THE MOVES OF THE DISCUSSION SECTIONS OF THE ENGLISH EDUCATION STUDY PROGRAM *SKRIPSIS* AND TESOL QUARTERLY JOURNAL ARTICLES: A QUALITATIVE ANALYSIS



Building Future Leaders

FERINA KEMALA RAHMAWATI

2215121550

A *Skripsi* Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirement for the Bachelor Degree

ENGLISH EDUCATION STUDY PROGRAM FACULTY OF LANGUAGES AND ARTS STATE UNIVERSITY OF JAKARTA 2017

LEMBAR PENGESAHAN

Skripsi ini diajukan oleh :

Nama : Ferina Kemala Rahmawati

No. Registrasi : 2215121550

Jurusan : Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris

Fakultas : Bahasa dan Seni

Judul Skripsi : The Moves of the Discussion Sections of the English Study Program *Skripsis* and TESOL Quarterly Journal Articles: a Qualitative Analysis

Telah berhasil dipertahankan di hadapan Dewan Penguji, dan diterima sebagai persyaratan yang diperlukan untuk memperoleh gelar Sarjana pada Fakultas Bahasa dan Seni, Universitas Negeri Jakarta.

DEWAN PENGUJI

Pembimbing I

Siti Wachidah, Ph.D / NIP. 195710041989032001

Ketua Penguji

Niha Wanda Cassandra, M.Pd NIP. 197806022005012002

Pembimbing II

Dr.Sudarya Permaha, M.Hum NIP. 197404032001121004

Penguji Materi

Lasito, M.App.Ling. NIP. 1980022222008121002

Jakarta, Pebruari 2017 akultas Bahasa dan Seni Dekar r. Aceng Rahmat, M.Pd 5/12141990031001

LEMBAR PERNYATAAN

Yang bertanda tangan dibawah ini :

Nama : Ferina Kemala Rahmawati

No. Registrasi : 2215121550

Jurusan : Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris

Fakultas : Bahasa dan Seni

Judul Skripsi : The Moves of the Discussion Sections of the English Study Program Skripsis and TESOL Quarterly Journal Articles: a Qualitative Analysis

Menyatakan bahwa benar skripsi ini adalah hasil karya sendiri. Apabila saya mengutip dari karya orang lain, maka saya mencantumkan sumbernya sesuai ketentuan yang berlaku. Saya bersedia menerima sanksi dari Fakultas Bahasa dan Seni Universitas Negeri Jakarta, apabila terbukti melakukan tindakan plagiat.

Demikian saya buat pernyataan ini dengan sebenar-benarnya.

Jakarta, Februari 2017 AEF377433824 MA Ferina Kemala Rahmawati NIM. 2215121550

ii

LEMBAR PERNYATAAN PERSETUJUAN PUBLIKASI

KARYA ILMIAH UNTUK KEPENTINGAN AKADEMIS

Sebagai civitas akademika Universitas Negeri Jakarta, saya yang bertanda tangan dibawah ini :

Nama : Ferina Kemala Rahmawati

No. Registrasi : 2215121550

Jurusan : Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris

Fakultas : Bahasa dan Seni

Judul Skripsi : The Moves of the Discussion Sections of the English Study Program Skripsis and TESOL Quarterly Journal Articles: a Qualitative Analysis

Demi pengembangan ilmu pengetahuan, saya menyetujui untuk memberikan kepada Universitas Negeri Jakarta Hak Bebas Royalti Non-Eksklusif (Non-Exclusive Royalty Free Right) atas karya ilmiah saya. Dengan Hak Bebas Royalti Non-Eksklusif ini, Universitas Negeri Jakarta berhak menyimpan, mengalihmedia/formatkan, mengelolanya dalam bentuk pangkalan data (database), mendistribusikannya, dan menampilkan/mempublikasikannya di internet atau media lainnya untuk kepentingan akademis tanpa perlu meminta ijin dari saya selama tetap mencantumkan nama saya sebagai penulis/pencipta dan sebagai pemilik Hak Cipta. Segala bentuk tuntutan hukum yang timbul atas pelanggaran Hak Cipta dalam karya ilmiah ini menjadi tanggung jawab saya pribadi.

Demikian pernyataan ini saya buat dengan sebenar-benarnya.

Dibuat di Jakarta Pada tanggal Februari 2017

Yang menyatakan, Ferina Kemala Rahmawati NIM. 2215121550

ABSTRAK

FERINA KEMALA RAHMAWATI. 2017. <u>Alur Penulisan dalam Bagian</u> <u>Diskusi Pada Skripsi Siswa Jurusan Bahasa Inggris dan Artikel dalam Jurnal</u> <u>TESOL Quarterly: Penelitian Kualitatif.</u> Jakarta: Jurusan Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris, Fakultas Bahasa dan Seni, Universitas Negeri Jakarta. Januari 2017.

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengidentifikasi alur penulisan dan fungsi bahasa pada alur penulisan sebagai proses yang digunakan untuk menuliskan bagian diskusi pada skripsi dan artikel penelitian TESOL Quarterly. Fokus penelitian ini adalah pada penggunaan bahasa yang digunakan oleh penulis untuk merepresentasikan alur penulisan bagian diskusi. Tiga bagian diskusi pada skripsi dan tiga lainnya dari artikel penelitian digunakan sebagai sumber data dan dianalisis menggunakan tabel analisis dari Halliday. Alur penulisan tersebut dianalisis menggunakan sistem transitivity yang berfungsi untuk mengklasifikasi proses dari tiap klausa. Selanjutnya, analisis secara kualitatif digunakan untuk melihat fungsi bahasa dan alur penulisan secara bertahap dari tiap-tiap klausa dari sumber data. Hasil menunjukkan bahwa terdapat alur yang wajib digunakan yakni pernyataan hasil studi dan klaim. Hasil lain memperlihatkan adanya kesenjangan yang diperlihatkan kedua sumber data terlebih pada alur pengembangan ide dan penguatan klaim. Dengan adanya analisis ini, karakter penulisan pada bagian diskusi skripsi dan artikel dalam jurnal menjadi sebuah evaluasi yang dapat digunakan dalam menulis diskusi. Selain itu, analisis ini dapat menjadi pembelajaran bagi para penulis untuk memahami fungsi bahasa yang memiliki pengaruh penting untuk menulis diskusi dalam konteks akademik dan analisis ini dapat dijadikan sebagai proses awal untuk memberikan asumsi general yang berguna untuk kepentingan penulisan akademik.

Kata Kunci: Alur penulisan, Sistem fungsi bahasa Halliday, Bagian diskusi, Penelitian Kualitatif

ABSTRACT

FERINA KEMALA RAHMAWATI. 2017. <u>The Moves of the Discussion</u> <u>Sections of the English Study Program *Skripsis* and TESOL Quarterly Journal <u>Articles: a Qualitative Analysis.</u> A Thesis. Jakarta: English Education Study Program, Faculty of Languages and Arts, Universitas Negeri Jakarta. January 2017.</u>

The purpose of this research was to identify the moves and processes used in the Discussion section of the Skripsis and TESOL Quarterly journal articles. This research focused on the language and the function of the language used by the writers in representing their moves while writing the discussion. The clauses of the six discussions were used which three discussions derived from Skripsis and three others from TESOL Quarterly journal articles and analyzed using the table analysis by Halliday to examine the function of each language used. The qualitative analysis was used to describe the moves of the Discussions that focused on the function of language of each clause. The result showed there were two obligatory moves 'results statement' and 'claim' that presented in most of discussions. Further analysis also revealed the gaps found between the discussion of the Skripsis and TESOL Quarterly journal articles particularly in elaborating the statement of ideas and proofing their claim. By identifying the moves of skrispsis and TESOL Quarterly journal articles, the characteristics of the English Department students in writing their discussions in regards to the researchers from journal articles were shown as a needs analysis in writing discussion section. This might also allow the writers to understand the function of the language written in the discussion section and may direct future research to continue this analysis to make applicable generalization for academic write purposes.

