstly 'can select and give correct models of language form and usage on almost all occasions at all levels'. The second descriptor is 'can answer almost all language queries fully and accurately and give clear explanations'. The third

descriptor is 'can use a range of techniques to guide learners in working out answers to their own language queries and correcting their errors'.

The development phase 3.2 has two descriptors those are firstly 'can always give full, accurate answers to queries from students about different aspects of language and usage. The second descriptor is 'can explain subtle differences of form, meaning and usage at C1 and C2 levels'.

4.1.3 Sub Competence of Digital Media

Digital media has 19 descriptors. The development phase 1.1 has three descriptors those are first 'can use word-processing software to write a worksheet, following standard conventions. The second descriptor is 'can search for potential teaching material on the internet. The third descriptor is 'can download resources from websites'.

The development phase 1.2 has two descriptors those are firstly 'can create lessons with downloaded texts, pictures, graphics, etc'. The second descriptor is 'can organize computer files in logically ordered folders'.

The development phase 2.1 has four descriptors those are firstly 'can use software for handling images, DVDs, and sound files. The second descriptor is 'can use any standard Windows/Mac software, including media players. The third descriptor is 'can recommend appropriate online materials to students and colleagues'. The fourth descriptor is 'can use a data projector for lessons involving the internet, a DVD etc.

The development phase 2.2 two descriptors namely 'can set and supervise on-line work for learners'. The second descriptor is 'can use software for handling images, DVDs, and sound files'.

The development phase 3.1 has five descriptors those are firstly 'can rain students to select and use on-line exercises appropriate to their individual needs'. The second descriptor is 'can edit and adapt sound and video files'. The third descriptor is 'can show colleagues how to use new software and hardware'. The fourth descriptor is 'can coordinate project work with digital media (using, for example, a camera, the internet, social networks). The fifth descriptor is 'can troubleshoot most problems with classroom digital equipment'.

The development phase 3.2 has three descriptors those are firstly 'can train students to use any available classroom digital equipment (IWB incl.), their mobiles, tablets etc. profitably for language learning.' The second descriptor is 'can show colleagues how to exploit the teaching potential of available digital equipment and internet-based resources. The third descriptor is 'can design blended learning modules using a learning management system e.g. Moodle.

4.2 The EPG-Based Enabling Competences in the Curricula of English Education Study Programs and Pre-Service Teacher Training Programs

The analysis of intercultural competence, language awareness and digital media from each university will be described below.

4.2.1 University A

University A has 58 courses which contain of general basic courses, main courses, and elective courses. There are two courses which contain intercultural competence namely cross and multicultural understanding and American culture. There 29 courses which contain language awareness namely basic listening comprehension, interpretative listening, basic reading comprehension, critical reading, reading for academic purposes, speaking for general context, speaking for professional context, speaking for academic purposes, public speaking, introduction to writing, academic writing, basic grammar, intermediate grammar, advanced grammar, English articulatory phonetics and phonology, English morphology and syntax, semantics and pragmatics, introduction to literature, poetic study, dramatic study, introduction to linguistics, sociolinguistics, translation, broadcasting, English for journalism, English for tourism, English for young learners, advertising, and cinema studies. For digital media, there are three courses which are related to digital media those are introduction to computer application, ICT in English language education, and learning management system in ELT.

4.2.1.1 Intercultural competence in University A

As stated above that the first development phase (1.1) of EPG intercultural competence has one descriptor that is applied in cross and multicultural understanding course which is given in fourth semester. One learning outcome of the course is 'students are able to integrate the relationship between language and culture'. This learning outcome is in accordance with development phase 1.1 descriptor 1 which stated that students 'understands that the relationship between language and culture is an important factor in language teaching and learning'.

The second development phase (1.2) is applied in cross and multicultural understanding and American culture which are given in fourth and sixth semester. The example of learning outcomes in cross and multicultural understanding is 'students are able to explain attitude in education briefly'. This learning outcome is in line with development phase 1.2 descriptor 1 which stated that 'is learning about the relevance of cultural issue in teaching'. One learning outcome of American culture is 'students are able to explain American culture and identity'. This learning outcome is in accordance with development phase 1.2 descriptor 2 that students 'can introduce learners to relevant differences in cultural behaviour and traditions'.

The development phase 3.1 is applied in both cross and multicultural understanding and American culture course. One learning outcome of

American culture is 'students are able to elaborate religion and politics in American life'. This learning outcome is in accordance with development phase 3.1 descriptor 1 that stated 'can use web searches, projects and presentations to expand own and learners understanding and appreciation of intercultural issues'. One example of multicultural understanding is 'students are able to analyse the comparison of education culture between Indonesia culture and native cultures'. It is in line with development phase 3.1 descriptor 2 that reads 'can develop learners` ability to analyse and discuss social and cultural similarities and differences'. Below is the table of distribution of intercultural competence descriptors in cross and multicultural and American culture courses.

Table 4.1 Intercultural Competence in University A

Course	Development Phase															
	1.1	1.2			2.1			2.2			3.1			3.2		
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3
Cross and Multicultural Understanding	√	√	√								√	√				
American culture			√								√					

4.2.1.2 Language Awareness in University A

In university A, there are 29 courses which are related to language awareness. There are eight semester in university A. The courses for the first semester are basic grammar, basic listening, basic speaking and basic reading comprehension. For the second semester, the courses are basic writing (introduction to writing), intermediate grammar, intermediate

speaking and introduction to linguistics. For third semester, the courses are introduction to literature, intermediate writing, intermediate reading, advance listening, TEFL methodology, English articulatory phonetics and phonology. For the fourth semester, the courses are advanced grammar, advanced reading (critical reading) and academic writing. For the fifth semester the courses are English morphology and syntax, introduction to ELT research, sociolinguistics. For the sixth semester, the courses are advance speaking, introduction to semantics and pragmatics, prosaic studies, phonetic studies, and cinema studies. For the seventh semester, the courses are translation, English for young learners, broadcasting, and journalism.

The development phase 1.1 of EPG language awareness is applied in English articulatory phonetics and phonology, translation, and English for journalism. One learning outcome of English articulatory phonetics and phonology is 'students are able to recognize and read phonetic and phonemic transcription'. One learning outcome of translation is 'students are able to produce translation of words and phrases'. One learning outcome of English for journalism is 'students are able to identify and correct inappropriateness in spelling, punctuation, reporting speech, and foreign words'. Those learning competences are in line with EPG phase 1.1 descriptor 1 that students 'can use dictionaries and grammar books etc. as reference sources'.

The development phase 1.2 of EPG language awareness is applied in basic grammar, basic listening, basic speaking, intermediate grammar, English articulatory phonetics and phonology, translation, and English for young learners. The example of learning outcomes of basic grammar is 'students are able to identify basic concept of grammar', 'students are able to identify and apply appropriate grammar in a sentence'. One example of basic listening is 'students are able to identify and infer public announcement listened to public'. One example of basic speaking is 'students are able to introduce personal information'. One example of intermediate grammar is 'students are able to identify appropriate capital letter in a sentence'. One example of English articulatory phonetics and phonology is 'students are able to describe and demonstrate vowel, diphthong, and consonant production'. One example of translation is 'Students are able to produce translation of noun phrases'. One example of English for young learners is 'Students are able to teach English words and pronunciation', 'Students are able to explain English tenses, demonstrate how to teach the concept of tenses to children'. The mentioned learning outcomes are in line with development phase 1.2 descriptor 1 that stated 'can give correct models of language form and usage adapted to the level of the learners at lower levels'.

The development phase 2.1 of EPG language awareness is applied in basic listening, basic speaking, basic reading, basic writing (introduction to writing), intermediate grammar, intermediate speaking (speaking for

academic purposes), introduction to linguistics, introduction to literature, intermediate reading (reading for academic purposes), advance listening, English articulatory phonetics and phonology, advanced grammar, advanced reading (critical reading), advance writing (academic writing), English morphology and syntax, sociolinguistics, advance speaking, introduction to semantics and pragmatics, prosaic study, cinema studies, translation, broadcasting, English for journalism, advertising, English for tourism, and public speaking. One learning outcome of basic listening is 'students are able to follow the instruction of certain job or activity'. One learning outcome of basic grammar is 'students are able to identify appropriate and use conditional if in a sentence'. One learning outcome of basic speaking is 'students are able to interpret the information given in direct communication'. One learning outcome of basic reading is 'Students are able to state the specific information in the text used to predict and identify the general topic of the text'. One learning outcome of basic writing is 'outline a topic and its supporting details'. One learning outcome of intermediate grammar is 'students are able to identify appropriate preposition in a sentence'. One learning outcome of intermediate speaking is 'students are able to identify concepts and features of good presentation'. One learning outcome of introduction to linguistics is 'students are able to explain linguistics and its concept and classify the language and its component'. One learning outcome of introduction to literature is 'students are able to analyze brief history of English literature with the characteristics

