

CHAPTER IV

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

This chapter aims at presenting the results of data analysis of European Profiling Grid (EPG)-based Key Teaching Competences in the curricula of English education study programs and pre-service teacher training programs. The data were in the forms of the EPG documents and existing curricula collected from five different English education study programs and one pre-service teacher training program.

4.1 The Descriptors of the EPG-Based Key Teaching Competences as the Basis to Analyze Its Coverage in the Curricula of English Education Study Programs and Pre-Service Teacher Training Programs

The data in this part were in the form of the European Profiling Grid (EPG)-based Key Teaching Competences that have four sub categories, methodology: knowledge and skills, assessment, lesson and course planning, and interaction management and monitoring. These four sub categories are divided into six development phases starting from 1.1, 1.2, 2.1, 2.2, 3.1, to 3.2, which can be grouped into three main phases of development (development phase 1.1 and 1.2 are for novice teachers, development phase 2.1 and 2.2 are for experienced teachers, and development phase 3.1 and 3.2 are for expert teachers). Each

development phase has its own can-do descriptors. The total number of descriptors in this Key Teaching Competences category is 67. The elaboration of the descriptors of the EPG-based Key Teaching Competences are as follows.

4.1.1 Sub Category of Methodology: Knowledge and Skills

The first sub category of the EPG-based Key Teaching Competences is methodology: knowledge and skills. This sub category has 17 descriptors in total with the following elaboration. The first development phase (1.1) of this sub category has 2 descriptors. The first descriptor reads 'is learning about different language theories and methods' and the second one reads 'when observing more experienced teachers, can understand why they have chosen the techniques and materials they are using'.

The second development phase (1.2) has 3 descriptors. The first descriptor reads 'has basic understanding of different language learning theories and methods'. The second descriptor is 'can select new techniques and materials, with advice from colleagues' while the third one reads 'can identify techniques and materials for different teaching and learning contexts'.

The third development phase (2.1) has 4 can-do descriptors. The first descriptor reads 'is familiar with language learning theories and methods'. The second one reads 'is familiar with techniques and materials for two or more levels'. The third and the fourth descriptors respectively

read 'can evaluate from a practical perspective the suitability of techniques and materials for different teaching contexts' and 'can take into account the needs of particular groups when choosing which methods and techniques to use'.

The fourth development phase (2.2) consists of 3 descriptors. The first descriptor reads 'is well acquainted with language learning theories and methods, learning styles and learning strategies' while the second descriptor is 'can identify the theoretical principles behind teaching techniques and materials'. The final descriptor in this development phase reads 'can use appropriately a variety of teaching techniques and activities'.

The next development phase (3.1) consists of 2 descriptors. The first descriptor is 'can provide theoretical justification for the teaching approach being used and for a very wide range of techniques and materials'. The second one of this development phase reads 'can use a very wide range of teaching techniques, activities and materials'. The final development phase of the methodology sub category (3.2) consists of 3 descriptors. The descriptors are 'has a detailed knowledge of theories of language teaching and shares it with colleagues', 'can follow up observation of colleagues with practical, methodologically sound feedback to develop their range of teaching techniques', and 'can select and create appropriate tasks and materials for any level for use by colleagues'.

In general, sub category of methodology: knowledge and skills has 5 descriptors for novice teachers (2 descriptors for development phase 1.1

and 3 descriptors for development phase 1.2), 7 descriptors for experienced teachers (4 descriptors for development phase 2.1 and 3 descriptors for development phase 2.2), and 5 descriptors for expert teachers (2 descriptors for development phase 3.1 and 3 descriptors for development phase 3.2). Therefore, the total number of descriptors in the sub category of methodology: knowledge and skills is 17 descriptors.

4.1.2 Sub Category of Assessment

The second sub category of the EPG-based Key Teaching Competences is assessment. The first development phase (1.1) of this sub category has 1 can-do descriptor only, which reads ‘can conduct and mark end of unit tests from the course book’. The second development phase (1.2) has 3 descriptors. The first descriptor is ‘can conduct and mark progress tests (e.g. end of term, end of year) when given the material to do so’. The second descriptor reads ‘can conduct oral tests when given the material to do so’ while the third one reads ‘can prepare and conduct appropriate revision activities’.

The third development phase (2.1) has 3 descriptors. The first one is ‘can conduct regular progress tests including an oral component’. The second descriptor reads ‘can identify areas for students to work on from the results of tests and assessment tasks’, and the third descriptor is ‘can give clear feedback on the strengths and weaknesses identified and set priorities for individual work’.

The fourth development phase (2.2) consists of 3 descriptors. The first descriptor reads 'can select and conduct regular assessment tasks to verify learners' progress in language and skills areas' while the second descriptor is 'can use an agreed marking system to identify different types of errors in written work in order to increase learners' language awareness'. The final descriptor in this development phase reads 'can prepare for and coordinate placement testing'.

The fifth development phase (3.1) has 3 descriptors. The first descriptor reads 'can design materials and tasks for progress assessment (oral and written)'. The second descriptor of this development phase reads 'can use video recordings of learners' interactions to help them recognize their strengths and weaknesses'. The last descriptor of this development phase is 'can apply CEFR criteria reliably to assess learners' proficiency in speaking and writing'.

The sixth and final development phase of the assessment sub category (3.2) consists of 4 descriptors. The first descriptor is 'can develop assessment tasks for all language skills and language knowledge at any level'. The next descriptor reads 'can apply CEFR criteria reliably to assess learners' proficiency in speaking and writing at all levels and help less experienced colleagues to do so'. The third and fourth descriptors respectively read 'can create valid formal tests to determine whether learners have reached a given CEFR level' and 'can run CEFR standardization'.