Keywords: Moves, Halliday Systemic Functional Language, Discussion section, Qualitative Analysis

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

All the praises to Allah, I thank you for giving me such a great strength and mind to finally done this. I need to acknowledge my insightful and supportive advisor as well as a writing mentor, Ma'am Siti Wachidah for the help, advice and comments to make me a better thinker. Thank you. I would like to also send my sincere thanks to all the lectures of English Department who have provided me with tons of knowledge that was very useful to write my *skripsi*.

Other that deserve my always gratitude for bringing this *skripsi* to life is my mom and my family members who stands for me and puts up with the very boring ups and downs that go with writing and life. I of course need to also thank the friends for their much appreciated encouragement in writing this—my beloved friends who had left me for six months, Kikim, Intan, Birrul, Rifqa. Special thanks to my all *skripsi* partners: Maria, Diyah, Desy, and Caput, we've got through the ups and downs mood for doing this together. My lifetime friends—Claudea, Christa, Kristy, Desy, Vina for all your support and help to take away "the sadness" I had. For all members of TEDIBER 12, thanks for giving me such a nice and warm place to learn! How lucky I am to have such a caring and great friends like you all. I hope we can still reach each other no matter what! Thank you so much!

For certain people who accidentally help me and kindly encourage me to keep up with the writing, thanks to you all.

FKR

TABLE OF CONTENT

ABSTRACT	i
ABSTRAK	ii
LEMBAR PENGESAHAN	iii
LEMBAR PERNYATAAN	iv
LEMBAR PERNYATAAN PUBLIKASI	v
ACKNOWLEDGMENT	vi
TABLE OF CONTENT	viii
LIST OF TABLE	xi
LIST OF APPENDICES	xii

CHAPTER I INTRODUCTION

1.1	Background of the study	1
1.2	Research questions	5
1.3	Purpose of the study	6
1.4	Limitation of the study	6
1.5	Significance of the study	6

CHAPTER II LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1	Purpose of Discussion	7
2.2	Moves in Discussion Sections	8
2.3	The Moves Frameworks in Discussion Section	
	from Previous Research	9
2.4	The Function of Systemic Functional Linguistics in	13
	Analyzing Moves	

CHAPTER III METHODOLOGY

3.1 Research design	17
3.2 Data and data source	17
3.3 Data collection precedures	18
3.4 Data analysis procedures	20

CHAPTER IV FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION	
4.1 Findings	22
4.2 Discussions	39
CHAPTER V CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION	
5.1 Conclusion	. 45
5.2 Recommendation	46
REFERENCES	48

LIST OF TABLE

Table 2.1 Seven-Move hierarchical framework by Ruiying & Allison 2003
Table 2.2 Moves and communicative acts of empirical part of Gruber and Huemer (2008)
Table 2.3 Transitivity analysis
Table 3.1 The Analysis of Verb Process of Each Clause

 Table 3.2 The Complete Analysis of Transitivity

Table 3.3 The Extract of Macro and Micro Moves Analysis

Table 4.1 The Moves of the Discussion Section

Table 4.2 Number of Words and Sentences of Discussions

LIST OF APPENDICES

APPENDIX 1 The Analysis of Processes of Each Clause
APPENDIX 2 The Analysis of Transitivity System
APPENDIX 3 The Analysis of Moves of Each Discussions
APPENDIX 4 The Detail Analysis of Moves of RAs and SKs
Discussions

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background of Study

Discussion section in research writing plays a significant role of most sections. It has primary role as the "mirror image" of introduction to give readers an understanding of particular to the general view of the study's accomplishment comprises with its significance and direction to future studies. (Graf, 2008; Hess, 2004). The beginning of discussion often reflects what the authors have learned from their study. That is the chances for the authors to state their new statement for making readers understand the problem presented in the study (Bem, 2003). Following to its functions, discussion section of RAs is considered as an essential part of research of most sections that aims for reader to read but poses great challenges for authors to write (Safnil, 2000; Drotar, 2009)

Discussion section has mostly been studied in the two main concerns: the generic structures/organizational pattern (Holmes, 1997; Peacock, 2002; Ruiying & Allison, 2003) and textual features (Parkinson, 2011; Basturkmen, 2012; Gruber & Huemer, 2008). In discussing the study, researcher needs to focus on the rhetorical organization as means to reach the purpose of the discussion. Generally, some studies employed organizational pattern of discussion using the term moves as presented by

Swales in ESP approach to genre studies. The moves are known as functional unit of text used for identifying the whole text purpose or communicative purpose within the

text segment (Ruiying & Allison, 2003; Swales, 1990). The intention is to help students of other disciplinary to be able to produce and understand different types of text and the nature of different types of texts (Hopkins & Evans, 1988). Moves are organized by the understanding of internal structures of the text and some unity grounded in common functions/meanings. Within the moves, there is also smallest unit that represents communicative acts of the moves.

Researchers have investigated disciplinary variation in the used of moves. Studies include investigation of academic genres such as grant proposal (Connor, 2000; Halleck & Connor, 2006), theses and dissertation (Hopkins & Evans, 1988), professional or fundraising genres (Upton & Cohen, 2009; Sadeghi & Samuel, 2013) and research articles (Bruce, 2009; Ruiying & Allison, 2003; Holmes, 1997; Peacock, 2002). These studies are primarily concerned with understanding how disciplinary writers carefully formulate the expression of ideas to appeal to their research communities. From all those academic genres, research articles (RAs) have commonly received intention for its moves (macro-structures) of the different sections.

In particular to the move in discussion section of RAs, there have been several researches conducted in the varied focus areas. These studies are primarily focused on the move and the step/sub-move version including the move occurrences (obligatory and optional). In applied linguistics, (Ruiying & Allison, 2003) examined the rhetorical choices and the specific organizational choices within each section among the Results, the Result and Discussion, the Discussion, the Conclusion, and the Pedagogic Implication section. This study used 20 RAs in the applied linguistics concerning. This study also implied that in the discussion section, move 2 "Reporting Results" and move 3 "Commenting on Results" are the quasi-obligatory and obligatory move appeared.

Another study reported by (Holmes, 1997) in the discussion section of three disciplines: social science, history, political science and sociology in terms of moves version or communicative categories proposed in the previous studies. It was found that, the History text were particularly distinctive and the least resemblance among three. Holmes claimed that there is no completely obligatory move in social science of RA discussion. In line with Holmes study, (Peacock, 2002) on his article, conducted a study regarding communicative moves in the discussion section of research articles. The results indicated that there were no moves "must occur" in the discussions section, but rather he classified some moves into three parts; obligatory (move 7 claim (90% of all RAs), move 3 finding (84%), move 5 reference to previous research (73%)), optional (40-50% move 1 information move, move 4 unexpected outcome and move 8 limitation), and less common is move 6 explanation. have presented that in the corpus of 252 RAs from 36 disciplines there An update model of

discussion section is proposed focuses on obligatory and optional moves in the genre that can make optimal order for the whole text.

From the literature mentioned, most of studies tend to follow Swales move frameworks by indicating the general move indicators within using the sentence as the unit of analysis. However, (Holmes, 1997) suggested that the clause and phrase can be adopted as the unit of analysis since it has more specific observation through the moves. Also, to the researcher knowledge, there has been limited amount of research focusing on providing a description of the language used and its functions as the evidence to realize the moves. Yet, on this study, the focus is on the moves analysis in the macro and the micro levels of discussion sections of the ED UNJ students' *skripsis* and the TESOL journal articles and the process that represent the moves using the Systemic Functional Language (SFL) approach.

The SFL approach was used as its function for having a tool to analyze the relationship of the language and its functions in social setting (Hyon, 1996). SFL's view of genre presents a strong level of specificity for genre analysis particularly in macro and micro level of text (Gruber & Huemer, 2008; Bhatia, 2002). Studies such as (Parkinson, 2011; Safnil, 2013; Gruber & Huemer, 2008) have examined discourse markers and linguistic realizations of moves in more detailed by indicating the verb processes within text segments using SFL approach. The combined between the SFL approach and the genre approaches might bring the context in which a detail genre

are being used and offer the purpose of the text within its situation (Hyon, 1996; Upton & Cohen, 2009).