in each era'. One learning outcome of intermediate reading (reading for academic purposes) is 'students are able to show their understanding of relations within the sentence/ complex sentences'. One learning outcome of advance grammar is 'students are able to identify grammatical error on other students, composition'. One learning outcome of advance reading is 'students are able to compose a writing expressing their responses to fictional texts chosen'. One learning outcome of advance writing (advance writing) 'students are able to identify basic concept of academic writing, (characteristics and components)'. One learning outcome of English morphology and syntax is 'students are able to Identify and analyse morphological and morphemic analyses'. One learning outcome of sociolinguistics is 'students are able to identify and analyze the linguistic system, multilingualism, and language shift. One learning outcome of advance speaking is 'students are able to discuss life style related to City Life'. One learning outcome of introduction to semantics and pragmatics is 'students are able to identify and analyze language dimension'. One learning outcome of prosaic study is 'students are able to elaborate and identify the basic theory and history of poetry'. One learning outcome of cinema studies is 'students are able to explain the concepts of movie and its history'. One learning outcome of translation is 'students are able to produce translation of idiomatic expressions'. One learning outcome of broadcasting is 'students are able to explain history of broadcasting'. One learning outcome of English for journalism is 'students are able to analyze

styles and idioms in the news given'. One learning outcome of advertising is 'students are able to elaborate the basic concepts of advertising'. One learning outcome of English for tourism is 'students are able to identify and differentiate between types of job positions and description in hotel, and identify the personal details of the hotel staff'. One learning outcome of public speaking is 'students are able to explain the components, language usage and the purposes of speech'. The learning outcomes are in line with EPG phase 2.1 descriptor 1 which stated 'can give correct models of language form and usage appropriate for the level concerned, except at advanced levels (C1-2)'. This phase in line with CEFR descriptor level B1 and B2. The descriptor level B1 is students 'can understand the main points of clear standard input on familiar matters regularly encountered in work, school, leisure, etc; Can deal with most situations likely to arise whilst travelling in an area where the language is spoken; Can produce simple connected text on topics which are familiar or of personal interest; Can describe experiences and events, dreams, hopes and ambitions and briefly give reasons and explanations for opinions and plans.' CEFR descriptor level B2 is students 'can understand the main ideas of complex text on both concrete and abstract topics, including technical discussions in his/her field of specialisation; Can interact with a degree of fluency and spontaneity that makes regular interaction with native speakers quite possible without strain for either party; Can produce clear, detailed text on a wide range of subjects

and explain a viewpoint on a topical issue giving the advantages and Independent disadvantages of various options'.

The development phase 2.2 of EPG language awareness is applied in intermediate reading (reading for academic purposes), advance reading (critical reading), advance writing (academic writing), advance grammar, and public speaking. One learning outcome of intermediate reading (reading for academic purposes) is 'students are able to integrate sources of information in a summarizing paragraph'. One learning outcome of advanced reading is 'students are able to develop a summary of text book chapter'. One learning outcome of academic writing is 'students are able to outline research methodology (selecting appropriate research method, data collection and analysis procedures)'. One learning outcome of advance grammar is 'students are able to detect and correct a business letter'. One learning outcome of public speaking is 'students are able to evaluate and deliver a demonstrative speech'. The learning outcomes are accordance with development phase 2.2 descriptor 1 that stated 'can give correct models of language form and usage, for all levels up except at C2 on almost all occasions'. This phase is in line with CEFR level C1 that reads students 'Can understand a wide range of demanding, longer texts, and recognise implicit meaning; Can express him/herself fluently and spontaneously without much obvious searching for expressions; Can use language flexibly and effectively for social, academic and professional purposes; Can

produce clear, well-structured, detailed text on complex subjects, showing controlled use of organisational patterns, connectors and cohesive device'.

Development phase 3.1 is applied in academic writing and advanced grammar. The learning outcomes of academic writing are 'students are able to compose literature review', 'students are able to compose research methodology', and 'students are able to Revise and recompose research methodology'. The learning outcome of advance grammar is 'students are able to identify error analysis on TOEFL/TOEIC'. The learning outcomes are in line with EPG phase 3.1 descriptor 1 that states 'can select and give correct models of language form and usage on almost all occasions at all levels'.

Table 4.2 Language awareness in University A

Course	Development Phase													
	1.1		1.2		2.1		2.2			3.1			3.2	
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2
Semester 1														
Basic Grammar			√											
Basic Listening			√		√									
Basic Speaking (Speaking for general communication)			√		√									
Basic Reading					√									
Semester 2														
Basic Writing (introduction to writing)					√									
Intermediate grammar			√		√									
Intermediate speaking (speaking for academic purposes)					√									
Introduction to linguistics					√									
Sesmester 3														
Introduction to literature					√									
Intermediate writing (Writing for general purposes)							√							

Intermediate reading (reading for academic purposes)					√										
Advanced listening (Interpretative listening)							√								
English articulatory phonetics and phonology	√				√										
Semester 4															
Advanced grammar							√			√					
Advanced reading (critical reading)							√								
Advanced writing (academic writing)					√		√								
Semester 5															
English morphology and syntax					√										
Sociolinguistics					√										
Semester 6															
Advance speaking (speaking for professional context)					√										
Introduction to semantics and pragmatics					√										
Prosaic study					√										
Cinema studies					√										
Semester 7															
Translation	√		√		√										
English for young learners			√												
Broadcasting					√										
English for Journalism	√				√										
Advertising					√										
English for tourism					√										
Public speaking					√		√								

4.2.1.3 Digital Media in University A

There are three courses which are related to digital competence those are ICT in language teaching, *pengantar aplikasi komputer*, and ELT management. The first development phase (1.1) is applied in *pengantar aplikasi komputer* which is given in the seventh semester. The learning outcomes of *pengantar aplikasi computer* is '*siswa mampu mengenal dan menggunakan Ms. Word', 'siswa mampu mengenal dan menggunakan Ms. Excel', and 'siswa mampu mengenal dan menggunakan Ms. Power Point'*. The learning outcomes are in line with EPG digital media development

phase 1.1 descriptor which stated that 'can use word-processing software to write a worksheet, following standard conventions'.

The development phase 1.2 is applied in ELT management system that is given in seventh semester. The learning outcome is 'students are able to explain adult learning theory which is relevant with multimedia based instruction'. It is in line with development phase 1.2 descriptor 2 which reads 'can organize computer files in logically ordered folders'.

The development phase 2.1 is developed in ICT in language teaching and ELT management system. The learning outcome of ICT in language teaching is first, students are able to explain the principles used in the preparation of effective and efficient technology-based learning. Second, students are able to identify and select the type of technology-based media are properly used in the language classroom in accordance with existing conditions. Third, students are able to elaborate the benefits of technology-based language learning to the development of students. The learning outcome of ELT management is students are able to categorize and compare the kinds of Learning Management System Platform. The learning outcomes belong to development phase 2.1 descriptor 3 that stated 'can recommend appropriate online materials to students and colleagues'.

The development phase 2.2 is applied in ELT management that is given in seventh semester. The learning outcome of ELT management is 'students are able to analyze types of delivery media and explain its

advantages and limitation', 'students are able to evaluate web resources'. It is in accordance with EPG digital media development phase 2.2 descriptor 1 that reads 'can set and supervise on-line work for learners'.

The development phase 3.1 is developed in ICT in language teaching and ELT management. The learning outcomes of ICT in language teaching are 'students are able to explain the benefits and procedures of using online reference tools', 'students are able to explain the notion of e-learning and related e-learning, cite examples of the design of e-learning (for example, hybridization or blended learning, give examples of the use of e-learning in language learning'. The learning outcomes is in line with EPG phase 3.1 descriptor 1 that stated 'can train students to select and use on-line exercises appropriate to their individual needs'. The learning outcome of ICT in language teaching is 'students are able to explain the concept of Web 2.0, the use of virtual learning applications, m-learning in language learning'. It is in line with EPG phase 3.1 descriptor 3 that reads 'can show colleagues how to use new software and hardware'. The other learning outcome of ICT in language teaching is 'students are able to elaborate and use the types of social software, procedure on the use of blogs, wikis and podcasts in learning English'. The learning outcomes of ELT management are 'students are able to elaborate classroom features in GC and Edmodo', 'students are able to use Google Drive', 'students are able to use Google Docs', and 'students are able to use Google Sheets'. The learning outcomes are in accordance with EPG phase 3.1 descriptor 4 that states 'can coordinate

project work with digital media (using, for example, a camera, the internet, social networks)'.

The development phase 3.2 is developed in ICT in language teaching and ELT management. ICT in language teaching is given in sixth semester. Meanwhile ELT management is given in seventh semester. The learning outcome of ICT in language teaching is 'students are able to integrate learning process with technology-based courseware'. It is in line with development phase 3.2 descriptor 2 that states 'can show colleagues how to exploit the teaching potential of available digital equipment and internet-based resources'. Another learning outcome of ICT in language teaching is 'students are able to explain the materials being learned'. The learning outcome of ELT management is 'students are able to create and manage virtual class'. The learning outcomes are in accordance with development phase 3.2 descriptor 3 that reads 'can design blended learning modules using a learning management system e.g. Moodle'.

Table 4.3 Digital Media in University A

Course	Development phase																		
	1.1			1.2		2.1				2.2		3.1					3.2		
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4	Descriptor 5	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3
Introduction to computer application	√																		
ICT in language teaching								√				√		√	√			√	√
ELT management system					√			√	√	√				√					√

4.2.2 University B

University B has 58 courses which contain general basic course, main courses, and elective courses. There are one course which contain intercultural competence namely cross cultural understanding. There 29 courses which contain language awareness namely listening 2, listening 4, reading 2, reading 3, reading 4, extensive reading, speaking 2, speaking 3, speaking 4, writing 1, writing 2, writing 3, writing 4, academic writing, grammar 1, grammar 2, grammar 4, introduction to literature, introduction to linguistics, phonology, phonology 2, morphology and syntax, translation 1, translation 2, pronunciation, pronunciation 2, vocabulary 2, TEFL, and history of English. For digital media, there is no course which is related to digital media.