In general, sub category of assessment has 4 descriptors for novice teachers (1 descriptor for development phase 1.1 and 3 descriptors for development phase 1.2), 6 descriptors for experienced teachers (3 descriptors for development phase 2.1 and 3 descriptors for development phase 2.2), and 7 descriptors for expert teachers (3 descriptors for development phase 3.1 and 4 descriptors for development phase 3.2). Therefore, the total number of descriptors in the sub category of assessment is 17 descriptors.

4.1.3 Sub Category of Lesson and Course Planning

The third sub category of the EPG-based Key Teaching Competences is lesson and course planning. The first development phase (1.1) of this sub category has 1 descriptor only, which reads ‘can link a series of activities in a lesson plan, when given materials to do so’. The second development phase (1.2) has 3 can-do descriptors. The first descriptor is ‘can find activities to supplement those in the textbook’. The second descriptor reads ‘can ensure coherence between lessons by taking account of the outcomes of previous lessons in planning the next’ while the third one reads ‘can adjust lesson plans as instructed to take account of learning success and difficulties’.

The third development phase (2.1) has 3 descriptors. The first descriptor is ‘can use a syllabus and specified materials to prepare lesson plans that are balanced and meet the needs of the group’. The second descriptor reads ‘can plan phases and timing of lessons with different

objectives', and the third one reads 'can compare learners' needs and refer to these in planning main and supplementary objectives for lessons'.

The fourth development phase (2.2) consists of 3 descriptors. The first descriptor reads 'can plan a course or part of a course taking account of the syllabus, the needs of different students and the available materials' while the second descriptor is 'can design tasks to exploit the linguistic and communicative potential of materials'. The final descriptor in this development phase reads 'can design tasks to meet individual needs as well as course objectives.'

The fifth development phase (3.1) consists of 3 descriptors. The first descriptor is 'can conduct a thorough needs analysis and use it to develop a detailed and balanced course plan that includes recycling and revision'. The second descriptor of this development phase reads 'can design different tasks based on the same source material for use with learners at different levels'. The last descriptor of this development phase is 'can use analysis of learner difficulties in order to decide on action points for upcoming lessons'.

The sixth and final development phase of the lesson and course planning sub category (3.2) consists of 3 descriptors. The first descriptor is 'can design specialized courses for different contexts that integrate communicative and linguistic content appropriate to the specialism'. The next descriptor reads 'can guide colleagues in assessing and taking account of differing individual needs in planning courses and preparing

lessons'. The third descriptor reads 'can take responsibility for reviewing the curriculum and syllabuses for different courses'.

In general, sub category of lesson and course planning has 4 descriptors for novice teachers (1 descriptor for development phase 1.1 and 3 descriptors for development phase 1.2), 6 descriptors for experienced teachers (3 descriptors for development phase 2.1 and 3 descriptors for development phase 2.2), and 6 descriptors for expert teachers (3 descriptors for development phase 3.1 and 3 descriptors for development phase 3.2). Therefore, the total number of descriptors in the sub category of lesson and course planning is 16 descriptors.

4.1.4 Sub Category of Interaction Management and Monitoring

The final sub category of the EPG-based Key Teaching Competences is interaction management and monitoring. The first development phase (1.1) of this final sub category has 1 descriptor only, which reads 'can give clear instructions and organize an activity, with guidance'. The second development phase (1.2) has 3 descriptors. The first descriptor reads 'can manage teacher-class interaction'. The second descriptor is 'can alternate between teaching the whole class and pair or group practice giving clear instructions' while the third descriptor reads 'can involve learners in pair and group work based on activities in a course book'.

The third development phase (2.1) has 3 descriptors. The first descriptor is 'can set up and manage pair and group work efficiently and

can bring the class back together'. The second one reads 'can monitor individual and group activities'. The last descriptor in this development phase reads 'can provide clear feedback'.

The fourth development phase (2.2) consists of 4 descriptors. The first one reads 'can set up a varied and balanced sequence of class, group and pair work in order to meet the lesson objectives' while the second item is 'can organize task-based learning'. The third and fourth descriptors in this development phase respectively read 'can monitor learner performance effectively' and 'can provide/elicit clear feedback'.

The fourth development phase (3.1) consists of 4 descriptors as well. The first descriptor is 'can set up task-based learning in which groups carry out different activities at the same time'. The second descriptor of this development phase reads 'can monitor individual and group performances accurately and thoroughly'. The third descriptor is 'can provide/elicit individual feedback in various ways' while the fourth descriptor of this development phase reads 'can use the monitoring and feedback in designing further activities.'

The final development phase of the interaction management and monitoring sub category (3.2) consists of 2 descriptors. The first and second descriptors are 'can set up, monitor and provide support to groups and individuals at different levels in the same classroom working on different tasks and 'can use a wide range of techniques to provide/elicit feedback'.

In general, sub category of interaction management and monitoring has 4 descriptors for novice teachers (1 descriptor for development phase 1.1 and 3 descriptors for development phase 1.2), 7 descriptors for experienced teachers (3 descriptors for development phase 2.1 and 4 descriptors for development phase 2.2), and 6 descriptors for expert teachers (4 descriptors for development phase 3.1 and 2 descriptors for development phase 3.2). Therefore, the total number of descriptors in the sub category of interaction management and monitoring is 17 descriptors.

4.2 The Coverage of the EPG-Based Key Teaching Competences in the Curricula of English Education Study Programs and Pre-Service Teacher Training Programs

The second research question is related to the coverage of the EPG-based Key Teaching Competences in the curricula of English education study programs and pre-service teacher training programs. This research question was answered by examining the existing curricula of English education study programs from five universities and one pre-service teacher training program. The names of the universities were undisclosed, so the researcher used University A, University B, University C, University D, University E, and Pre-Service Teacher Training Program to distinguish them. The following elaboration will be related to the coverage of the EPG-based Key Teaching Competences in five curricula of English education study programs and one pre-service teacher training program.