In addition, the chosen of *Skripsis* of English Study Program and TESOL Quarterly Articles is due to the similarity of its text organization and discipline areas. Both of them fostered inquiry into English language teaching and learning by arranging it from the introduction until conclusion part. TESOL Quarterly is categorized as top seven journals based on its quality indicators (Egbert, 2007). The articles published in TESOL Quarterly are peer-reviewed academic journal articles with the rate of acceptance is only 8.5% compared to other journals that can reach 60% of acceptance. Its acceptance ensures a fair process and an objective review with relevant criteria (Renandya, 2014). In contrast, the Skripsi is a mini research that is used as the requirements to be graduated from college and contained of one topic of field of study to be discussed in logical sequence to generate new knowledge for limited area. From its differences, it is plausible that the gap between the two data might exist which can be additional knowledge on how to write a discussion section in academic way and raise awareness about how language used and functioned in both discussions.

1.2 Research Questions

1. What moves are used in the discussion sections of the English Education Study Program *Skripsis* and TESOL Journal Articles? 2. What processes are used to represent the micro moves of the discussion sections of the English Education Study Program *Skripsis* and TESOL Journal Articles?

1.3 Purposes of Study

The main purpose of this present study is to analyze the moves presented in macro and micro moves levels of the Discussion section used by researchers of published articles of TESOL Quarterly and English Study Program of University of Jakarta (ED UNJ) students' *skripsis*. Other purpose is to find out more about the processes that represent the moves using the Systemic Functional Language approach.

1.4 Limitation of Study

In employing the purpose of study, several limitations are unavoidable in some aspects. The first limitation is the selection of data resources which has the authority to be used as data, specifically the Discussion Section. Also, the researcher may only give a tentative conclusion instead of an applicable generalization.

1.5 Significance of Study

This study seeks to contribute to the need analysis in understanding typical moves structures used in the Discussion section as a reference for novice writers to organize their discussion. Focusing on the macro and micro moves in discussion section, the researcher also expands the applications of SFL approach to analyze macro and micro moves in the genre of articles published and "*skripsi*".

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 **Purpose of Discussion**

Discussion section plays a significant part to give readers specific issues to the general concerns about the study (Bem, 2003; Hess, 2004). The issues presented are all the answer of research questions posed in the Introduction part. This section is not merely to prove what has been done in research but rather to discover something found in the study related to the hypothesis being referred that assumed to be required further elaboration for the development of the study. Therefore, the content of discussion should form a critical thinking of the author about the issues to carefully synthesize logical interpretation based on the evidence over the findings. The involvement of the evidence is needed to avoid biases that sometimes unavoidable (Paul, 2003)

Apart from that, there are some common mistakes that research found in the discussion sections. One of the most common is that the Discussion section tends to be a place to discuss every point that has been described in the Result section. Another thing is a new finding sometimes appeared in Discussion section that was not described in the Results section. The last common thing is the absent of author's interpretation after repeating the statement of findings (Bem, 2003; Drotar, 2009). These kinds of mistakes are all contradictory with the purpose of Discussion section

that suggested authors to put new statement in Discussion section along with the interpretation to make readers understand more about the issues presented.

2.2 Moves in Discussion Section

Moves is defined as a functional unit of text differing lengths which are labeled according to purpose in the text and steps were defined as options writers select from to accomplish rhetorical purpose (Swales, 1990). It aims to be used for identifying part of the text which has different concerned within (Ding, 2007; Ruiying & Allison, 2003; Connor, 2000). The moves and sub-moves or step serve to distinguish the communicative purposes from the rhetorical techniques realizing the purposes. The concept of moves captures the function and purpose of a segment of text at a move general level, while step spells out more specifically the rhetorical means of realizing the function of move (Ruiying & Allison, 2003).

In academic genres, in particular research articles, the sub-moves or step is defined as the set of communicative actions that commonly available in RA to realize a certain purpose of the section. Moves that emerged in particular RAs can be fairly complex meaning that the identification of sub-moves or step assumed as challenges as it requires reading all the text carefully and keeping track of what writers were trying to accomplish rhetorically (Upton & Cohen, 2009). Following that, distinguishing the distinction between moves and sub moves is believed to be more challenging especially on the structure of RAs that requires some cyclic patterns and complexity of sentences. The reason for that might be caused by the combination of two or more move within one sentence with highly complex type of text. Despite of the criteria in the existing framework, researchers are still forced to repeatedly review and revise the elements of text based on its moves and sub-moves to get clear picture of the writers' organization text. (Basturkmen, 2012; Holmes, 1997).

As mentioned above, the moves in the Discussion sections are proceed from particular to general, "from the specific information reported in the Method and the Results sections to a more general view of how the findings should be interpreted" (Weissberg & Buker 1990). The organization of the Discussion section is typically used several key components in logical sequence that in this study presented in terms of move pattern. Within the Discussion section, the most important features to be provided are the synthesis and interpretation of findings and presentation of relevant messages that highlight significance and implication of their research (Drotar, 2009).

2.3 The Moves Frameworks in Discussion Section from Previous Research

Researchers have their own way in making logical sequence what elements to be included in discussion section (Ruiying & Allison, 2003; Hopkins & Evans, 1988; Swales J., 1990). Hopkins & Evans was first to evaluate Swales work in 1985 regarding the genre analysis in Introduction section (CARS model); *Establishing the territory, Establishing the niche* and *Occupying the niche or research space* that was used to identify the overall sections of articles, particularly the Discussion section, results the new list of Discussion section as follows: 1) *Background information, 2) Statement of result (S.O.R), 3) (Un) expected outcome, 4) Reference to previous* research, 5) Explanation of unsatisfactory result, 6) Exemplification, 7) Deduction, 8) Hypothesis, 9) Reference to previous research, 10) Recommendation, and 11) Justification. This study discovered that "statement of results" is an obligatory move, defined as a move that occurred frequently that appeared almost in 90% of text. The move "statement of results" is not merely re-stating the result presented in the Results sections but rather showing an interesting, significant or remarkable findings found. This move needs to direct the authors to consider possible explanations for the study results, rather than just those that fit biases (Hess, 2004).

The following research of Swales (1990), then, continuing Hopkins & Evans' study by merging the moves was presented in eight frequent moves: *1) Background information*; *2) Statement of results*; *3) (Un) expected outcome*; *4) Reference to previous research*; *5) Explanation*; *6) Exemplification*; *7) Deduction and Hypothesis*; *8) Recommendation*. This research noted that "Move 2" is quasi-obligatory or known as the move that often occurred in the research. The Swales' model is believed to be helpful in proposing explicit rhetorical guidelines for academic writing that can be enriched with specific language features needed to achieve the expected rhetorical structure (Chang & Schleppegrell, 2011).

However, the two of moves framework above have not provided a more specific structure to achieve the macro move rather it only shows a description what to write in each move. The only advantage of those framework are claimed as having an accurate reflection of the writer's purpose instead the very general categories such as "definition/classification" that have for so long formed the basis of EAP course specifications, and, furthermore, are rigid categories that being recognized without much difficulty by writers and readers of specialist texts (Hopkins & Evans, 1988).

To answer the gap between the general and specific structures of the moves, Ruiying and Allison (2003) developed more about the specific/steps of the general moves proposed by Hopkins & Evans (1988) and Swales (1990) in seven moves and ten micro moves presented in the Table 1 below:

Move	Steps
Move 1- Background information	
Move 2- Reporting results	
Move 3- Summarizing results	
Move 4- Commenting on results	Step 1- Interpreting results
_	Step 2 - Comparing results with literature
	Step 3- Accounting for results
	Step 4 - Evaluating results
Move 5 - Summarizing study	
Move 6 - Evaluating the study	Step 1- Indicating limitations
	Step 2 - Indicating significance
	Step 3 Evaluating methodology
Move 7 - Deduction from the research	Step 1 - Making suggestions
	Step 2 - Recommending further research
	Step 3 - Drawing pedagogical implications

Table 2.1: Seven-Move hierarchical framework by Ruiying & Allison 2003

This study found that the most frequent and obligatory move appeared is the move "commenting on results". Within the move "commenting on results", the authors have a chance to give the meaning of the findings and why they are important (Fisher, Jansen, Johnson, & Mikos, 2006). Another move "summarizing results" is found to be less occurred while the "reporting results" is the quasi-obligatory.