4.2.2.1 Intercultural Competence in University B

There is one course which is related to intercultural competence namely cross cultural understanding that is given in sixth semester. There are 12 indicators in this course. The first development phase (1.1) is applied in two learning outcomes. The learning outcomes are 'students are able to describe language and culture' and 'students are able to describe the relationship between language and culture.' The learning outcome are in line with EPG intercultural competence development phase 1.1 that states 'understands that the relationship between language and culture is an important factor in language teaching and learning'.

Development phase 1.2 is developed in one learning outcome. The learning outcome is 'students are able to describe cultural conflict'. This learning outcome is in line with development phase 1.2 descriptor 1 that states 'is learning about the relevance of cultural issues in teaching'.

Development phase 3.1 are applied in nine learning outcomes. The learning outcomes are 'students are able to describe the cultural adjustment', 'students are able to describe the gender in education', 'students are able to describe the gender in workplace', 'students are able to describe the gender in society', 'students are able to describe personal value', 'students are able to describe family value', and 'students are able to describe work value'. The learning outcomes are in accordance with EPG intercultural competence development phase 3.1 that reads 'can use web searches, projects and presentations to expand own and learners understanding and appreciation of intercultural issues'. The other learning outcomes are 'students are able to describe how to introduce people', 'students are able to describe the agree and disagreement'.

Table 4.4 Intercultural competence in University B

Course	Development phase															
	1.1	1.2			2.1			2.2			3.1			3.2		
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3
Cross cultural understanding	√	√									√					

4.2.2.2 Language Awareness in University B

There are 29 courses which contain language awareness. In the first semester there are grammar 1, vocabulary 1, reading 1, listening 1, speaking 1, pronunciation 1. In the second semester, there are grammar 2, vocabulary 2, reading 2, listening 2, speaking 2, and pronunciation 2. In the third semester, there are history of English, phonology 1, reading 3, listening 3, writing 1, speaking 3, and introduction to linguistics. In the fourth semester, there are reading 4, listening 4, writing 2, speaking 4, grammar 4, phonology 2, and psycholinguistics. In the fifth semester, there are extensive reading, writing 3, introduction to literature, morphology, and translation 1. In the sixth semester, there are translation 2 and writing 4. In the seventh semester, there are contrastive and error analysis and academic writing. The detail of each course will be described below.

Development phase 1.2 is applied in grammar 1, and pronunciation. The learning outcomes of grammar 1 are 'students are able to understand the present, past, future tenses of English', 'students are able to understand the form, meaning, and use of English tenses'. The learning outcomes of pronunciation are 'students are able to pronounce vowel and consonant sounds', 'students are able to pronounce form and variants of sound', 'students are able to pronounce sounds form and meaning'. It is in line with EPG development phase 1.2 descriptor 1 that 'can give correct models of language form and usage adapted to the level of the learners at lower

levels'. The lower level learners are those who are in CEFR level A1 an A2 (North,2014). CEFR level A1 is 'can understand and use familiar everyday expressions and very basic phrases aimed at the satisfaction of needs of a concrete type; can introduce him/herself and others and can ask and answer questions about personal details such as where he/she lives, people he/she knows and things he/she has; can interact in a simple way provided the other person talks slowly and clearly and is prepared to help'. CEFR level A2 is 'can understand sentences and frequently used expressions related to areas of most immediate relevance (e.g. very basic personal and family information, shopping, local geography, employment); can communicate in simple and routine tasks requiring a simple and direct exchange of information on familiar and routine matters; can describe in simple terms aspects of his/her background, immediate environment and matters in areas of immediate basic need'.

Development phase 2.1 is applied in 22 courses. In the second semester there are grammar 2, vocabulary 2, reading 2, listening 2, speaking 2, and pronunciation 2. In the third semester, there are history of English, phonology 1, reading 3, writing 1, speaking 3 and introduction to linguistics. In the fourth semester, there are listening 4, speaking 4, phonology 2, and extensive reading. In the fifth semester, there are writing 3, introduction to literature, morphology, and translation 1. In the sixth semester, there are translation 2 and writing 4. One learning outcome of grammar 2 is 'students are able to understand the nouns, pronouns,

modals, and passive voice in English'. One learning outcome of vocabulary 2 is 'students are able to use and understand the vocabulary nationally and contextually'. One learning outcome of reading 2 is 'students are able to mention the types of the texts'. One learning outcome of listening 2 is 'students are able to draw conclusions'. One learning outcome of speaking 2 is 'students are able to have a discussion technique using appropriate vocabulary and correct structure'. One learning outcome of pronunciation 2 is 'Students are able to understand the definition of consonant clusters'. One learning outcome of history of English is 'students are able to explain the development of English become one of the international language'. One learning outcome of phonology 1 is 'students are able to describe the definition of phonology, phonetic, phonemic, etc'. One learning outcome of reading 3 is 'students are able to write summary using SQ3R method'. One learning outcome of writing 1 is 'students are able to use the elements of effective writing on their writings'. The learning outcome of speaking 3 are 'students are able to propose a reason from the answers',' students are able to propose a commitment from learning substance, the rules and procedures of teaching and learning'. One learning outcome of introduction to linguistics is 'Students are able to explain the concept of linguistics'. One learning outcome of speaking 4 is 'Students are able to use functions and expressions effectively'. One learning outcome of phonology 2 is 'students are able to explain the role of phonology in English teaching'. One learning outcome of extensive reading is 'Students are be able to write the summary

of the textbooks'. One learning outcome of writing 3 is 'students are able to understand how to make an effective cause/effect essay'. One learning outcome of introduction to literature is 'students are able to understand and describe the concepts of literature'. One learning outcome of morphology is 'students are able to define the definition of morphology and morpheme'. One learning outcome of translation 1 is 'students are able to generalize the descriptors to get the topic'. One learning outcome of translation 2 is 'students are able to differ the main idea and supporting idea in paragraph'. One learning outcome of writing 4 is 'students are able to construct a narrative paragraph'. The learning outcomes are in accordance with development phase 2.1 descriptor 1 that states 'can give correct models of language form and usage appropriate for the level concerned, except at advanced levels (C1-2)'. This phase in line with CEFR descriptor level B1 and B2. The descriptor level B1 is students 'can understand the main points of clear standard input on familiar matters regularly encountered in work, school, leisure, etc; Can deal with most situations likely to arise whilst travelling in an area where the language is spoken; Can produce simple connected text on topics which are familiar or of personal interest; Can describe experiences and events, dreams, hopes and ambitions and briefly give reasons and explanations for opinions and plans.' CEFR descriptor level B2 is students 'can understand the main ideas of complex text on both concrete and abstract topics, including technical discussions in his/her field of specialisation; Can interact with a degree of fluency and spontaneity that

makes regular interaction with native speakers quite possible without strain for either party; Can produce clear, detailed text on a wide range of subjects and explain a viewpoint on a topical issue giving the advantages and Independent disadvantages of various options'.

Development phase 2.2 is applied in 10 courses. In the first semester, there is speaking 2. In the third semester, there are writing 1 and speaking 3. In the fourth semester, there are listening 4, writing 2, speaking 4, and grammar 4. In the fifth semester, there are extensive reading and writing 3. In the seventh semester, there are contrastive analysis and error and academic writing. One learning outcome of speaking 2 is 'students are able to work together and discuss what the main audience will be for each band thinking about age, gender, and other interests'. One learning outcome of writing 1 is 'students are able to produce cohesive writings'. One learning outcome of speaking 3 is 'students are able to cope with Closing Courtesy, Summary, Conclusions, and give the message more impact'. One learning outcome of writing 2 is 'students are able to understand how to prepare, organize, and develop the writing'. One learning outcome of speaking 4 is 'students are able to overcome differences in every step of a negotiation according the agreed rules'. One learning outcome of grammar 4 is 'Students are able to identify, analyze, and evaluate types of sentences in English based on their functions, coordinate connectors, and subordinates, and identify, analyze, and evaluate problems in formation of complex sentences, such as fragments, run-ons, and dangling

constructions'. One learning outcome of extensive reading is 'students are be able to write a critical thinking essays from the articles'. One learning outcome of writing 3 is 'students are able to able to use parallel structure to add symmetry and style'. One learning outcome of contrastive analysis and error is 'students are able to identify, classify, and evaluate the language learners' errors'. One learning outcome of academic writing is 'students are be able to produce pieces of analytical essays'. The learning outcomes are in line with development phase 2.2 descriptor 1 that reads 'can give correct models of language form and usage for all levels up except at C2 on almost all occasions'. One learning outcome of listening 4 is 'students are able to answer questions based on short passages in TOEFL exercises'. The learning outcome belong to EPG phase 2.2 descriptor 3 that reads 'can give answers to questions about the target language that are appropriate for the level concerned except at C2'. This phase is in line with CEFR level C1 that reads students 'Can understand a wide range of demanding, longer texts, and recognise implicit meaning; Can express him/herself fluently and spontaneously without much obvious searching for expressions; Can use language flexibly and effectively for social, academic and professional purposes; Can produce clear, well-structured, detailed text on complex subjects, showing controlled use of organisational patterns, connectors and cohesive device'.