4.2.1 University A

There are 58 courses available in University A, which consist of general courses, main courses, and elective courses. Methodology: knowledge and skills sub category is represented in four courses, English for Young Learners, which is an elective course in the seventh semester, TEFL Methodology that is given in the third semester, Learning Material Development and Evaluation in the fifth semester, and Micro Teaching given in the sixth semester. Assessment sub category is included in two courses, English Language Assessment in the fifth semester and English for Young Learners, an elective course in the seventh semester. Lesson and course planning sub category can be found in four courses, English for Young Learners, an elective course in the seventh semester, ELT Curriculum and Syllabus in the fifth semester, Learning Material Development and Evaluation in the fifth semester, and Microteaching in the sixth semester. Finally, interaction management and monitoring sub category is covered in English for Young Learners course, an elective course in the seventh semester and *Profesi Kependidikan* in the fourth semester.

4.2.1.1 Sub Category of Methodology: Knowledge and Skills in University A

In the Key Teaching Competences' first sub category (methodology: knowledge and skills), development phase 1.1 for novice teachers with two can-do descriptors is covered in Microteaching course.

One of the course learning outcomes, which reads 'students are able to identify teaching skills by observing teaching and learning process in the classroom' is in line with the second descriptor of development phase 1.1 which reads 'when observing more experienced teachers, can understand why they have chosen the techniques and materials they are using'.

Development phase 1.2 for novice teachers in the methodology: knowledge and skills sub category is represented by TEFL Methodology course, Learning Material Development and Evaluation course, and English for Young Learners course. One of the TEFL Methodology's learning outcomes that reads 'students are able to identify principles of language learning and teaching' is in line with the first descriptor of the development phase 1.2 which reads 'has basic understanding of different language learning theories and methods'. Learning Material Development and Evaluation course is in line with the third descriptor of development phase 1.2, which reads 'can identify techniques and materials for different teaching and learning contexts' because one of the course learning outcomes is 'students are able to overview of learning materials'. One of the learning outcomes in the English for Young Learners, which reads 'students are able to differentiate the concept of language acquisition and language learning' is also in line with the first descriptor of the development phase 1.2 that reads 'has basic understanding of different language learning theories and methods'.

Development phase 2.1 for experienced teachers in the methodology: knowledge and skills sub category is used in Learning

Material Development and Evaluation course whose one of the learning outcomes, 'can overview of learning materials', is in line with the first descriptor of development phase 2.1, which reads 'can evaluate from a practical perspective the suitability of techniques and materials for different teaching contexts'.

Development 3.1 for expert teachers in the methodology: knowledge and skills sub category is not developed in any course of University A. However, development phase 3.2 for expert teachers can be found in TEFL Methodology course whose one of the learning outcomes, 'students are able to elaborate approaches and methods in ELT', is in line with the first descriptor of development phase 3.2, which reads 'has a detailed knowledge of theories of language teaching and learning and shares it with colleagues'.

Table 4.1 Sub Category of Methodology: Knowledge and Skills in University A

[illegible]

4.2.1.2 Sub Category of Assessment in University A

University A has two courses, English Language Assessment given in the fifth semester and English for Young Learners offered in the seventh semester as an elective course, which include assessment sub category of the EPG-based Key Teaching Competences. Development phase 3.2 descriptor 1 for expert teachers, which reads ‘can develop assessment tasks for all language skills and language knowledge at any level’, is represented in the English Language Assessment course because the descriptor is in line with some of the course learning outcomes, which are ‘students are able to create assessment for listening and speaking skills’, and ‘students are able to create assessment for reading and writing skills’. Development phase 3.2 descriptor 1 can also be found in English for Young Learners course whose one of its learning outcomes, ‘students are able to create assessment tools for TEFC (Teaching English for Children) in accordance with the purpose of learning’ is also in line with development phase 3.2 descriptor 1, which is ‘can develop assessment tasks for all language skills and language knowledge at any level’.

Table 4.2 Sub Category of Assessment in University A

Course	Development Phase																
	1.1	1.2			2.1			2.2			3.1			3.2			
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4
English Language Assessment	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X
English for Young Learners	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X

4.2.1.3 Sub Category of Lesson and Course Planning in University A

In the third sub category, lesson and course planning, the English education study program in University A has four courses, English for Young Learners offered as an elective course in the seventh semester, ELT Curriculum and Syllabus given in the fifth semester, Learning Material Development and Evaluation given in the fifth semester, and Microteaching given in the sixth semester, which include items in the lesson and course planning sub category. Development phase 2.1 descriptor 1 for experienced teachers, which reads ‘can use a syllabus and specified materials to prepare lesson plans that are balanced and meet the needs of the group’, is included in one of learning outcomes in Microteaching course, which is ‘students are able to design teaching and learning components (syllabus, lesson plans, learning materials, and assessment)’.

Development phase 2.2 descriptor 1 for experienced teachers, which is ‘can plan a course or part of a course taking account of the syllabus, the needs of different students and the available materials’, is in line with one of the learning outcomes in English for Young Learners that is ‘students are able to create lesson plans for teaching EYL using a variety of media in accordance with the purpose of learning’. Development phase 3.1 descriptor 1 for expert teachers, which reads ‘can conduct a thorough needs analysis and use it to develop a detailed and balanced course plan that includes recycling and revision’, is in line with one of the

learning outcomes in ELT Curriculum and Syllabus course, which is 'students are able to elaborate need analysis.' Finally, development phase 3.1 descriptor 2 for expert teachers, which reads 'can design different tasks based on the same source material for use with learners at different levels', is in line with one of the learning outcomes in Learning Material Development and Evaluation, which reads 'students are able to evaluate the use of textbooks into learning process.'