In SFL studies, there was also similar research (Gruber & Huemer, 2008) concerning on the specific functions and the realization of it through a set of moves presented in empirical part or Discussion section using the types of periodic text structures which based on Halliday's (1978) and Martin (1997) in relation to different metafunctional modes of meaning. The moves presented are based on their findings of social science students' term paper in Austrian identified in the list of Table 2 as follows:

Functional stage or move	Realization of communicative acts		
Presenting author's accomplishments	Describing data, method and/or field		
	Announcing results		
	Presenting results		
Evaluating findings	Presenting results		
	Relating findings to own research questions and		
	hypothesis		
	Interpreting results		
	Offering interpretation		
	Comparing findings with past research		
	Reporting findings of past research		
	Raising or warding off counterclaims		
Presenting effects of results	Recommending further research		
	Reviewing methods		
	Justifying recommendations		
	Promising to carry out recommendations		

Table 2.2 Moves and communicative Acts of empirical part of Gruber and Huemer (2008)

This framework of (Gruber & Huemer, 2008) only emphasizes three macro moves should be input in the Discussion sections. However, the third move *"presenting effects of results"* were rarely occurred in the data while the other two macro moves were well presented. The first move was presented with the description of the data and method. In the second move, the interpretation of writers as a consideration of questions that remain unanswered or that raised by the study itself, along with suggestions for the kinds of research that would help to answer them and previous study related were also provided to support the findings. The intention is to the readers' need in understanding how authors' primary and secondary findings fit with what is already known as well as challenge and/or extend scientific knowledge (Drotar, 2009).

2.4 The Function of Systemic Functional Linguistics in Analyzing Moves

In the view of genre, Systemic Functional Linguistics is described as centered within larger theory of language that developed by Michael Halliday. The big concern of this is between the language and its functions in social context (Hyon, 1996; Martin, 2002; Christie, Winter 1999). On its framework for genre studies, there are two model phases to analyze the text: presentation of text type(s) and their various features. These models concern in the functions of text (what the text are for), schematic structures (how do the text are organized) and lexico-grammatical features (specific aspects within the text).

Within the SFL approach, the analysis of moves can be categorized to be in experiential and textual perspective; focuses on the communicative acts to reach the purpose of text which the writer has brought to their representation of the field. In order to understand the description of how clauses function to build the field, researcher needs separated each clause and its elements of clauses, then, categorizes according to the main type of process (or verb) that they contain using the transitivity process. This process might explicitly show the context as the construction process of text that shows its conceptual environment and situation in which it plays a role. (Krippendorff, 2004). SFL identifies six main types of processes: verbal, relational, mental, and material, existential and behavioral process. As well as selecting the process around which the clause is built the language user selects words to function as participants (abstract or concrete 'things') involved in the process (Donohue, 2012). The choices and organization of things and processes work together to build the writer's representation of the experience they are seeking to represent the purpose of their text. The table below presented the details of analysis process using transitivity.

Transitivity Analysis				
Process	Participant			
Material Process	Actor, goal, recipient, and beneficiary			
Mental Process	Senser and phenomenon			
Relational Attributive Process	Carrier and attribute			
Relational Identifying Process	Token and value			
Relational Possessive Process	Possessor and possessed			
Verbal Process	Sayer, addresser and verbiage			
Existential Process	Existent			
Behavioral Process	Behaver			

 Table 2.3 Transitivity analysis

In previous study, there were some studies using SFL approach relates with moves or communicative purpose of text that has been done. One study examined the lexico-grammar used to argue and prove knowledge claims in the Discussion section (Parkinson, 2011). Within the examination, the analysis of cause, purpose, condition, and proof to support the discussion were all described using relevance of Halliday's (1993) concept. It has two aims that are to express overall purpose in their research and more frequently and to explain their purpose in performing certain actions within the research, in particular discussion section. The information about aims and methods is crucial to the readers' understanding in Discussion section that may be expressed in statements about purpose and action. The action and purpose are described within the verbal processes that either allow readers insight into the thought processes of the author, or direct the readers' thoughts. The results found that students' expression of cause, condition and purpose is more congruent than that in the RAs. Students are more likely to employ conjunctions, the "more spoken" means of expressing causal and conditional meaning than RAs are.

The second study is presented the moves found in the four sections of papers: introductory part, theoretical part, empirical part and concluding part (Gruber & Huemer, 2008). However, this study only gave the detail of introductory part as the rationale of the study was to answer the problematic writing faced by students in Austria regarding the typical sequence within the Introduction part. This showed that the student writer seems to have problems in establishing (or at least signaling) micro-level textual coherence in systematic way. Other findings of this study also provided text structures in terms of genre and rhetorical structure text, how these structures are signaled and related to each other. Using the SFL model of text structures of Mann and Thompson (1992, 1997) and register and genre theory of Martin (1992, 1997), the identification of the problems are described in general and specific way. Another study was conducted by (Safnil, 2013) in Introduction part that referred to CARS model from Swales to identify the moves along with the discourse markers and linguistic realization to achieve the means of moves, communicative purposes, particularly in attempt of "niche establishment". There were three kinds of discourse markers and linguistic realization used; the use of contradictory discourse markers, lexical negation or negation in the verb phrase and contrastive comments and expressing needs. Both of data, the English RA introductions and Indonesian journal articles in science, engineering, and medical sciences were shown different rhetorical in writing "niche establishment". Results showed that Indonesian writers tend to justify their research project by indicating a gap or limitation or inconsistencies or nonexistence of previous relate studies.

CHAPTER 3

METHODOLOGY

3.1 Research Design

This study used qualitative content analysis that functioned as the method to describe the organization of moves in the text segments presented and explicitly show the context (Krippendorff, 2004). Qualitative content analysis is frequently employed "to answer questions such as what, why and how, and the common patterns in the data are searched for" by using a consistent set of codes to organize text with similar content (Heikkilä & Ekman, 2003, p. 138). In analyzing the organization of the moves, researcher used the Systemic Functional Language (SFL) theory by Halliday. The used of SFL approach in analyzing moves has been developed by Martin (2002) to enable researchers to analyze the purpose and function of either a whole text or of text segments and shows how term papers are realized through specific patterns that are typical of academic genres. However, as this study also focused on the process of each clause, the transitivity system were used as the tools to analyze the data. Researcher conducted qualitative study using SFL theory as the consideration to understand objectively the function of the language used that constructed through the moves of discussion sections of the data.

3.2 Data and Data Sources

The data consists of clauses of six discussions, three from ED UNJ students' *skripsi* and three others from TESQ journals. The discussions were written by alumnus of ED UNJ students who has been graduated for over than one year and the scholars of from several countries that have published their articles in TESOL journals. In the case of the ED UNJ students, the discussions were chosen as it has been submitted to the official library of English Department as the collection. While for the research articles of were chosen as it is submitted and published in TESQ journals mostly published in 2014 that were judged as free from grammatical and textual errors by the editor. The discussions were selected randomly but limited in one discipline, English and Language Teaching. All the discussions selected were all written in one heading to make the research articles and SK for the *skripsi*.

3.3 Data Collection Procedures

The procedures of analysis were based on suggestion of Dudley Evans (1994) that comprised three processes of identifying moves. Those are: 1) identifying move borders, 2) separating each clause as the smallest unit of analysis, 3) using experts to validate the analysis process. In detail, the analysis process went through these following steps:

3.3.1 Reading All the Discussions

The data were first read to get general understanding of each data, started from the title and specific key terms such as Results and Discussion section of the overall data.

3.3.2 Breaking the Clauses

The data were broke down to see the process of each clause (see Table 1) which then narrow down into the specific unit of clause using transitivity analysis of Halliday in SFL approach mainly focused on the participants, process and circumstances of each clause (see Table 2). To distinguish the separation of clause, within the table each of words were colored in different colors; the clause and conjunction (Conj) were colored in black, circumstances divided in two parts (C1 and C2) were colored in blue, the process were colored in red while the all the participants (P1, P2 and P3) were colored in green.