Development phase 3.1 is applied in reading 4 and writing 2. The learning outcomes of reading 4 are 'Students are able to read four English

novels consisting of 200 pages each' and 'Students are able to reach minimum 300 wpm in speed reading'. The learning outcomes of writing 2 is 'students are able to have minimum grammatical mistakes'. The learning outcomes are in line with development phase 3.1 descriptor 1 which reads 'can select and give correct models of language form and usage on almost all occasions at all levels'. The other learning outcomes of reading 4 are 'students are able to answer reading comprehension questions of paper-based TOEFL', 'students are able to answer reading comprehension questions of IELTS', 'students are able to answer reading comprehension questions of TOEIC'. The learning outcomes are in accordance with development phase 3.1 descriptor 2 that states 'can answer almost all language queries fully and accurately and give clear explanations'. The development phase 3.1 is in line with CEFR level C2 that states 'can understand with ease virtually everything heard or read; can summarise information from different spoken and written sources, reconstructing arguments and accounts in a coherent presentation; can express him/herself spontaneously, very fluently and precisely, differentiating finer shades of meaning even in more complex situations'.

Table 4.5 Language Awareness in University B

Course	Development Phase													
	1.1		1.2		2.1		2.2			3.1			3.2	
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2
Semester 1														
Grammar 1			√											
Pronunciation 1			√											

Semester 2														
Grammar 2					√									
Vocabulary 2					√									
Reading 2					√									
Listening 2					√									
Speaking 2					√		√							
Pronunciation 2					√									
Sesmester 3														
History of English					√									
Phonology 1					√									
Reading 3					√									
Listening 3														
Writing 1					√		√							
Speaking 3					√		√							
Introduction to linguistics					√									
Semester 4														
Reading 4											√	√			
Listening 4							√			√					
Writing 2					√		√			√					
Speaking 4					√		√								
Grammar 4							√								
Phonology 2					√										
psycholinguistics															
Semester 5														
Extensive reading					√		√								
Writing 3					√		√								
Introduction to literature					√										
Morphology					√										
Translation					√										
Semester 6														
Translation 2					√										
Writing 4					√										
Semester 7														
Contrastive and error analysis							√								
Academic writing							√								

4.2.3 University C

University C has 58 courses which contain general basic course, main courses, and elective courses. There are one course which contain intercultural competence namely cross cultural understanding. There 19 courses which contain language awareness namely English for interpersonal, grammar for interpersonal and social communication, diction in discourse and English in social discourse, English in business discourse, English phonetics and phonology, English in literary works, English for social communication, introduction to language English for business

communication, grammar for business communication, English morphology, public speaking, introduction to translation, and introduction to functional grammar, English for academic communication and introduction to discourse analysis, English syntax, and functional grammar.

4.2.3.1 Intercultural competence in University C

There is one course which is related to intercultural competence in university C namely cross cultural understanding. There are five learning outcome in this course. Development phase 1.1 is applied in one learning outcome namely 'students are able to explain the relationship between culture and language'. This learning outcome is in line with phase 1.1 descriptor 1 that states 'understands that the relationship between language and culture is an important factor in language teaching and learning'.

Development phase 2.1 is applied in two learning outcomes those are 'students are able to outline the reasons for the need to develop sound intercultural communication competences in EFL learners and teachers' and 'students are able to outline effective strategies to avoid certain cultural conflicts'. The learning outcomes are accordance with EPG phase 2.1 descriptor 3 that states 'can recognize the importance of avoiding intercultural problems in the classroom and promotes inclusivity and mutual respect'.

Development phase 3.1 is applied in two learning outcomes. One learning outcome is 'students are able to identify similarities and differences

between the English language speakers' culture and Indonesia culture on some common intercultural communication issues' belongs to phase 3.1 descriptor 1 that states 'can use web searches, projects and presentations to expand own and learners understanding and appreciation of intercultural issues'. One learning outcome 'students are able to prepare a written report and an oral presentation of the result of their exploration study on each of the topics discussed throughout the course' belongs to 3.1 descriptor 2 that is 'can develop learners` ability to analyse and discuss social and cultural similarities and differences'.

Table 4.6 Intercultural competence in University C

Course	Development phase															
	1.1	1.2			2.1			2.2			3.1			3.2		
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3
Cross cultural understanding	√						√				√	√				

4.2.3.2 Language Awareness in University C

There are 19 courses which are related to language awareness in University C. In the first semester, there are four courses which related to language awareness namely English for interpersonal, grammar for interpersonal and social communication, diction in discourse and English in social discourse. In the second semester, there are five courses which are related to language awareness namely English in business discourse, English phonetics and phonology, English in literary works, English for social communication, introduction to language. In the third semester, there

are three courses which are related to language awareness those are English for business communication, grammar for business communication, English morphology. In the fourth semester, there are three courses which are related to language awareness namely public speaking, introduction to translation, and introduction to functional grammar. In the fifth semester, there are two courses those are English for academic communication and introduction to discourse analysis. In the sixth semester, there are two courses namely English syntax, and functional grammar.

Development phase 1.2 is applied in English for interpersonal communication, grammar for interpersonal and socio communication, and public speaking. One learning outcome of English for interpersonal communication is 'students are able to introduce oneself and others and exchange personal information in a simple formal and informal situation', 'students are able to describe routines and responsibilities', 'students are able to talk about personal interests'. One learning outcome of grammar for interpersonal and socio communication is 'students are able to link words and phrases with connectors such as and, but, because, then'. One learning outcome of public speaking is 'Students are able to review the theory of public speaking: the history of public speaking, the concepts of rhetoric and genre in the ancient Greek and today, the key issues in public speaking: organization and delivery'. The learning outcomes are in line with development phase 1.2 descriptor 1 that states 'can give correct models of

language form and usage adapted to the level of the learners at lower levels'.

Development phase 2.1 is applied in English for interpersonal communication, grammar for interpersonal and socio communication, diction in discourse, English in social discourse, English phonetics and phonology, English morphology, public speaking, and introduction to functional grammar, English in business discourse, English in literary works. One learning outcome of English for interpersonal communication is 'Students are able to use simple grammatical phrases and sentences for interpersonal and social communication'. One learning outcome of grammar for interpersonal and socio communication is 'Students are able to use simple grammatical phrases and sentences for interpersonal and social communication'. One learning outcome of diction in discourse is 'Students are able to use their knowledge and understanding of English diction to express the meaning in writing or orally exactly in context'. One learning outcome of English in literary works is 'Students are able to explain the differences of "poetry, prose, and drama" and "factual language and figurative language" in the form of oral scientific presentations'. One learning outcome of English in business discourse is 'Students are able to identify the coverage of the study and its relations to the development of students' business knowledge, language competences, and future business practices'. One learning outcome of English in social discourse is 'Students are able to compare, attribute, and explain the news on aspects of social

function, text structure, and linguistic elements, in the form of oral and written presentations, coherently with language elements in context'. One learning outcome of English phonetics and phonology is 'Students are able to predict the pronunciation of words with certain spellings'. One learning outcome of English morphology is 'Students are able to classify the purpose of English morphology and syntax subject, the limitation of morphology and identify the word class into: content (open) and function (close), with giving the examples of those word classes'. One learning outcome of public speaking is 'Students are able to identify the coverage of the study'. One learning outcome of introduction to functional grammar is 'Students are able to achieve the social purpose'. The learning outcomes are in accordance with EPG phase 2.1 descriptor 1 that states 'can give correct models of language form and usage appropriate for the level concerned, except at advanced levels (C1-2)'.

Development phase 2.2 is applied in 10 courses. In the second semester, there are English in business discourse, English for social communication, and introduction to language. In the third semester, there is English for business communication. In the fourth semester, there are English in academic discourse and introduction to translation. In the fifth semester, English for academic communication, introduction to discourse analysis, and grammar for academic communication. In the sixth semester, there is functional grammar. One learning outcome of English in business discourse is 'students are able to use language for business practices'. One

learning outcome of English for social communication is 'students are able to redesign and present social-functional texts (brochures, advertisements, reviews, instruction manuals, essays, and editorials) accurately according to the social functions, rhetorical structures, and language features in English for each part of the social-functional texts in brochures, advertisements, reviews, instruction manuals, essays, and editorials'. One learning outcome of introduction to language is 'Students are able to produces papers (academic work) that discusses various concepts of language and branches in terms of structure (phonetics, phonology, morphology, syntax, semantics), in terms of function (pragmatic, sociolinguistic, SFL), and in terms of application (language acquisition, Psycholinguistics, translation, etc.) and is associated with the needs of language learning, in the form of oral and written presentations coherently with language elements in context'. One learning outcome of English for business communication is 'Students are able to produce business texts communicated orally and write in correspondence, meetings & records, business presentation, and promotion by considering social functions, text structures and linguistic elements in a coherent and contextual business, with independent, analytical, diligent, responsible, honest, and confident'. One learning outcome of English in academic discourse is 'Students are able to produce academic essays, communicated orally and written in seminars and posters, with social functions, text structures and linguistic elements coherent and in a scientific context, and accompanied by

independent, analytical, diligent, responsible, honest, and confident behavior'. One learning outcome of introduction to translation is 'Students are able to translate an academic text (parts of textbook) and short functional texts (a brochure and manuals) from English into Indonesian based on their social functions and text structures with a coherent and contextual piece of language'. One learning outcome of English for academic communication is 'Students are able to produce academic essays, communicated orally and written in seminars and posters, with social functions, text structures and linguistic elements coherent and in a scientific context, and accompanied by independent, analytical, diligent, responsible, honest, and confident behavior'. One learning outcome of introduction to discourse analysis is 'Students are able to analyze and compare different types of findings and the formats of reporting'. One learning outcome of grammar for academic communication is 'Students are able to capture and construct meaning in an academic essay communicated orally and written in seminars and posters form, in terms of words, phrases, clauses, sentences, and paragraphs with a correct and coherently constructed grammatical structure, with independent, analytical, diligent, responsible behavior Responsible, honest, and confident'. One learning outcome of functional grammar is 'Students are able to notice the other signs used in the text'. The learning outcomes are in line with development phase 2.2 descriptor 1 that states 'can give correct models of language form and usage, for all levels up except at C2 on almost all occasions'.