Table 4.3 Sub Category of Lesson and Course Planning in University

A

Course	Development Phase															
	1.1	1.2			2.1			2.2			3.1			3.2		
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3
English for Young Learners	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
ELT Curriculum and Syllabus	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X	X	X
Learning Material Development and Evaluation	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X	X
Microteaching	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X

4.2.1.4 Sub Category of Interaction Management and Monitoring in

University A

Interaction management and monitoring sub category can be found in two courses of University A, namely English for Young Learners, an elective course in the seventh semester, and *Profesi Kependidikan*, a course given in the fourth semester. Development phase 3.2 descriptor 1

for expert teachers in the interaction management and monitoring sub category, which is ‘can set up, monitor and provide support to groups and individuals at different levels in the same classroom working on different tasks’, can be found in one of the learning outcomes of English for Young Learners course, which is ‘students are able to manage and evaluate young learners’ classroom.’ Development phase 1.2 descriptor 1 for novice teachers, which is ‘can manage teacher-class interaction’ is in line with one of the learning outcomes in *Profesi Kependidikan* course that is ‘mahasiswa mampu mengelola komunikasi dan keterampilan membina hubungan dalam peran profesi pendidik’.

Table 4.4 Sub Category of Interaction Management and Monitoring in University A

Course	Development Phase																
	1.1	1.2			2.1			2.2				3.1				3.2	
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2
English for Young Learners	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	√	X
Profesi Kependidikan	X	√	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X

4.2.2 University B

University B offers 58 courses that are divided into general courses, main courses, and elective courses. Methodology: knowledge and skills sub category is represented in two courses, Method of TEFL, which is given in the fourth semester and Lesson Planning, which is given in the sixth semester. Assessment sub category is included in one course, Language Testing 1 that is given in the sixth semester. Lesson and course

planning sub category can be found in one course, Curriculum Analysis, which is given in the fifth semester. Nevertheless, interaction management and monitoring sub category is not represented in any course offered in University B.

4.2.2.1 Sub Category of Methodology: Knowledge and Skills in University B

Development phase 2.1 for experienced teachers in the Key Teaching Competences' first sub category (methodology: knowledge and skills) with four can-do descriptors is applied in Method of TEFL course. The course learning outcomes, which read 'at the end of the semester, the students will be able to explain various definitions of language', 'the students will be able to explain various definitions of teaching and learning', and 'the students will be able to explain various approaches, methods, and techniques in language teaching' are in line with the first descriptor of development phase 2.1 that reads 'is familiar with language learning theories and methods'.

The other course in University B, which includes methodology: knowledge and skills sub category is Lesson Planning. This course represents the third descriptor of development phase 1.2 for novice teachers in the methodology: knowledge and skills sub category. The development phase 1.2 descriptor 3, which reads 'can identify techniques and materials for different teaching and learning contexts' is in line with one of the learning outcomes in Lesson Planning course, which reads 'at

the end of the semester, the students will be able to recognize techniques and methods of teaching.'

Table 4.5 Sub Category of Methodology: Knowledge and Skills in University B

Course	Development Phase																
	1.1		1.2			2.1				2.2			3.1		3.2		
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3
Method of TEFL	X	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Lesson Planning	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X

4.2.2.2 Sub Category of Assessment in University B

University B has one course, Language Testing 1 that includes assessment sub category of the EPG-based Key Teaching Competences. Development phase 2.1 descriptor 1 for experienced teachers, which reads 'can conduct regular progress tests including an oral component', is represented in the Language Testing 1 course because the descriptor is in line with the course learning outcomes, which are 'at the end of the semester, the students will be able to understand how to conduct test of grammar and vocabulary', 'the students will be able to understand how to conduct test of oral production', 'the students will be able to understand how to conduct test of reading comprehension', and 'the students will be able to understand how to conduct writing test'.

Table 4.6 Sub Category of Assessment in University B

Course	Development Phase																
	1.1	1.2			2.1			2.2			3.1			3.2			
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4
Language Testing 1	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X

4.2.2.3 Sub Category of Lesson and Course Planning in University B

In the third sub category, lesson and course planning, the English education study program in University B has one course, Curriculum Analysis that includes the lesson and course planning sub category. Development phase 3.2 descriptor 3 for expert teachers, which reads ‘can take responsibility for reviewing the curriculum and syllabuses for different courses’ is included in one of learning outcomes in Curriculum Analysis course, which is ‘at the end of the semester, the students will be able to elaborate how to analyze curriculum as it is implemented and evaluated’.

Table 4.7 Sub Category of Lesson and Course Planning in University B

Course	Development Phase															
	1.1	1.2			2.1			2.2			3.1			3.2		
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3
Curriculum Analysis	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	✓

4.2.3 University C

University C offers 58 courses that are divided into general courses, main courses, and elective courses. Methodology: knowledge

and skills sub category is represented in five courses, Introduction to Language in the second semester, Language Learning and Teaching Theories in the third semester, ELT Methodology in the fourth semester, Peer Teaching and Microteaching in the sixth semester, and Internship (*PKM*) in the seventh semester. Assessment sub category is included in one course, English Language Assessment in the fifth semester. Lesson and course planning sub category can be found in two courses, Curriculum and Materials Development in the fifth semester and Internship (*PKM*) in the seventh semester. Nevertheless, interaction management and monitoring sub category is only represented in one course in University C, which is Internship (*PKM*) in the seventh semester.

4.2.3.1 Sub Category of Methodology: Knowledge and Skills in University C

Development phase 2.1 category 1 for experienced teachers in the Key Teaching Competences' first sub category (methodology: knowledge and skills) is included in Introduction to Language and ELT Methodology courses. The Introduction to Language course learning outcomes, which read 'after completing the course, students are expected to have the ability to explain the nature of language, linguistics, and the functions of language' and 'students are expected to have the ability to explain the concept of inherent in second language acquisition and its application in learning and teaching a language' are in line with the first descriptor of development phase 2.1, which reads 'is familiar with

language learning theories and methods'. One of the learning outcomes in ELT Methodology course, which reads 'after completing the course, students are expected to outline differences in the concept of approaches, methods and techniques in ELT' is also in line with the first descriptor of development phase 2.1 which reads 'is familiar with language learning theories and methods'.