The separation of whole data into the clauses was done as the awareness of the researcher on the sentence complexity might appear in the discussion. To analyze such a complex sentence, (Holmes, 1997) suggested it might be appropriate to adopt an analysis of unit below the level of sentences. This might help the process of identifying the theme changed within each clause as the introduction of a new theme signals the stand of a new move (Ding, 2007).

NO. CLAUSE	CONJUN CTION	ANALYSIS CLAUSE	PROCESS	
PARAGRAPH 1				

RA-1	This study has examined the cognitions and practices of experienced ESL teachers, with a specific focus on the pronunciation oriented techniques used in their courses.	Material
RA-2	One of the main findings is that controlled techniques dominated the knowledge base of pronunciation teaching for all five teachers and that, in terms of pedagogy, of all the techniques used, guided techniques appear to have been used less frequently, even in comparison with free techniques.	relational identifying

Table 3.1: The Analysis of Verb Process of Each Clause

No	Clause	Conj	C1	P1	Process	P2	P3	C2
RA-1	This study has examined the cognitions and practices of experienced ESL teachers, with a specific focus on the pronunciation oriented techniques used in their courses.			This study (actor)	Has examined (material)	the cognitions and practices of experience ESL teachers (goal)		with a specific focus on the pronunciation oriented techniques used in their courses. (matter)
RA-2								

Table 3.2: The Complete Transitivity Analysis

Notes:

Conj	: Conjunction	P2	: Participant 2
C1	: Circumstances 1	P3	: Participant 3
P1	: Participant 1	C2	: Circumstances 2

3.4 Data Analysis Procedures

3.4.1 Identifying the Macro and Micro Moves

The data were all re-read and classified into the main sections; the macro moves and micro moves of the discussions written by the two participants of study. In this study, the researcher used simple definition of macro moves as functional units of text differing lengths which are labeled according to the purpose within text segments and micro move as specific rhetorical means realizing the move functions (Swales, 1990; Ruiying & Allison, 2003; Connor, 2000). In relation to the purpose of study, the researcher adopted explicit and self-explanatory language to name the macro move and micro move to distinguish the purpose and function within the text segments and mainly chose to use V+ing phrases instead of the noun phrases to describe the explicit moves of authors in their Discussion section.

The framework of moves used was based on the existing framework mentioned in previous sections. An attempt to distinguish the distinction between moves and sub moves is believed to be more challenging. It requires reading all the text carefully and keeping track of what writers were trying to accomplish rhetorically (Upton & Cohen, 2009). The function is to be aware of the potential more than one move appears within the single sentence (Ruiying & Allison, 2003). The moves and communicative acts in this study are expressed using the V+ing phrases to show authors intention in presenting their discussion. The extract of analysis provided in Table 3 below.

No. Clause	Clause	Macro Move	Micro Move	Description
RA-1- 1	The study has examined the cognitions and practices of experienced ESL teachers, with a specific focus on the pronunciation oriented techniques used in their courses.	Stating background information of study	Stating the purpose of the studyto examine the cognitions and practices of experienced ESL teachersStating the focus of the studyon the pronunciation oriented techniques used in their course	This purpose is stated in the form of a material process "has examined". The process of examining has "the study" as the actor and the concept being studied "cognition and practices of experienced ESL teachers" as goal of the process examined.

Table 3.3: The Extract of Macro and Micro Moves Analysis

3.4.2 Identifying Moves Occurrences

Despite the criteria in the existing framework, researcher still analyzed the elements of text based on its moves and micro moves to get clear picture of writers' organizations of text by the help of experts. (Holmes, 1997; Basturkmen, 2012). The researcher, then, checked all the moves found within each data and repeatedly reviewed it while also explicitly stated macro and micro move along with the content description of each move occurred. This analysis may clearly show whether the L2 *skripsi* writers (English Education Program students of State University of Jakarta) tend to adopt linguistic and rhetorical manifestation of their first language, or whether they have mostly adopted ways to write scientific texts of English (L1).

No	Macro	Micro	Representation of Micro Moves into the Process					
INU	Moves	Moves	Skripsis	Process	RAs	Process		
1	Stating Backgr ound Inform ation of the Study	Purpose	Х		The study <i>has</i> <i>examined</i> the cognitions and practices of experienced ESL teachers, with a specific focus on the pronunciation oriented techniques used in their courses (RA1-1)	This purpose is stated in the form of a material process "has examined". The process of examining has "the study" as the actor and the concept being studied "cognition and practices of experienced ESL teachers" as goal of the process examined.		

 Table 3.4: Representation of the micro moves into the process

CHAPTER 4

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

4.1 Findings

This chapter presented the results of the analysis of moves of the Discussion section used in the TESOL Journal Articles (RAs) and ED UNJ students' *skripsis* (SKs). The first part of the results analyzed the micro moves of the discussion sections. By analyzing the micro moves, the use of processes (or verb) of each clause were then analyzed to find out following aspects which turned out to be criteria to determine the possible moves that appeared in the RAs and SKs. The short extracts of each move that appeared were discussed. Table 4.1 showed the overall description of all moves used by the writers of SKs and the RAs.

No. Move		RAs			SKs			
Move 1	Stating background information of the study							
	Micro move 1Stating the purpose of the study		\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark			
	Micro Stating the focus of the move 2 study		\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark			
Move 2	Evaluating the research findings							
	Micro- move 1	Stating research findings		\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark
	Micro- move 2Providing evidence of the findings		\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark		
	Micro- move 3Relating findings with previous study		\checkmark		\checkmark			
	Micro- move 4Stating studyclaim of the		\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark		\checkmark	\checkmark

	Micro- move 5	81		\checkmark			\checkmark	
	Micro move 6	8						
	Micro- move 7	8		\checkmark				
Move 3	Stating implication of the study							
	Micro- move 1	Stating suggestions for		\checkmark		\checkmark		
	Micro- move 2	Stating recommendation			\checkmark			

Table 4.1 The moves of the overall discussions

1. Move 1—Stating background information of the study

1.1 Purpose of the study

The analysis results showed the writers of the RAs and the SKs discussions organized their beginning part differently. The RA discussions were realized the micro moves 'stating the purpose of the study" as their first statement of discussion section. In this case, the RAs discussions used the material process signaled by the verb "has examined" and "to investigate" to show the action within the research. The aim of the action was to emphasize the importance of the study that may elaborate in further as the goal of the process.

Skripsis (SKs)	Research Articles (RAs)			
Х	The study <i>has examined</i> the cognitions and practices of experienced ESL teachers, with a specific focus on the pronunciation oriented techniques used in their courses Extract 1(RA1-1)			
Х	The purpose of the current study <i>was to</i> <i>investigate</i> the role of task modeling in attention to question forms during task planning time as well as during task			
performance. Extract 2 (RA2-1)

In the SKs discussions, the move 'stating the purpose of study' were not usual move to start with as it placed the research results in the beginning of their discussions. The beginning part of the clause is crucial because it shows author's major point and its relation to the rest of the text (Halliday, 1994). By pointing out the purpose of study as the first statement of discussion, this may help readers to get an understanding of the whole research. (Swales 1990; Parkinson 2010)

1.2 Focus of the study

Following the statement of purpose, the focus of the study was also appeared in the beginning of the RAs discussion. The material process "focused on" serves to highlight the area or limitation and significance of the study. The realization of this move was likely to appear in the complex sentences. Using the circumstance of manner, another appearance of the focus of study was found to be merged with the statement of the purpose.

Skripsis (SKs)	Research Articles (RAs)
X	with specific focus on the pronunciation oriented techniques used in their courses Extract 3 (RA1-
X	01) The findings provide insights into the linguistic forms learners <i>focused on</i> during planning time and whether attention to form is influenced by viewing modeling videos. Extract 4 (RA2-05)

2. Move 2—Evaluating the study

2.1 Results Statement

In evaluating the study, the authors started out with the micro move 'statement of results' as the beginning of the statement. However, the realization of this move was different in the RAs and SKs in terms of location. In the SKs this move appeared as the beginning of the discussion section while the RAs placed this move after re-stating the background of the study.