Table 4.7 Language Awareness in University C

Course	Development Phase													
	1.1		1.2		2.1		2.2			3.1			3.2	
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2
Semester 1														
English for interpersonal communication			√		√									
Grammar for interpersonal and socio communication			√		√									
Diction in discourse					√									
English in social discourse					√									
Semester 2														
English in business discourse							√							
English phonetics and phonology					√									
English in literary work														
English for social communication							√							
Introduction to lanuguage							√							
Sesmester 3														
English for business communication							√							
English morphology					√									
Semester 4														
Public speaking			√		√									
English in academic discourse							√							
Introduction to functional grammar					√									
Introduction to translation							√							
Semester 5														
English for academic communication							√							
Introduction to discourse analysis							√							
Grammar for academic communication							√							
Semester 6														
Functional grammar							√							

4.2.4 University D

University D has 66 courses which contain general basic course, main courses, and elective courses. There are one course which contain intercultural competence namely cross cultural understanding. There are

30 courses which are related with language awareness there are five courses namely literal listening, basic reading, basic English grammar, pronunciation practice and introduction to linguistics speaking for social discourse, social discourse comprehension, sentenced based writing, complex English grammar, phonetics and phonology, introduction to literature critical listening, speaking for academic purposes, critical reading, paragraph based writing, structure for TOEFL, morphology and syntax, and prose and poetry extensive listening, public speaking, genre based writing, functional grammar, semantics and pragmatics, translation 1, English for business and English for tourism academic writing, sociolinguistics, translation 2, and discourse analysis. For digital media, there are three course namely speaking for academic purposes, public speaking and ICT in language teaching.

4.2.4.1 Intercultural competence in University D

Intercultural competence is found in cross cultural understanding. It has 9 learning outcomes in this course. Development phase 1.1 is applied in two earning outcomes namely 'students are able to recognize cross-cultural terms and principles' and 'students are able to recognize the relationship of culture and English'. The learning outcomes are in accordance with development phase 1.1 descriptor 1 that describes 'understands that the relationship between language and culture is an important factor in language teaching and learning'.

Development phase 1.2 is applied in three learning outcomes. First learning outcome is 'Students are able to recognize the conflict in cross culture'. It is in line with development phase 1.2 descriptor 1 that reads 'is learning about the relevance of cultural issues in teaching'. Other learning outcomes are 'students are able to recognize the verbal communication' and 'students are able to recognize nonverbal communication'. The learning outcomes are in accordance with phase 1.2 descriptor 2 that states 'can introduce learners to relevant differences in cultural behaviour and traditions'.

Development phase 3.1 is applied in four learning outcomes namely 'students are able to recognize the meaning of friends and acquaintances', 'students are able to recognize the works in America', 'students are able to recognize values and education in America', and 'students are able to recognize family tradition'. The learning outcomes are in line with phase 3.1 descriptor 1 that reads 'can use web searches, projects and presentations to expand own and learners understanding and appreciation of intercultural issues'.

Table 4.8 Intercultural competence in University D

Course	1.1	1.2			2.1			2.2			3.1			3.2		
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3
Cross cultural understanding	√	√	√								√					

4.2.4.2 Language awareness in University D

There are 30 courses which are related with language awareness. In the first semester there are five courses namely literal listening, basic reading, basic English grammar, pronunciation practice and introduction to linguistics. In the second semester there are six courses namely speaking for social discourse, social discourse comprehension, sentenced based writing, complex English grammar, phonetics and phonology, introduction to literature. In the third semester, there are seven courses namely critical listening, speaking for academic purposes, critical reading, paragraph based writing, structure for TOEFL, morphology and syntax, and prose and poetry. In the fourth semester, there are eight courses namely extensive listening, public speaking, genre based writing, functional grammar, semantics and pragmatics, translation 1, English for business and English for tourism. In the fifth semester, there are four courses namely academic writing, sociolinguistics, translation 2, and discourse analysis.

Development phase 1.2 is developed in six courses those are literal listening, pronunciation practice, sentence based writing, basic English grammar, complex English grammar and speaking for academic purposes. One learning outcome of literal listening is 'students are able to explain the information in daily conversation'. The learning outcomes of pronunciation practice are 'students are able to identify and pronounce all vowels based on International Phonetic Alphabets (IPA)', 'students are able to pronounce

consonants' sounds and write them in correct phonetic transcription', 'students are able to pronounce vowel and diphthong sound and write them in correct phonetic transcription', 'students are able to pronounce "c" and "ch" correctly', 'students are able to differentiate simple consonants and silent consonants'. One learning outcome of sentence based writing is 'write intransitive sentence and analyze the pattern of the sentence', 'write transitive sentence and analyze the pattern of the sentence'. The learning outcomes of basic English grammar are 'students are able to explain and use noun', 'students are able to explain and use adjectives', 'students are able to explain and use adverb', 'students are able to explain and use verb', and 'students are able to explain and use preposition'. One learning outcome of speaking for academic purposes is 'Provide personal information contextually'. One learning outcome of complex English grammar is 'students are able to mention the part of the sentences'. The learning outcomes are in line with phase 1.2 descriptor 1 that states 'can give correct models of language form and usage adapted to the level of the learners at lower levels'. The learning outcomes are in accordance with CEFR level A1 and A2. CEFR level A1 is 'can understand and use familiar everyday expressions and very basic phrases aimed at the satisfaction of needs of a concrete type; can introduce him/herself and others and can ask and answer questions about personal details such as where he/she lives, people he/she knows and things he/she has; can interact in a simple way provided the other person talks slowly and clearly and is prepared to help'.

CEFR level A2 is 'can understand sentences and frequently used expressions related to areas of most immediate relevance (e.g. very basic personal and family information, shopping, local geography, employment); can communicate in simple and routine tasks requiring a simple and direct exchange of information on familiar and routine matters; can describe in simple terms aspects of his/her background, immediate environment and matters in areas of immediate basic need'.

Development phase 2.1 is applied in 26 courses. In the first semester, there are literal listening, basic reading and introduction to linguistics. In the second semester, there are social discourse comprehension, sentence based writing, complex English grammar, phonetics and phonology, and introduction to literature. In the third semester, there are critical listening, speaking for academic purposes, paragraph based writing, structure for TOEFL, morphology and syntax, and prose and poetry. In the fourth semester, there are extensive listening, public speaking, functional grammar, semantics and pragmatics, translation, and English for tourism. In the fifth semester, there are academic writing, sociolinguistics, translation 2, and discourse analysis. In the sixth semester, there is psycholinguistics. The learning outcomes of literal listening are 'Students are able to explain how to cook certain food', 'Students are able to explain what people should do when go shopping in traditional market and modern market. The learning outcomes of basic reading are 'students are able to summarize how to handle emotion',

'students are able to explain and summarize the cause of sleep disorder'. The learning outcomes of introduction to linguistics are 'Students are able to explain the definition of language', 'Students are able to explain the relevance of linguistics and language teaching'. The learning outcomes of social discourse comprehension are 'find topics of paragraphs', 'find and explain main idea of paragraphs'. One learning outcome of sentence based writing 'Write with the category of sentence connectors (coordinating conjunction, correlative conjunction, transition expression, conjunctive adverbs and subordinators)'. The learning outcomes of complex English grammar are 'students are able to explain and finish questions about sentences with multiple clauses', 'students are able to explain and finish questions about sentences with more multiple clauses'. The learning outcomes of phonetics and phonology are 'students are able to explain the definition of phonetics and phonology', 'students are able to explain purpose of learning phonetics and phonology'. One learning outcome of introduction to literature is 'students are able to get knowledge about literature and its' development'. One learning outcome of critical listening is 'students are able to explain the job on the new work place'. The learning outcomes of speaking for academic purposes are 'describe family relationships', 'share personal information about each family member', 'gather information from a variety of sources in English about recount text'. One learning outcome of paragraph based writing is 'mention the function and the category of sentence connectors (coordinating conjunction, correlative conjunction,