Development phase 2.2 descriptor 1 for experienced teachers, which reads 'is well acquainted with language learning theories and methods, learning styles and learning strategies' is in line with learning outcomes of Language Learning and Teaching Theories course, which are 'after completing the course, students are expected to have the ability to articulate an understanding of theories of language', 'students are expected to articulate an understanding of first and second language learning theories', 'students are expected to articulate their understanding of factors affecting language learning', and 'students are expected to articulate their understanding of sociocultural aspects of language learning'.

One learning outcome in Peer Teaching and Microteaching course, which reads 'after completing the course, students are expected to have the ability to reflect on their practice' covers development phase 2.1 descriptor 3 for experienced teachers that is 'can evaluate from a practical perspective the suitability of techniques and materials for different teaching contexts'. Another learning outcome in Peer Teaching and Microteaching course that is 'after completing the course, students are

4.2.3.2 Sub Category of Assessment in University C

University C has one course, English Language Assessment that includes assessment sub category of the EPG-based Key Teaching Competences. Development phase 2.2 descriptor 1 for experienced teachers, which reads ‘is well acquainted with language learning theories and methods, learning styles and learning strategies’ is represented in the English Language Assessment course because the descriptor is in line with one of the course learning outcomes, which ‘after completing the course, students are expected to have the ability to critically evaluate classroom-based assessment tools used in EFL Education Programs’.

Table 4.9 Sub Category of Assessment in University C

Course	Development Phase																
	1.1	1.2			2.1			2.2			3.1			3.2			
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4
English Language Assessment	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X

4.2.3.3 Sub Category of Lesson and Course Planning in University C

University C has two courses, Curriculum and Material Development, and Internship (*PKM*) that cover lesson and course planning sub category. Development phase 1.2 descriptor 3 that reads ‘can adjust lesson plans as instructed to take account of learning success and difficulties’ is covered in one of the learning outcomes in the Curriculum and Material Development that reads ‘after completing the course, students are expected to have the ability to revise a syllabus and develop

a unit of lesson plan based on the syllabus (for an EFL learning program in Indonesian Senior High School, Junior High School or Primary School level)'. Development phase 3.2 descriptor 1 that is 'can design specialized courses for different contexts that integrate communicative and linguistic content appropriate to the specialism' is in line with one learning outcome in the Internship (*PKM*) course that reads 'after completing the course, students are expected to have the ability to write lesson plans for real teaching contexts with clear rationales'.

**Table 4.10 Sub Category of Lesson and Course Planning in
University C**

Course	Development Phase															
	1.1	1.2			2.1			2.2			3.1			3.2		
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3
Curriculum Material Development	X	X	X	√	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Internship (PKM)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	√	X	X

4.2.3.4 Sub Category of Interaction Management and Monitoring in University C

The only course in University C that covers interaction management and monitoring sub category is Internship (*PKM*). Development phase 1.2 descriptor 2 for novice teachers that reads 'can alternate between teaching the whole class and pair or group practice giving clear instructions' is covered in a learning outcome in Internship (*PKM*), which is 'after completing the course, students are expected to

have the ability to develop practical techniques in classroom management, e.g. giving instructions, managing classroom interactions and disciplines, asking effective questions, and providing constructive feedback, etc.'

Table 4.11 Sub Category of Interaction Management and Monitoring in University C

Course	Development Phase																
	1.1	1.2			2.1			2.2				3.1				3.2	
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2
Internship (PKM)	X	X	√	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X

4.2.4 University D

University D has 66 courses that are divided into general courses, main courses, and elective courses. Methodology: knowledge and skills sub category is covered in three courses, Introduction to Linguistics which given in the first semester, Learning Planning on ELT in the fifth semester, and TEFL given in the sixth semester. Assessment sub category is included in one course, Evaluation on ELT, which is given in the sixth semester. Lesson and course planning sub category can be found in one course, Learning Planning on ELT in the fifth semester. Nevertheless, interaction management and monitoring sub category is not represented in any course in University D.

4.2.4.1 Sub Category of Methodology: Knowledge and Skills in University D

Development phase 2.1 descriptor 1 for experienced teachers that reads 'familiar with language learning theories and methods' is in line with two learning outcomes in Introduction in Linguistics that are 'at the end of the course, the students will be able to explain the definition of language' and 'the students will be able to explain the relevance of linguistics and language teaching'. One learning outcome in Learning Planning on ELT course that reads 'at the end of the course, the students will be able to explain how to describe a language' covers development phase 1.2 descriptor 1 for novice teachers that reads 'has basic understanding of different language learning theories and methods'. Two learning outcomes in TEFL course that read 'at the end of the course, the students will be able to tell the situation of language acquisition by using direct method and effectiveness of direct method' and 'the students will be able to understand and describe silent way, and describe how learners improve their target language or foreign language by reading and practicing conversation' cover development phase 1.2 descriptor 1 for novice teachers, which is 'has basic understanding of different language learning theories and methods'.

4.2.4.3 Sub Category of Lesson and Course Planning in University D

Development phrase 2.2 descriptor 1 for experienced teachers that is 'can plan a course or part of a course taking account of the syllabus taking account of the syllabus, the needs of different students and the available materials' is in line with one of the learning outcomes in the Learning Planning on ELT, which is 'at the end of the course, the students will be able to plan a lesson'.

Table 4.14 Sub Category of Lesson and Course Planning in University D

Course	Development Phase															
	1.1	1.2			2.1			2.2			3.1			3.2		
	Item 1	Item 1	Item 2	Item 3	Item 1	Item 2	Item 3	Item 1	Item 2	Item 3	Item 1	Item 2	Item 3	Item 1	Item 2	Item 3
Learning Planning on ELT	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X

4.2.5 University E

University E has 65 courses that consist of general courses, main courses, and elective courses. Methodology: knowledge and skills sub category can be found in five courses, Pedagogy in the third semester, TEFL 1 in the fourth semester, TEFL 2 in the fifth semester, TEYL in the fifth semester, and Curriculum and Material Development in the fourth semester. Assessment sub category is included in one course, Language Testing in the fifth semester. Lesson and course planning sub category can be found in two courses, Curriculum and Material Development in the fourth semester and TEFL 2 in the fifth semester. Finally, interaction

management and monitoring sub category is represented in two courses in University E, namely Teaching Practice in the seventh semester and Micro Teaching in the sixth semester.