The characteristic of the process used in this move were the mental and relational processes. In realizing this move, the SKs tended to use the mental process with the dominant predicators "found" or "was/were found" that has five occurrences within. The process of finding carried the phenomena under the study that was gained during the observation or analysis by the researchers. The phenomena of the findings' process were then stated mostly using material process to emphasize the process of doing by the actors such as 'the teachers' and 'the students' behavior during the study using the verb "used", "did not mention", "did not realize", "did follow up". Further explanation of the process discussed on Appendix C.

Skripsis (SKs)	Research Articles (RAs)
From the findings, it <i>was found</i> that	Also, many concrete instances were
the teacher implemented the authentic	found among the MG in which they

assessment techniques of discussion and conversation, story retelling, portfolios, project, writing sample, and presentation to assess students. Extract 8 (SK1-01)	processed task input to foster output opportunities (Extract 10 (RA2-19)
Based on the finding, it <i>was found</i> that students initiated the interaction by questioning, stating statement, commanding and offering but unfortunately it was mostly done in bahasa Indonesia. Extract 9 (SK2-06)	Specifically the Singaporean raters <i>were</i> able to pay sufficient attention to lexicogrammar information-the extent to which the Japanese learners selected conceptually and contextually appropriate vocabulary items and delivered them using correct grammatical forms. Extract 11 (RA3-28)

As for the RAs, this move was stated using the process of relational identifying with the verb "was, were, and is" to bring out the results as the identifier. In line with the SKs, the RAs also identified their specific result using the material process such as "produced" "able" that focused to the action of the actors during the study analysis. However, as illustrated in below extract, the RAs tend to be straightforward in stating their results by pointing out the phenomena of the study and the actors who did the phenomena of the study using the nouns and nominal groups (many concrete instances; Singaporean raters) instead of using the pronouns (it).

2.2 Evidence

From the analysis results, although the SKs provided the statement of results as its obligatory moves, the micro moves 'evidence' was not realized in the their discussions. This finding was contradictory with the RA discussions that mostly realized this move after stating their results. Using the process of material, the predicators "demonstrated" and "used" were frequently seen in the statement of evidence to show the activity that is going on after stating the results of the study. For instance, in the first illustration the process of demonstrating was oriented towards the beliefs and practices of the actor that established 'considerable value on techniques' as the goal of process. This clause construed the proof in the development of the learner pronunciation as the results. Also, in the second illustration, the focus was on the process of 'using' which 'the MG' as the actors established 'the task input and plan for task performance' during the observation that refers to the process of the results. By means of the move, this was aimed to strengthen the statement of results that has been discussed before.

Skripsis (SKs)	Research Articles (RAs)
X	The beliefs and practices of both Ginger and Abby <i>demonstrated</i> that they placed considerable value on techniques involving physical movement in order to improve learner pronunciation. Extract 14 (RA1-38- 39)
X	In example 5, the learner from the MG often <i>used</i> Korean to process task input and plan for task performance (lines 1-4) Extract 15 (RA2-25)

2.3 Relating Previous study to the Present Study

In this micro move, two occurrences of moves were realized in the SKs discussion by using similar process as the RAs. The process of relational attributive was mostly used in both SKs and RAs discussions with the verb "to be"; "is, are, and concur". The process of relating frequently used the adjective "opposite, similar, in line" as the attribute of the process to emphasize the similarity or difference between the present findings in relation to the previous research findings. From its function, this move intended to acknowledge the gap or phenomena under the study as additional knowledge for the readers. In the discussions of SKs and RAs, this move was placed before constructing the author's arguments regarding the study.

Skripsis (SKs)	Research Articles (RAs)
It <i>is</i> opposite with Cazden (1988) that claimed students rarely asked question to the teacher except for procedures and admission. Extract 16 (SK2-10)	These findings <i>are</i> in line with several previous learner interaction studies that have highlighted the benefits of learning opportunities (e.g., LREs, FFEs) on L2 development (e.g., Kim, in press; McDonough, 2004; Swain & Lapkin, 1998). Extract 18 (RA3-35)
Based on questionnaire and the interview result which <i>is</i> in accordance with Sultana (2009) (sic) found out that the students are hesitant to give written feedback to their peers since they are in the same level and still have imperfection in their works. Extract 17 (SK3-38)	The results presented here <i>concur</i> with previous research evidence that L2 speech assessment can be somewhat subject to raters' individual variability, such as familiarity with L2 accents (e.g., Bradlow & Bent, 2008; Isaac & Thomson, 2013; Kennedy & Trofimovich, 2008; Winke et al., 2013). (RA3-39) Extract 19 (RA2-21)

As has been discussed in the literature, presenting the author's claim is one of the goals of writing discussion section. The author may begin by pointing to (displaying/showing/presenting/giving) and explaining the data in such a way that demonstrates to the reader that it amounts to (shows/demonstrates/means/confirms) and prove the knowledge claim (Parkinson, 2010).

From the results, this move was found to be obligatory moves as it appearance reached 90% of occurrences (Moritz, Meurer, & Dellagnelo, 2008). Stating the claim of the study, the main types of process used by the SKs were mental and verbal process with the most dominant predicators "shows" and "seems" with the pronoun "it" as the head noun. The process of showing and seeming focused on the participants' behavior during the observation or analysis. Therefore, the claim that presented by the authors generalized their interpretation of the development of the participant.

Skripsis (SKs)	Research Articles (RAs)
It <i>seems</i> the cause that the students did not have confident to deliver their curiosity and wish in English. Extract 21 (SK2-43)	This research <i>indicates</i> that guided practice (such as information-gap activities involving a two-way exchange of information that provide the learner with opportunities to monitor their use of target features) is an important component in the development of comprehensible pronunciation. Extract 22 (RA1-20-21) It <i>seemed to be</i> the case that learners who were able to watch a video that modeled
	were able to watch a video that modeled

for them how to carry out a meaning task
and also focus on linguistic resources
before planning were better set up to think
about what and how to plan for their
upcoming tasks. (RA2-35) Extract 23
(RA2-21)

As for the RA discussions, the claim presented tended to generalize the knowledge got the following results. In most claim of the RAs, the use of adjective were found such as 'important' and 'better' to state the positive input found as the argument for the study. By pointing out the argument, the author tried to stress their contribution or thought which expected to be a new knowledge for the field of the study based on the real findings found in the study. This kind of claim was categorized as having a strong claim because it has relation to the previous study results that has also been proved by several evidences in further clauses (Parkinson, 2011).

2.5 Previous Study of the Claim

As has been discussed in the literature, the writers must use a range of persuasive means to create their own claim to be accepted by the readers (Hyland 1996). Thus, the claim needs to involve several proofs that might construe the strong claim that one of them is the previous study results. Parkinson (2011) indicated that "...a strong claim actually refers to a results already published in the literature." However, from the analysis results, this move was uncommon to be used by the SK discussions with only three occurrences found. In the SKs discussions, the mental process with the verb "is believed" and "is considered". Using the passive voice to stress the phenomenon of the study, the SKs did not present the reference that supposed to be the actors who sense the phenomenon. This confusion may lead the readers to question whether the statement was being quoted from research or just believed by the authors itself. Another processes used material process "should give" to present the additional knowledge about authentic assessment need to be considered regarding the material used for teaching and learning process from the past research.