transition expression, conjunctive adverbs and subordinators)'. One learning outcome of structure for TOEFL is 'Recognize some typical questions in Structure part of TOEFL, especially paper based TOEFL'. One learning outcome of morphology and syntax is 'Students are able to explain the meaning and purpose of morphology'. One learning outcome of prose and poetry is 'Students are able to explain what prose is and the important of learning prose'. One learning outcome of extensive listening is 'Students are able to explain the various kinds of conversation'. One learning outcome of public speaking is 'students are able to understand the purpose of public speaking, the structure: greeting, introduction, body, and closing of a speech'. One learning outcome of functional grammar is 'Students are able to describe the basic concept of genre and grammar, text and context '. The learning outcomes of semantics and pragmatics are 'recognize the differences of semantics and pragmatics', 'recognize word meaning and semantic properties'. The learning outcomes of translation 1 are 'students are able to mention the definition and the types of translation', 'students are able to explain the translation procedures'. One learning outcome of English for tourism is 'Students are able to explain the form of tourism'. One learning outcome of academic writing is 'Students are able to write a draft of an essay'. The learning outcomes of sociolinguistics are 'students are able to get the meaning of some basic terms in sociolinguistics', 'students are able to analyze the language, kinds of dialects and language variety'. One learning outcome of translation 2 is 'students are able to analyze the internal

and external factors, summarize the purpose and the translation strategies'. One learning outcome of discourse analysis is 'students can understand their right & responsibility, and the coverage of materials in this course'. One learning outcome of psycholinguistics is 'students are able to explain the definition and the history of psycholinguistic'. The mentioned learning outcomes are in line with development phase 2.1 descriptor 1 that states can give correct models of language form and usage appropriate for the level concerned, except at advanced levels (C1-2). This development phase is in accordance with CEFR level B1 and B2. The descriptor level B1 is students 'can understand the main points of clear standard input on familiar matters regularly encountered in work, school, leisure, etc; Can deal with most situations likely to arise whilst travelling in an area where the language is spoken; Can produce simple connected text on topics which are familiar or of personal interest; Can describe experiences and events, dreams, hopes and ambitions and briefly give reasons and explanations for opinions and plans.' CEFR descriptor level B2 is students 'can understand the main ideas of complex text on both concrete and abstract topics, including technical discussions in his/her field of specialisation; Can interact with a degree of fluency and spontaneity that makes regular interaction with native speakers quite possible without strain for either party; Can produce clear, detailed text on a wide range of subjects and explain a viewpoint on a topical issue giving the advantages and Independent disadvantages of various options'.

Development phase 2.2 is applied in six courses those are speaking for social discourse, complex English grammar, introduction to literature, paragraph based writing, English for business and academic writing. One learning outcome of speaking for social discourse is 'students can develop a speaking activities from the argumentative text they read'.One learning outcome of complex English grammar is 'students are able to explain and finish questions about sentences with more multiple clauses', 'students are able to explain and finish questions about sentences with reduced clauses'. One learning outcome of introduction to literature is 'students are able to appreciate the literature and create simple works of literature'. The learning outcomes of paragraph based writing are 'analyze unparalleled sentences', 'create parallel sentences'. One learning outcome of English for business is 'students are able to write essay about business writing skill, business English at distance, intercultural training, evaluating and assessing'. The learning outcomes of academic writing are 'students can write a good Comparison and Contrast essay', 'students can write a good Cause- Effect essay', 'students can write a good Summary and Analysis essay'. The learning outcomes are in line with development phase 2.2 descriptor 1 that states 'can give correct models of language form and usage, for all levels up except at C2 on almost all occasions'.

Development phase 3.1 is applied in complex English grammar. The learning outcomes of complex English grammar are 'students are able to explain and finish questions about problems with subject/verb agreement',

'students are able to explain and finish questions about problems with parallel structure', 'students are able to explain and finish questions about problems with comparatives and superlatives', 'students are able to explain and finish questions about problems with the form of the verbs', 'students are able to explain and finish questions about written expression in TOEFL test '. The learning outcomes are in accordance with development phase 3.1 descriptor 1 that states 'can select and give correct models of language form and usage on almost all occasions at all levels'

Table 4.9 Language awareness in University D

Course	Development Phase													
	1.1		1.2		2.1		2.2			3.1			3.2	
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	descriptor1	Descriptor 2
Semester 1														
Literal listening			√		√									
Basic reading					√									
Basic English grammar			√											
Pronunciation practice			√											
Introduction to linguistics					√									
Semester 2														
Speaking for social discourse							√							
Social discourse comprehension					√									
Sentence based writing			√		√									
Complex English grammar			√		√		√			√				
Phonetics and phonology					√									
Introduction to literature					√		√							
Sesmester 3														
Critical listening					√									
Speaking for academic purposes			√		√									
Critical reading					√									
Paragraph based writing					√		√							
Structure for TOEFL					√									
Morphology and syntax					√									
Prose and poetry					√									

English for specific purposes															
Semester 4															
Extensive listening					√										
Public speaking					√										
Functional grammar					√										
Semantics and pragmatics					√										
Translation 1					√										
English for business							√								
English for tourism					√										
Semester 5															
Academic writing					√		√								
Sociolinguistics					√										
Translation 2					√										
Discourse analysis					√										
Semester 6															
Psycholinguistics					√										

4.2.4.3 Digital Media in University D

There are three courses which are related to digital media namely speaking for academic purposes, public speaking and ICT in language teaching. Development phase 2.1 is developed in public speaking. The learning outcomes of public speaking are 'Students are able to know & able to use linking words & Discourse markers used in their speech & utilize ICT in their presentation', 'students are able to able to perform group presentation utilize ICT in their presentation', 'students are able to able to perform group presentation utilize ICT in their presentation', 'students are able to able to perform longer speech with various purposes & utilize ICT in their presentation', 'students are able to able to perform longer speech with various purposes & utilize ICT in their presentation' . The learning outcomes are in line with development phase 2.1 descriptor 2 that reads 'can use any standard Windows/Mac software, including media players'.

Development phase 2.2 is applied in ICT in language teaching. The learning outcome is 'design English learning materials through website'. This learning outcome is in line with development phase 2.2 descriptor 1.

Development phase 3.1 is developed in ICT in language teaching and speaking for academic purposes. The learning outcome of ICT in language teaching is 'create animation by using macromedia flash'. The learning outcome of speaking for academic purposes is 'make digital story telling/biography using movie maker'. The learning outcomes are in line with EPG development phase 3.1 descriptor 2 that states 'can edit and adapt sound and video files'.

Development phase 3.2 is applied in of ICT in language teaching. The learning outcomes are 'design English learning materials by the use of macromedia flash', 'utilize some features of virtual learning'. The learning outcomes are in accordance with phase 3.2 descriptor 2 that states 'can show colleagues how to exploit the teaching potential of available digital equipment and internet-based resources'.

Table 4.10 Digital Media in University D

Course	Development phase																		
	1.1			1.2		2.1				2.2		3.1					3.2		
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4	Descriptor 5	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3
Speaking for academic purposes													√						
Public speaking								√											
ICT in language teaching										√			√					√	

4.2.5 University E

University E has 65 courses which contain general basic course, main courses, and elective courses. There are one course which contain intercultural competence namely cross cultural communication. There 29 courses which contain language awareness namely listening 1, listening2, reading 1, reading 2, reading 3, reading 4, speaking 1, speaking 2, speaking 3, speaking 4, writing 1, writing 2, writing 3, writing 4, structure 1, structure 2, structure 3, structure 4, introduction to linguistics, pedagogical linguistics, prose and poetry, drama, vocabulary, English phonology, morphology and syntax, written translation, oral translation, discourse analysis, and intensive course. There is one course which related to digital media namely curriculum and material development.

4.2.5.1 Intercultural Competence in University E

There is one course which is related to intercultural competence in university E namely cross cultural communication. Development phase 1.1 is applied in one competence namely 'students are able to know basic concept of intercultural and the importance of learning cross cultural competence. This learning belong to development phase 1.1 descriptor 1 that reads 'understands that the relationship between language and culture is an important factor in language teaching and learning'.

Development phase 2.1 is applied in one learning outcome that is 'students are able to know communication competence in cross cultural.

The learning outcome is in line with phase 2.1 descriptor 3 that describes 'can recognize the importance of avoiding intercultural problems in the classroom and promotes inclusivity and mutual respect'.

Development phase 2.2 is applied in one learning outcome is 'students are able to understand cultural perception'. The learning outcome is in accordance with phase 2.2 descriptor 1 that states 'can help learners to analyse stereotypical views and prejudices '.

Table 4.11 Intercultural Competence in University E

Course	Development phase															
	1.1	1.2			2.1			2.2			3.1			3.2		
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3
Cross cultural communication	√						√	√								

4.2.5.2 Language Awareness in University E

There are 27 courses. In the first semester, courses which are related to language awareness are intensive course, pronunciation, and structure 1. In the second semester, there are listening 1, speaking 1, reading 1, writing 1, structure 2, vocabulary 1. In the third semester there are listening 2, speaking 2, reading 2, writing 2, structure 3, introduction to linguistics. In the fourth semester, there are five course namely speaking 3, reading 3, writing 3, structure, 4, English phonology. In the fifth semester, there are speaking 4, reading 4, writing 4, morphology and syntax. In the sixth semester, there are discourse analysis, scientific writing, drama, written

translation. In the seventh semester, there are prose and poetry and elective courses namely oral translation.