4.2.5.1 Sub Category of Methodology: Knowledge and Skills in University E

Development phase 2.1 descriptor 1 for experienced teachers that reads ‘familiar with language learning theories and methods’ is in line with two learning outcomes in Pedagogy course that are ‘students are able to understand and explain major theories of learning, such as mental discipline, behavioristic, cognitive, humanistic, and constructivistic theories’ and ‘students are able to understand and explain major models of teaching and learning, such as the social model, the information processing model, personal model, and behavioristic system model. One learning outcome in TEFL 1, which is ‘students are able to understand and implement different language methods and techniques. in line with development phase 2.1 descriptor 1 for experienced teachers that reads ‘familiar with language learning theories and methods’.

One learning outcome in TEFL 2 course that reads ‘students are able to apply various kinds of teaching techniques in teaching four language skills and language components.’ covers development phase 3.1 descriptor 2 for expert teachers that reads ‘can use a very wide range of teaching techniques, activities, and materials’. One learning outcome in TEYL course that reads ‘students are able to use various techniques to

teach language skills and components’ belongs to development phase 2.2 descriptor 3 for experienced teachers, which is ‘can use appropriately a variety of teaching techniques and activities.’ Development phase 2.1 descriptor 3 for experienced teachers, which is ‘can evaluate from a practical perspective the suitability of techniques and materials for different teaching contexts’ is covered in Curriculum and Material Development course whose one of its learning outcomes reads ‘students are able to modify and adjust materials according to the needs.’

Table 4.15 Sub Category of Methodology: Knowledge and Skills in University E

Course	Development Phase																
	1.1		1.2			2.1				2.2			3.1		3.2		
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3
Pedagogy	X	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
TEFL 1	X	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
TEFL 2	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X
TEYL	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X	X	X
Curriculum and Material Development	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X

4.2.5.2 Sub Category of Assessment in University E

Language Testing course whose learning outcome is ‘students are able to conduct English language tests’ belongs to development phase 2.1 descriptor 1 for experienced teachers, which is ‘can conduct regular progress tests including an oral component.’

Table 4.16 Sub Category of Assessment in University E

Course	Development Phase																
	1.1	1.2			2.1			2.2			3.1			3.2			
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4
Language Testing	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X

4.2.5.3 Sub Category of Lesson and Course Planning in University E

Curriculum and Material Development course whose learning outcome is ‘Students are able to make an integrated lesson plan’ covers development phase 1.2 descriptor 2 for novice teachers that reads ‘can ensure coherence between lessons by taking account of the outcomes of previous lessons in planning the next’. Another course whose learning outcome includes lesson and course planning sub category is TEFL 2. The course learning outcome which is ‘students are able to make an effective lesson plan to teach a specific language item’ is in line with development phase 2.1 descriptor 1 for experienced teachers that is ‘can use a syllabus and specified materials to prepare lesson plans that are balanced and meet the needs of the group.’

**Table 4.17 Sub Category of Lesson and Course Planning in
University E**

Course	Development Phase														
	1.1	1.2			2.1			2.2			3.1			3.2	
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2
Curriculum Material Development	X	X	X	√	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
TEFL 2	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X

4.2.5.4 Sub Category of Interaction Management and Monitoring in University E

Interaction management and monitoring sub category in University E is covered in two courses, namely Teaching Practice and Micro Teaching. One learning outcome in Micro Teaching, which is 'students are able to give appropriate feedback to students' belongs to development phase 2.1 descriptor 3 for experienced teachers that is 'can provide clear feedback'. In Teaching Practice course in University E, one of the learning outcomes that is 'students are able to respond to students' questions appropriately' includes development phase 1.2 descriptor 1 for novice teachers that reads 'can manage teacher-class interaction'.

**Table 4.18 Sub Category of Interaction Management and Monitoring
in University E**

Course	Development Phase																
	1.1	1.2			2.1			2.2				3.1				3.2	
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2
Teaching Practice	X	√	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Micro Teaching	X	X	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X

4.3 Pre-Service Teacher Training Program

The EPG-based Key Teaching Competences in the curriculum of pre-service teacher training program are developed in Workshop on Subject Specific Pedagogy course. There are six learning outcomes that cover sub category of methodology: knowledge and skills and sub category of assessment. However, learning outcomes, which belong to lesson and course planning and interaction management and monitoring sub category, are not available.

4.3.1 Sub Category of Methodology: Knowledge and Skills in Pre-Service Teacher Training Program

There are six learning outcomes that cover methodology: knowledge and skills sub category. They are as follows: *mengimplementasikan perangkat pembelajaran dalam bentuk latihan mengajar terbatas untuk KI dan KD mapel bahasa Inggris di SMP pada kelas VII, mengimplementasikan perangkat pembelajaran dalam bentuk*

latihan mengajar terbatas untuk KI dan KD mapel bahasa Inggris di SMP pada kelas VIII, mengimplementasikan perangkat pembelajaran dalam bentuk latihan mengajar terbatas untuk KI dan KD mapel bahasa Inggris di SMP pada kelas IX, mengimplementasikan perangkat pembelajaran dalam bentuk latihan mengajar terbatas untuk KI dan KD mapel bahasa Inggris di SMA pada kelas X, mengimplementasikan perangkat pembelajaran dalam bentuk latihan mengajar terbatas untuk KI dan KD mapel bahasa Inggris di SMA pada kelas XI, and mengimplementasikan perangkat pembelajaran dalam bentuk latihan mengajar terbatas untuk KI dan KD mapel bahasa Inggris di SMA pada kelas XII. All of the learning outcomes belong to development phase 2.2 descriptor 3 for experienced teachers that reads ‘can use appropriately a variety of teaching techniques and activities’.