Skripsis (SKs)	Research Articles (RAs)
First, it <i>is believed</i> that students' initiating moves play a crucial role in promoting learning. Extract 5 (SK2-02)	Research <i>has shown</i> that the use of communicative activities involving dyadic interaction has the potential for greater impact on learner uptake and automatic use of targeted features of pronunciation than focus-on-form instruction alone (Saito & Lyster, 2012). Extract 25 (RA1-16-17)
Students' initiating moves as a part of classroom interaction <i>is considered</i> as an important factor in generating learning opportunities. Extract 6 (SK2-04)	Recently, a growing number of interaction studies <i>have suggested</i> that learners can be trained to become better interactors/feedback providers (e.g., Sato & Lyster, in press). Extract 7 (RA2-11)
Moreover, as a supporting for making procedure text, the materials given <i>should give</i> learners the opportunity to examine the problem from a variety of theoretical and practical perspectives, rather than giving a single perspective to be imitated by the students (Thomas, 2014). Extract 24 (SK1-85)	

Meanwhile in RAs discussions, the move 'stating previous study to support the claim' is categorized as the most widespread moves with 13 occurrences. This move always placed after the statement of claim is stated. The verbal process was frequently used to represent the previous study on claim with predicators "suggests" and "shows" to point out the report of the effectiveness and assumptions as the findings from the previous study using the adjective 'greater impact' and 'better'. In general, this move was intended to report additional thought or insight on the phenomena under the study by referring it to the current knowledge.

2.6 Evidence of the Claim

Following the statement of the claim, the evidence which based on the findings or analysis of the researcher or present research is also needed to strengthen their claim (Parkinson, 2011).

From the results, the SKs discussions did not make this move as their part of the discussion. In contrast, the RAs discussions presented this move after stating the claim of the study which stated in using the process of material process with the verb "provided", verbal "confirmed" and relational attributive "advanced to". As illustrated in below example, the process of providing brings out the method of analysis of the study as the actor of the process to give the evidence of the claim.

Skripsis (SKs)	Research Articles (RAs)
X	The process of investigation <i>confirmed</i> that teachers' self-reports of their beliefs, knowledge, and practices are limited in providing a sufficiently accurate and elaborated picture of teachers' cognitions, especially in representing their knowledge of pronunciation-
	oriented techniques. Extract 26 (RA1- 55-57)
X	For example, in representing their knowledge of pronunciation-oriented techniques, the interview and observation data frequently <i>provided</i> complementary information, with each source of data supplying information that the other did not. Extract 27 (RA1-
	58)

2.7 Limitation

The statement of limitation is mostly appeared in the move frameworks proposed by several researchers. However, from the result of analysis, this move was appeared to be optional move. The objective of this move is to give insight to the future researcher about some limitation in conducting the study. This might contain of several consideration need to understand by the researchers before conducting the research. From the results, even though this move is stated in the move frameworks, all of the SKs discussions did not use this move while writing their discussions. The RAs discussions were also found to not use this move commonly. Only one discussion found to use this and gave fourth limitation to the future study regarding the research being conducted. The processes used to present this move are varied; mental process "needs to be considered", relational attributive "is", material process, and verbal process "might argue". As for the process of considering, the aim of the process is to emphasize the possible problem that may happen during the research and specific detail need to be the priority to consider.

Skripsis (SKs)	Research Articles (RAs)
	First as addressed previously, although think-alouds have been used as a methodological tool to gain insight into L2 learners' cognitive processes, the validity of using think- alouds as a research tool <i>needs to be</i> <i>considered</i> when interpreting the results. Extract 28 (RA2-88)
	A second important caution <i>is</i> related to interpreting the acquisition of question formation. Extract 29 (RA2-98)

3. Move **3**—Implicating the study

3.1 Suggestions for Field of the Study

This move was used to place authors' suggestion to the development of the field of study being researched. The development should focus more on the concept or method being used to benefit the participant of the study. In the discussions of this study, both data used this move to give their thought over the development of the field of study with different target to be developed. In the SKs discussion, the material process was used with the modal verb "needs to provide' and 'needs to make' showed the authors' wants to bring out their suggestion to the development of the participant of the study such as 'the teacher' and 'students'.

Skripsis (SKs)	Research Articles (RAs)
While conducting story retelling assessment technique, the teacher <i>needs to provide</i> a rubric Extract 30 (SK1-15)	thus, one implication of this study's findings <i>is</i> that providing a concrete guide such as a task modeling video may be beneficial to young EFL learners. Extract 32 (RA2-77)
In conducting the presentation, the teacher <i>needs to make</i> a briefing session before conducting the presentation. Extract 31 (SK1-55)	Our study <i>adds</i> that such raters' leniency per se can be attributed to their ability to sufficiently attend not only to main cues—pronunciation and fluency-but also to secondary cues- vocabulary and grammar—in making L2 comprehensibility judgments. Extract 33 (RA3-42)

Meanwhile, the RAs discussion generally used the relational attributive process 'is' and 'adds' in which the attribute of this clause explained the variables of study or the concept or method of study as the implication of the study. The statements of implication provided were linked with the results statements that also have been presented by several proofs such as the evidence and previous study related. In addition, this move acknowledged as the conclusion of the study's purpose and focus that carries the results.

3.2 Recommendation

The author realized the move 3—implicating the study by realizing the micro moves "recommendation". Characteristic of this move was the time orientation that oriented towards the future since this move aimed to tell the readers what to be done next in that particular field. From the results, the SKs discussions were not used this move as part of their discussion. The statement of recommendation was not common as they focused more on giving the suggestion for the future study. However, the RAs discussions were using this move on each. The material process with the predicators "determine" and "are warranted" were frequently used. The process of recommending linked the relation between the 'future study' as the actor and the goal as the new area of the study considered to be analyzed.

Skripsis (SKs)	Research Articles (RAs)
X	That said, future research still <i>needs to</i> <i>determine</i> the degree to which controlled techniques should be coupled with guided techniques to enhance learner comprehensibility for use in free activities or outside the classroom. Extract 35 (RA1-27-28)
X	Future studies that employ an even wider variety of evidence of language learning development targeting various structures <i>are</i> certainly <i>warranted</i> , for example, using measures of accuracy

or other measures of inter-language
emergence. Extract 36 (RA2-100)

A considerable variation of both data also revealed the range of number of words used and frequency of moves as additional information from the structural analysis of the data. The significant difference in organizing the discussion of the SKs in regard to RAs may cause by the range of the number of words written by both writers. In SKs, word variation ranged from 542 to 1076 coming to an average number of 793 words. Whereas the RAs the average number of words is 1293.67. Sentences in SKs also varied from 27 to 40 sentences with an average number 33.33 compared to 42.67. As can be noticed from the variation of the words, both data presented differences in elaborating the discussions and the distribution of it into sentences. This might impact the recurrences of the moves which will discuss further. The list number of variation is provided in Table 4.2 below.

Data	Total number of words	Total number of sentences		
RA 1	1122	41		
RA 2	1756	61		
RA 3	1003	26		
SK 1	1076	40		
SK 2	542	27		
SK 3	763	33		

Table 4.2 Number of Words and Sentences of Discussions

From the analysis, there were two most widespread of micro moves *Results Statement* and *Claim* that appeared in 100% of data but realized differently in the SKs and RAs discussions. The result of the appearance of the claim is in line with Peacock (2002) findings that proved its appearance in 90% of all RAs of seven disciplines discussions which can be categorized as an obligatory move. By pointing out the statement of claim, it was clear that the discussions written stress the new perspectives in the field (Hess, 2004). The moves 'result statement' were also indicated as the obligatory moves with above 90% appearance in Yang and Allison (2013) study.

As for the micro moves '*stating the claim*', a number of occurrences of the RAs were more significant compared to the SKs. The few occurrence of claim in the SKs found were also impact the following moves that supported the claim such as 'evidence' and 'previous study related to the claim' that were categorized as quasi-obligatory moves.

In relation to the results with the literature, not all the moves provided in the moves framework that proposed by the researchers described the structure of the Discussion sections. The findings in this results have shown while the occurrence and recycling of the most frequent Moves in the Discussion sections in this corpus is consistent with the findings of previous studies (Swales (1990), Yang & Allison (2013), and Gruber and Huemer (2008), some important differences exist in the framework of analysis over the element of each move. This indicated the structure of discussion section is quiet concise but detail in elaborating the main purpose.

4.2 Discussion

The purpose of the current study was to investigate the moves structures of the discussions section of the *Skripsis* and the Research Articles in particular attention to the process of each clause to realize the moves. The findings provided insights into the function of language used in micro level of text. One of the main findings was even though the structures of move framework by the previous researchers were mostly presented by the RAs and SKs discussions in a same way, in terms of elaborating the major moves, there were still several moves that did not realize by the SKs.