Development phase 1.2 is applied in listening 1, reading 1, structure 1, and intensive course. One learning outcome of listening 1 is 'Students are able to retain chunks of language of different lengths in short-term memory'. One learning outcome of reading 1 is 'students are able to identify important pieces of information'. One learning outcome of structure 1 is 'students are able to identify parts of speech correctly'. One learning outcome of intensive course is 'students are able to use communicative English, in oral and written, to express their thoughts and exchange ideas, both in daily basis and in academic environment. The learning outcomes are in line with development phase 1.2 descriptor 1 that states 'can give correct models of language form and usage adapted to the level of the learners at lower levels'.

Development phase 2.1 is developed in 13 courses those are listening 1,speaking 1, reading 1, writing 1, structure 2, vocabulary 1, listening 2, reading 2, speaking 3, reading 3, English phonology, reading 4, and discourse analysis. One learning outcome of listening 1 is 'students are able to distinguish word boundaries, recognize a core of words, and interpret word order patterns and their significance', 'students are able to recognize reduced forms of words'. One learning outcome of speaking 1 is 'students are able to exchange information of daily topics in adjacency

pairs'. One learning outcome of reading 1 is 'students are able to predict probable outcomes of certain ideas'. The learning outcomes of writing 1 are 'students are able to explain what a(n) (auto)biography is, identify the given models and analyze their structures and language features', 'students are able to explain what a recount is, identify the given models and analyze their structures and language features', 'students are able to explain what a narrative is, identify the given models and analyze their structures and language features'. One learning outcome of structure 2 is 'students are able to write correct Passive Voice in all of the English tenses'. One learning outcome of vocabulary 1 is 'Students are able to explain the meaning of English words and idiomatic expressions of pre-intermediate and intermediate level'. The learning outcome of listening 2 is 'students are able to retain chunks of language of different lengths in short term-memory', 'students are able to discriminate among the distinctive sounds of English'. One learning outcome of reading 2 is 'students are able to identify important pieces of information'. One learning outcome of speaking 3 is 'Students are able to arrange the gathered information and personal ideas based on generic structures to achieve the communicative purposes'. One learning outcome of reading 3 is 'students are able to identify important pieces of information'. The learning outcomes of English phonology are 'students are able to comprehend what phonology is', 'students are able to comprehend what phonetics is and its kinds'. One learning outcome of reading 4 is 'students are able to predict probable outcomes of the ideas presented in

the discourse.' One learning outcome of discourse analysis is 'students are able to explain the nature of discourse'. The learning outcomes belong to phase 2.1 descriptor 1 that states 'can give correct models of language form and usage appropriate for the level concerned, except at advanced levels (C1-2)'.

Development phase 2.2 is developed in listening 1, reading 1, writing 1, speaking 2, reading 2, writing 2, structure 3, introduction to linguistics, speaking 3, reading 3, writing 3, structure 4, English phonology, speaking 4, reading 4, writing 4, morphology and syntax, speaking 4, drama, written translation, pedagogical linguistics, discourse analysis, prose and poetry, and oral translation. One learning outcome of listening 1 is 'students are able to develop and use a battery of listening strategies, such as detecting key words, guessing the meaning of words from contexts, appeal for help, and signaling comprehension or lack thereof'. One learning outcome of reading 1 is 'students are able to identify the organization of ideas: definition-explanation, cause-effect, problem-solution, opinion-argument, persuasion'. One learning outcome of writing 1 is 'students are able to write narratives in grammatically correct and acceptable English sentences from paragraphs to essays'. One learning outcome of speaking 2 is 'students are able to use English functionally and play roles properly in carrying out meetings of certain purposes'. One learning outcome of reading 2 is 'Students are able to evaluate ideas presented in the texts'. One learning outcome of writing 2 is 'students are able to write news descriptor

compositions in grammatically correct and acceptable English sentences from paragraph to essays'. One learning outcome of structure 3 is 'students are able to combine two and more sentences using complex semantics syntactic structures'. One learning outcome of introduction to linguistics is 'students are able to explain what articulatory phonetics is'. One learning outcome of speaking 3 is 'students are able to deliver a speech with the sense of audience based genre given'. The learning outcomes of reading 3 are 'students are able to identify the organization of ideas: definition-explanation, cause-effect, problem-solution, opinion-argument, persuasion', 'students are able to evaluate ideas presented in the texts'. One learning outcome of writing 3 is 'students are able to write coherent exposition compositions in grammatically correct and acceptable English sentences from paragraphs to essays'. One learning outcome of structure 4 are 'students are able to identify and correct mistakes in written English', 'students are able to combine sentences using various stylistic forms'. One learning outcome of English phonology is 'students are able to explain the variants of phonemes'. One learning outcome of speaking 4 is 'students are able to use a wide range of authentic and idiomatic classroom English expressions to manage classroom activities and interactions'. One learning outcome of reading 4 is 'students are able to summarize the overall content of the text'. One learning outcome of writing 4 is 'students are able to write review to achieve communicative purposes in a coherent and logical essay'. One learning outcome of morphology and syntax is 'students are able to

analyze phrases, clauses, and sentences in terms of their tree diagrams and complete derivations'. One learning outcome of drama is 'students are able to make a script analysis of a dramatic work and perform one-act plays'. One learning outcome of written translation is 'students are able to produce TL equivalents of SL complex sentences'. One learning outcome of pedagogical linguistics 'students are able to mention the properties of human language'. One learning outcome of discourse analysis is 'students are able to explain the implication of discourse principles for teaching English as a Foreign Language in Indonesia'. One learning outcome of prose and poetry is 'students are able to identify kinds of human experiences and human values in simple literary works'. One learning outcome of oral translation is 'students are able to produce accurate oral translation from English to Indonesian of oral discourse spoken by native speakers of English as well as Indonesian and International speakers of English on various themes'. The learning outcomes are in accordance with development phase 2.2 descriptor 1 which states 'can give correct models of language form and usage, for all levels up except at C2 on almost all occasions'.

Table 4.12 Language Awareness in University E

Course	Development phase													
	1.1		1.2		2.1		2.2			3.1			3.2	
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2
Semester 1														
Intensive course			√											
Pronunciation			√											

Structure 1			√												
Semester 2															
Listening I			√		√		√								
Speaking I					√										
Reading I	√				√		√								
Writing I					√		√								
Structure II					√										
Vocabulary I					√										
Sesmester 3															
Listening II					√										
Speaking II							√								
Reading II					√		√								
Writing II							√								
Structure III							√								
Introduction to Linguistics							√								
Semester 4															
Speaking III					√		√								
Reading III					√		√								
Writing III							√								
Structure IV							√								
English Phonology					√		√								
Semester 5															
Speaking IV							√								
Reading IV					√		√								
Writing IV							√								
Morphology & Syntax							√								
Semester 6															
Speaking IV							√								
Drama							√								
Written Translation							√								
Pedagogical linguistics							√								
Discourse analysis					√		√								
Semester 7															
Prose and Poetry							√								
Oral Translation							√								

4.2.5.3 Digital Media in University E

There is one course which is related to digital media that is cultural and material development which is given in fourth semester. Phase 1.1 is developed in one learning outcome namely 'students are able to find interesting and suitable materials in the internet'. The learning outcome is in line with development phase 1.1 descriptor 2 that states 'can search for potential teaching material on the internet'.

Table 4.13 Digital Media in University E

Course	Development phase																	
	1.1			1.2		2.1				2.2		3.1					3.2		
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4	Descriptor 5	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3
Curriculum and material development		√																	

4.2.6 Pre-service Teacher Training Program

There are two courses pre-service teacher training namely workshop SSP and field experience practice. There are six learning outcomes which consist of language awareness. One learning outcome which is related to digital media. However, there is no courses which is related to intercultural competence.

4.2.6.1 Language Awareness Pre-service Teacher Training Program

The course which is related to language awareness is workshop SSP. Development phase 1.2 is applied in three learning outcomes those are 'selecting and organizing material based on basic competence and indicator for seventh grade', 'selecting and organizing material based on basic competence and indicator for eight grade', 'selecting and organizing material based on basic competence and indicator for ninth grade'. The learning outcomes are in line with development phase 1.2 descriptor 1 that states 'can give correct models of language form and usage adapted to the level of the learners at lower levels'. The lower level learners are those who are in CEFR level A1 an A2 (North,2014). CEFR level A1 is 'can understand

and use familiar everyday expressions and very basic phrases aimed at the satisfaction of needs of a concrete type; can introduce him/herself and others and can ask and answer questions about personal details such as where he/she lives, people he/she knows and things he/she has; can interact in a simple way provided the other person talks slowly and clearly and is prepared to help'. CEFR level A2 is 'can understand sentences and frequently used expressions related to areas of most immediate relevance (e.g. very basic personal and family information, shopping, local geography, employment); can communicate in simple and routine tasks requiring a simple and direct exchange of information on familiar and routine matters; can describe in simple terms aspects of his/her background, immediate environment and matters in areas of immediate basic need'.