Table 4.19 Sub Category of Methodology: Knowledge and Skills in Pre-Service Teacher Training Program

Course	Development Phase																
	1.1		1.2			2.1				2.2			3.1		3.2		
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3
Workshop on Subject Specific Pedagogy	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X	X	X

4.3.2 Sub Category of Assessment in Pre-Service Teacher Training Program

There are six learning outcomes that cover assessment sub category. They are as follows: *‘mampu mengembangkan perangkat*

penilaian holistik-otentik untuk KI dan KD mapel bahasa Inggris di SMP pada kelas VII, mampu mengembangkan perangkat penilaian holistik-otentik untuk KI dan KD mapel bahasa Inggris di SMP pada kelas VII, mampu mengembangkan perangkat penilaian holistik-otentik untuk KI dan KD mapel bahasa Inggris di SMP pada kelas VIII, mampu mengembangkan perangkat penilaian holistik-otentik untuk KI dan KD mapel bahasa Inggris di SMP pada kelas IX, mampu mengembangkan perangkat penilaian holistik-otentik untuk KI dan KD mapel bahasa Inggris di SMA pada kelas X, mampu mengembangkan perangkat penilaian holistik-otentik untuk KI dan KD mapel bahasa Inggris di SMA pada kelas XI, and mampu mengembangkan perangkat penilaian holistik-otentik untuk KI dan KD mapel bahasa Inggris di SMA pada kelas XII. All of the learning outcomes belong to development phase 3.2 descriptor 1 for expert teachers that reads ‘can develop assessment tasks for all language skills and language knowledge at any level’.

Table 4.20 Sub Category of Assessment in Pre-Service Teacher Training Program

Course	Development Phase																
	1.1	1.2			2.1			2.2			3.1			3.2			
	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 1	Descriptor 2	Descriptor 3	Descriptor 4
Workshop on Subject Specific Pedagogy	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	√	X	X	X

4.4 The Extent of the EPG-Based Key Teaching Competences in the Curricula of English Education Study Programs and Pre-Service Teacher Training Programs

After analyzing the development of the EPG-based Key Teaching Competences in the curricula of English education study programs and pre-service teacher training programs, this part will investigate the extent of the EPG-based Key Teaching Competences in the curricula of English education study programs and pre-service teacher training programs. In order to do this investigation, it will be elaborated from the range of development phases in each sub category of each university.

Table 4.21 Range of Development Phases in University A

Sub Category	Range of Development Phases
Methodology: Knowledge and Skills	1.1, 1.2, 2.1, 3.2
Assessment	3.2
Lesson and Course Planning	2.1, 2.2, 3.1
Interaction Management and Monitoring	1.2, 3.2

There are 17 descriptors in the sub category of methodology: knowledge and skills, but there are only 5 descriptors in development phase 1.1 and 1.2 for novice teachers, 2.1 and 2.2 for experienced teachers, and 3.2 for expert teachers that are covered in the curriculum of English education study program of University A. However, in sub category of assessment, out of 17 descriptors, there is only 1 descriptor, which is in development phase 3.2 for expert teachers, covered in the curriculum of English education study program of University A. Meanwhile,

there are 16 descriptors in sub category of lesson and course planning, yet there are only 4 descriptors in three development phases, development phase 2.1 and 2.2 for experienced teachers, and 3.1 for expert teachers, covered in the curriculum of English education study program of University A. Finally, although there are 17 descriptors in sub category of interaction management and monitoring, there are only 2 descriptors in development phase 1.2 for novice teachers and 3.2 for expert teachers that can be found in the existing curriculum of University A.

Table 4.22 Range of Development Phases in University B

Sub Category	Range of Development Phases
Methodology: Knowledge and Skills	1.2, 2.1
Assessment	2.1
Lesson and Course Planning	3.2
Interaction Management and Monitoring	-

Although there are 17 descriptors in sub category of methodology: knowledge and skills, there are only two descriptors in development phase 1.2 for novice teachers and 2.1 for experienced teachers that are covered in the curriculum of English education study program of University B. In sub category of assessment, there are also 17 descriptors, yet there is only 1 descriptor in development phase 2.1 for experienced teachers found in the curriculum of English education study program of University B. In sub category of lesson and course planning, even though there are 16 descriptors, there is only 1 descriptor in development phase 3.2 for

expert teachers that is included in the curriculum of English education study program of University B, and in sub category of interaction management and monitoring, development phases cannot be identified in the existing curriculum of University B.

Table 4.23 Range of Development Phases in University C

Sub Category	Range of Development Phases
Methodology: Knowledge and Skills	2.1, 2.2
Assessment	2.2
Lesson and Course Planning	1.2, 3.2
Interaction Management and Monitoring	1.2

In the curriculum of English education study program of University C, 5 descriptors are covered in development phase 2.1 and 2.2 for experienced teachers can be identified in the Key Teaching Competences' first sub category, methodology: knowledge and skills, In sub category of assessment, there is only 1 descriptor in development phase 2.2 for experienced teachers that is included in the curriculum of English education study program of University C, and in sub category of lesson and course planning, there are 2 descriptors in development phase 1.2 for novice teachers and 3.2 for expert teachers that are included in the curriculum of English education study program of University C. Finally, in sub category of interaction management and monitoring, there is only 1 descriptor in development phase 1.2 for novice teachers that can be found in the existing curriculum of University C.

Table 4.24 Range of Development Phases in University D

Sub Category	Range of Development Phases
Methodology: Knowledge and Skills	1.2, 2.1
Assessment	2.1
Lesson and Course Planning	2.2
Interaction Management and Monitoring	-

Out of 17 descriptors, there are only 2 descriptors in development phase 1.2 for novice teachers and 2.1 for experienced teachers in methodology: knowledge and skills sub category that can be identified in the curriculum of English education study program of University D while in sub category of assessment, there is only 1 descriptor in development phase 2.1 for experienced teachers that can be found in the curriculum of English education study program of University D. In sub category of lesson and course planning, there is only 1 descriptor in development phase 2.2 for experienced teachers covered in the curriculum of English education study program of University D. However, in sub category of interaction management and monitoring, development phases cannot be identified in the existing curriculum of University D.

Table 4.25 Range of Development Phases in University E

Sub Category	Range of Development Phases
Methodology: Knowledge and Skills	2.1, 2.2, 3.1
Assessment	2.1
Lesson and Course Planning	1.2, 2.1
Interaction Management and Monitoring	1.2, 2.1

Table 4.25 shows that in sub category of methodology: knowledge and skills, development phase 2.1 and 2.2 for experienced teachers, and 3.1 for expert teachers representing 4 descriptors can be identified in the curriculum of English education study program of University E. In sub category of assessment, only 1 descriptor in development phase 2.1 for experienced teachers can be found in the curriculum of English education study program of University E, and in sub category of lesson and course planning, there 2 descriptors in development phase 1.2 for novice teachers and 2.1 for experienced teachers that are in the curriculum of English education study program of University E. Finally, in the sub category of interaction management and monitoring, 2 descriptors in development phase 1.2 for novice teachers and 2.1 for experienced teachers can be identified in the existing curriculum of University E.

Table 4.26 Range of Development Phases in Pre-Service Teacher Training Program

Sub Category	Range of Development Phases
Methodology: Knowledge and Skills	2.2
Assessment	3.2
Lesson and Course Planning	-
Interaction Management and Monitoring	-

There is 1 descriptor in development phase 2.2 for experienced teachers in the sub category of methodology: knowledge and skills that can be identified in the curriculum of pre-service teacher training program while in sub category of assessment, there is also 1 descriptor in development phase 3.2 for expert teachers, which is found in the curriculum of pre-service teacher training program. However, In the sub category of lesson and course planning and in the sub category of interaction management and monitoring, development phase cannot be identified in the existing curriculum of pre-service teacher training program.

The following tables will summarize the range of development phases in each sub category in the curricula of English education study programs of University A, B, C, D, and E, and in the curriculum of pre-service teacher training program.

**Table 4.27 Range of Development Phases in Sub Category of
Methodology: Knowledge and Skills**

University	Range of Development Phases
University A	1.1, 1.2, 2.1, 3.2
University B	1.2, 2.1
University C	2.1, 2.2
University D	1.2, 2.1
University E	2.1, 2.2, 3.1
Pre-Service Teacher Training Program	2.2

As table 4.27 shown, in the EPG-based Key Teaching Competences' sub category of methodology: knowledge and skills, The existing curriculum of University A covers development phase 1.1 and 1.2 for novice teachers, 2.1 for experienced teachers, and 3.2 for expert teachers. Therefore, only development phase 3.1 for expert teachers is not included in the curriculum of English education study program of University A. However, the existing curricula of University B, and University D. Development phase 2.1 and 2.2 for experienced teachers are included in the curriculum of English education study program of University C while development phase 2.1 and 2.2 for experienced teachers, and 3.1 for expert teachers are covered in the existing curriculum of University E. Pre-service teacher training program only covers development phase 2.2 for experienced teachers.

**Table 4.28 Range of Development Phases in Sub Category of
Assessment**

University	Range of Development Phases
University A	3.2
University B	2.1
University C	2.2
University D	2.1
University E	2.1
Pre-Service Teacher Training Program	3.2

From the table 4.28, in the sub category of assessment, it can be seen that all universities cover only 1 development phase except pre-service teacher training program. University B, University D, and University E similarly cover development phase 2.1 for experienced teachers. The curriculum of English education study program in University C covers development phase 2.2 for experienced teachers while the existing curriculum of University A covers the highest development phase, which is development phase 3.2 for expert teachers. However, development phase 3.2 for expert teachers is covered in the curriculum of pre-service teacher training program.

Table 4.29 Range of Development Phases in Sub Category of Lesson and Course Planning

University	Range of Development Phases
University A	2.1, 2.2, 3.1
University B	3.2
University C	1.2, 3.2
University D	2.2
University E	1.2, 2.1
Pre-Service Teacher Training Program	-

As seen in table 4.29, the results show that development phases covered in sub category of lesson and course planning in University A are 2.1 and 2.2 for experienced teachers, and 3.1 for expert teachers. Nevertheless, only development phase 3.2 for expert teachers is covered in the curriculum of English education study program in University B. The existing curriculum of University C covers 2 development phases, development phase 1.2 for novice teachers and 3.2 for expert teachers, but the existing curriculum of University D only covers development phase 2.2 for experienced teachers. Development phase 1.2 for novice teachers and 2.1 for experienced teachers are covered in the existing curriculum of University E. However, the table shows that pre-service teacher training program does not cover any development phase in its existing curriculum.

**Table 4.30 Range of Development Phases in Sub Category of
Interaction Management and Monitoring**

University	Range of Development Phases
University A	1.2, 3.2
University B	-
University C	1.2
University D	-
University E	1.2, 2.1
Pre-Service Teacher Training Program	-

In table 4.30 above, it can be seen that there are no development phases covered in sub category of interaction management and monitoring in University B, University D, and pre-service teacher training program. Meanwhile, development phase 1.2 for novice teachers and 3.2 for expert teachers are covered in the curriculum of English education study program in University A. The existing curriculum of University C covers 1 development phase only, development phase 1.2 for novice teachers. Finally, the existing curriculum of University E covers development phase 1.2 for novice teachers and 2.1 for experienced teachers.