Development phase 2.1 is applied in three learning outcomes namely 'selecting and organizing material based on basic competence and indicator for tenth grade', 'selecting and organizing material based on basic competence and indicator for eleventh grade', 'selecting and organizing material based on basic competence and indicator for twelfth grade'. The learning outcomes are in line with development phase 2.1 descriptor 1 that states 'can give correct models of language form and usage appropriate for the level concerned, except at advanced levels (C1-2)'. This phase in line with CEFR descriptor level B1 and B2. The descriptor level B1 is students 'can understand the main points of clear standard input on familiar matters regularly encountered in work, school, leisure, etc; Can deal with most

situations likely to arise whilst travelling in an area where the language is spoken; Can produce simple connected text on topics which are familiar or of personal interest; Can describe experiences and events, dreams, hopes and ambitions and briefly give reasons and explanations for opinions and plans.' CEFR descriptor level B2 is students 'can understand the main ideas of complex text on both concrete and abstract topics, including technical discussions in his/her field of specialisation; Can interact with a degree of fluency and spontaneity that makes regular interaction with native speakers quite possible without strain for either party; Can produce clear, detailed text on a wide range of subjects and explain a viewpoint on a topical issue giving the advantages and Independent disadvantages of various options'.

Table 4.14 Language Awareness in Pre-service Teacher Training Program

Course	Development phase													
	1.1		1.2		2.1		2.2			3.1			3.2	
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2
Workshop Subject Specific Pedagogy (SSP)			√		√									

4.2.6.2 Digital Media in Pre-service Teacher Training Program

There is one course which is related to digital media namely workshop SSP. Development phase 2.1 is developed in one learning outcome namely 'students are able to choose the media which is suitable for learners'. This learning outcome is in line with development phase 2.1

descriptor 3 which states 'can recommend appropriate online materials to students and colleagues'.

Table 4.15 Digital Media in Pre-service Teacher Training Program

Course	Development phase																	
	1.1			1.2		2.1				2.2		3.1					3.2		
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4	Descriptor 5	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3
Workshop Subject Specific Pedagogy (SSP)								√											

4.3. The extent of the EPG-Based Key Teaching Competences in the Curricula of English Education Study Programs and Pre-Service Teacher Training Programs.

After analysing the EPG-enabling competences in the existing curricula, the extent of EPG-enabling competences in existing curricula will be described. The extent of EPG- enabling competences in existing curricula answers the second research question of this study. In other to describe the extent of EPG-enabling competences in existing curricula, the elaboration of range development in each university will be shown below.

Table 4.16 Range of Development Phases in University A

Sub Category	Range of Development Phases
Intercultural Competence	1.1, 1.2, 3.1
Language Awareness	1.1, 1.2, 2.1, 2.2, 3.1
Digital Media	1.1, 1.2, 2.1, 2.2, 3.1, 3.2

There are three sub competences of enabling competences in university A those are intercultural competence, language awareness, and digital media. In intercultural competence, there are 16 descriptors but university A has 5 descriptors in development phase 1.1, 1.2, 3.1. For language awareness, university A has 5 descriptors out of 14 descriptors in development phase 1.1, 1.2, 2.1, 2.2, 3.1. For digital media, university A has 10 descriptors out of 19 descriptors in development phase 1.1, 1.2, 2.1, 2.2, 3.1, 3.2.

Table 4.17 Range of Development Phases in University B

Sub Category	Range of Development Phases
Intercultural Competence	1.1, 1.2, 3.1
Language Awareness	1.2, 2.1, 2.2, 3.1
Digital Media	-

There are two sub competences of enabling competences in university B those are intercultural competence and language awareness. In intercultural competence, there are 16 descriptors but university B has 3 descriptors in development phase 1.1, 1.2, 3.1. For language awareness, university A has 6 descriptors out of 14 descriptors in development phase 1.2, 2.1, 2.2, 3.1.

Table 4.18 Range of Development Phases in University C

Sub Category	Range of Development Phases
Intercultural Competence	1.1, 1.2, 3.1
Language Awareness	1.2, 2.1, 2.2
Digital Media	-

There are two sub competences of enabling competences in university C those are intercultural competence and language awareness. In intercultural competence, there are 16 descriptors but university B has 4 descriptors in development phase 1.1, 1.2, 3.1. For language awareness, university A has 3 descriptors out of 14 descriptors in development phase 1.2, 2.1, 2.2.

Table 4.19 Range of Development Phases in University D

Sub Category	Range of Development Phases
Intercultural Competence	1.1, 1.2, 3.1
Language Awareness	1.2, 2.1, 2.2, 3.1
Digital Media	2.1, 2.2, 3.1,3.2

There are three sub competences of enabling competences in university D those are intercultural competence, language awareness, and digital media. In intercultural competence, there are 16 descriptors but university D has 4 descriptors in development phase 1.1, 1.2, 3.1. For language awareness, university A has 4 descriptors out of 14 descriptors in

development phase 1.2, 2.1, 2.2, 3.1. For digital media, university D has 4 descriptors out of 19 descriptors in development phase 2.1, 2.2, 3.1, 3.2.

Table 4.20 Range of Development Phases in University E

Sub Category	Range of Development Phases
Intercultural Competence	1.1, 2.1, 2.2
Language Awareness	1.1, 1.2, 2.1, 2.2
Digital Media	1.1

There are three sub competences of enabling competences in university E those are intercultural competence, language awareness, and digital media. In intercultural competence, there are 16 descriptors but university D has 3 descriptors in development phase 1.1, 2.1, 2.2. For language awareness, university A has 4 descriptors out of 14 descriptors in development phase 1.1, 1.2, 2.1, 2.2. For digital media, university D has 1 descriptors out of 19 descriptors in development phase 1.1.

Table 4.21 Range of Development Phases in Pre-Service Teacher Training Program

Sub Category	Range of Development Phases
Intercultural Competence	-
Language Awareness	1.2, 2.1
Digital Media	2.1

There are two sub competences of enabling competences in university C those are language awareness and digital media. For language

awareness, university A has 2 descriptors out of 14 descriptors in development phase 1.2, 2.1. For digital media, university D has 1 descriptors out of 19 descriptors in development phase 2.1.

The table below is the summary of range development phase of each sub competence in the curricula of English education study programs and pre-service teacher training program.

Table 4.22 Range of Development Phases in Sub Competence of Intercultural Competence

University	Range of Development Phases
University A	1.1, 1.2, 3.1
University B	1.1, 1.2, 3.1
University C	1.1, 1.2, 3.1
University D	1.1, 1.2, 3.1
University E	1.1, 2.1, 2.2
Pre-Service Teacher Training Program	1.2, 2.1

University A, B, C, and D contain development phase 1.1, 1.2, 3.1. Meanwhile, university E contains development phase 1.1, 2.1, 2.2. Development phase 1.1 and 1.2 refer to novice teacher, development phase 2.1 and 2.2 refer to experienced teacher, and development phase 3.1 and 3.2 refer to expert teacher. From the findings, it can be concluded that university A, B, C, D, E are developed for novice teacher, experienced teacher, and expert teacher. Although the learning outcomes almost cover

the six development, only seven descriptors are included in the learning outcomes. Pre-service teacher training contains less development phase than other because it only contains development phase1.2, 2.1. It means the learning outcomes of pre-service teacher training program are developed for novice teacher and experienced teacher. The analysis can be seen in the table below.

Table 4.23 Range of Development Phases in Sub Competence of

Language Awareness

University	Range of Development Phases
University A	1.1, 1.2, 2.1, 2.2, 3.1
University B	1.2, 2.1, 2.2, 3.1
University C	1.2, 2.1, 2.2
University D	1.2, 2.1, 2.2, 3.1
University E	1.1, 1.2, 2.1, 2.2
Pre-Service Teacher Training Program	1.2, 2.1

University A contains almost all development phases those are 1.1, 1.2, 2.1, 2.2, 3.1 except development phase 3.2. It means learning outcomes in university A have been written for novice teacher, experienced teacher and expert teacher. Meanwhile, both university B and D contain development phase 1.2, 2.1, 2.2, 3.1 which are lack of development phase 1.1 and 3.2. It means learning outcomes in both universities are mostly written for experienced teacher and with little proportion for novice and expert teacher. University C has three development phases those are 1.2,

2.1, 2.2. It means learning outcomes in university C are written for mostly experienced teacher. University E contains four development phases that are almost similar with university C those are development phase 1.1, 1.2, 2.1, 2.2. It means learning outcomes in university E are written for novice teacher and experienced teacher. Pre-service teacher training program only contains two development phases those are 1.2 and 2.1. It can be concluded that learning outcomes in pre-service teacher training programs are written for novice teacher and experienced teacher in little proportion.

Table 4.24 Range of Development Phases in Sub Competence of

Digital Media

University	Range of Development Phases
University A	1.1, 1.2, 2.1, 2.2, 3.1, 3.2
University B	-
University C	-
University D	2.1, 2.2, 3.1, 3.2
University E	1.1
Pre-Service Teacher Training Program	2.1

University A contains all development phases in digital media which indicates that the learning outcomes are written for novice teacher, experienced teacher and expert teacher. University E and pre-service teacher training program only contains one development phases. University E has development phase 1.1 but pre-service teacher training program has development phase 2.1. It can be inferred that learning outcomes of

university E are written novice teacher but learning outcomes of pre-service teacher training program are written for experienced teacher. University D has four development phases those are 2.1, 2.2, 3.1, 3.2 which is lack of development 1.1 and 1.2. It means that learning outcomes of university D are written for experienced teacher and expert teacher. Meanwhile, university B and C do not contain EPG digital media development phase.