Another main finding is the gaps between both discussions in construing the moves. The beginning moves of the RAs and SKs were started in different way, the RAs used the 'statement of purpose' and 'focus of the study' as their first statement which means to emphasize the importance part of the study that was going to be discussed in further. Differ from SKs that tend to be straight in stating their results of the study as their focus to be discussed. It indicates that the SKs discussions just focused on explaining their several results found to put their contribution or interpretation over it while the RAs tried to make a clear relation between what they were going to find out and the explanation of the results.

The other moves were the 'evidence of the claim' and 'relation of it to the previous study'. From the results of the RAs discussion, these two moves categorized as quasi-obligatory moves. Meanwhile in the SKs discussions, there was no evidence found within the text. The absence of the evidence showed the author's tentative conclusion which is not convincing enough to contribute to the present knowledge on its field (Parkinson 2010; Safnil 2013). This was due to the role of presenting evidence to direct the readers' thought process of the claim presented and their understanding on how authors' primary and secondary findings fit with what is already known as well as challenge and/or extend scientific knowledge (Drotar, 2009).

As has been mentioned in the results, even though both data presented 'result statement' and 'claim' as the obligatory moves, the number of occurrences in the SKs discussions were significantly different with the RAs. Many of occurrences of 'result statement' moves in the SKs discussions were found in above than ten occurrences. The main reason to this finding was due to the author's wants to give the possible answer of each research questions they presented. This results is opposite with the suggestion of some researchers stated "...there should be a selection of significant or remarkable findings found to be discussed". (Fisher, Jansen, Johnson, & Mikos, 2006, p. 4). In other words, there is no need to discuss all the findings found in the results but only the most important one which means a finding that has further explanation in order to make readers understand the situation.

However, Drotar (2009) considered it as a common mistake that authors usually made. Researchers believed that discussion section should function as a place in which further explanation of some remarkable findings found in the Results section that can make a contribution to the understanding of the field (Bem, 2003; Drotar, 2009). This mistake was somehow unavoidable as the unusual or unexpected findings found to be discussed can be subjective things which may depend on the needs of authors and readers itself.

As Peacock (2002) noted the moves "presenting previous study" either on 'claim' or 'results statements' functions as a way to persuade readers of the validity of their data and conclusion. From the results, it was found that the SKs tend to make the conclusion after describing the findings or claim with a few of references to the previous study. With the significant difference in the occurrences of the moves "presenting previous study" with the RAs discussions which ten occurrences was found compared to three occurrences, it indicates that the SKs writers spent much time in explaining their own conclusion rather than referring to the results of others. The absence of logical descriptions and proof over the interpretation given is incompatible with the belief of several researchers. Those several researchers claimed that the writers need to consider providing possible explanation on any new insight in order to make strong proof which beyond the data. (Bem, 2003; Drotar, 2009; Hess, 2004). This findings was also in line with Safnil (2013) study that have found the majority of Indonesian authors only focused in the key terms and concepts in their literature review than gave the relevant gap to support their research ideas.

A follow up analysis on the micro moves presented in both of discussions showed that the micro moves 'recommendations' and 'limitation of the study' were categorized as optional moves as it has the least occurrences in the discussion sections differ from the moves 'suggestion for the field of study' which appeared in most. In particular to SKs discussions, giving recommendation is still less common because the writers tend to separate their sub-heading of it rather than merge it into one heading. Holmes (1997) who investigated Indonesian discussion writing found that they prefer combining conclusion section with recommendation and sub "conclusion given as and recommendation" rather than writing it in discussion section. Also, the statement of limitation in SKs discussions were mostly stated in the Introduction part rather than in Discussion. Meanwhile, the moves 'suggestion for the field of study' was stated in the SKs discussions with the high occurrences as a mean to suggest the development of the participant of study such as the role of teacher and the students to be more active in teaching and learning process. Besides, the RAs discussions focused on suggesting the development of the concept being studied as stated in their purpose at the beginning discussions.

The last analysis in this study pointed out the processes of each clause presented in the discussion based on SFL approach in order to see how micro moves realized into the sentences. In English transitivity system, material and relational processes were considered as the main parts of processes used (Halliday, 2004). In the SKs discussion, those processes were indeed meet the way SK students write their discussions as the focus was the participant that involved in their study. However, as shown in the findings of RAs, even though material and relational processes were frequently used to stress the participant's development in the field of study, the mental and verbal process was also has a great role particularly in making readers accept the claim or suggestions of the study by providing a strong proof (evidence and previous study). This finding indicated that there were no constantly processes that used in writing discussions.

In addition, the most important part of this research was to look deeply into the verb used within the mental process that may express different interpretation of the authors. As also mentioned in Parkinson's study (2010) that the use of different verb of mental process might insight into reasoning process which is important in leading the readers along with the author's argument. Therefore, the implication of this study leads to the understanding of SFL that brings out author's additional thought into the verb and its process along with the moves in writing discussions section. This was due to the needs to support the own claim by leading the readers to considered the data and suggested the data itself by carefully looking into the choice of verb in construing argument or claim particularly in writing the discussion section.

CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

5.1 Conclusion

The results of this study have shown with examples that the discussion section of ED UNJ students' *skripsis* and TESOL Journal articles are having several gaps as well as similarities in some ways. The first gap particularly occurred in the structures of moves which appear to signal that the RAs discussions were constantly developed each topic or purpose of the study until making the implication of the study in a clear organization structure. Differ from the SKs that started out by discussing the findings found from the results as the topic to be developed in further. Therefore, there were several moves that believed by researchers (Swales (1990), Parkinson (2010), Yang and Allison (2013) and Huemer and Gruber (2008) to be the major moves did not present by the SKs.

The second gap was that unlike the RAs discussions which made their judgments followed by the evidence or support that found in the data, the majority of SKs attempt to justify their interpretation based on their own opinions which then lead them to generate biases. The existence of the gap in both discussions portrayed the writers in this present study to not seem to be influenced by style of writing of English native.

Another finding was the process and verb used to sign the moves. The findings found that no constant process was used in writing discussion section. The extract from the analysis showed varied process used in realizing several moves such as: *stating purpose, stating the results, presenting the claim and the evidence.*

In addition, both data are having the same occurrences in presenting micro moves *claim* and *research statement* that occurred in more than 90% of data which so-called obligatory moves.

5.2 Recommendation

The researcher aimed this research as a needs analysis to the students of English Department of State University of Jakarta in the field of academic writing with an understanding of moves in SFL approach as the focus of the study. As suggested by Silva (2010) that L2 writing teachers must cope with discourse demands so that their pieces of writing get more credibility in academic settings. In this field of study, the SFL approaches may also be another way to analyze move to get to know better the relation between language and its function within the text. Further research is necessary to find out the effectiveness of using SFL approach in classroom settings as the approach to support

learning academic writing for students. Also, expand this research to get applicable generalization regarding the moves of the novice writers in writing their *skripsis* in regards to the moves from the researchers of journal articles by using more adequate data to be analyzed.

References

- Basturkmen, H. (2012). A genre-based investigation of discussion sections of research articles in Dentistry and disciplinary variation. *English for Specific Purposes*, 134-144.
- Bem, D. J. (2003). Writing the Empirical Journal Article. In J. M. Darley, *The Compleat Academic: A Practical Guide for the Beginning Social Scientist, 2nd Edition.* (pp. 1-20). Washington, DC: American Psychological Association.
- Bhatia, V. K. (2002). Applied genre analysis: a multi-perspective model. IBÉRICA4, 3-19.
- Bruce, I. (2009). Results sections in sociology and organic chemistry articles: A genre analysis. *English for Specific Purposes*, 105–124.
- Chang, P., & Schleppegrell, M. (2011). Taking an Effective Authorial Stance in Academic Writing: Making the Linguistic Resources Explicit for L2 Writers in the Social Sciences . *Journal of English for Academic Purposes*, 140-151.
- Christie, F. (Winter 1999). Genre Theory and ESL Teaching: A Systemic Functional Perspective. *TESOL Quarterly*, Vol. 33, No. 4 759-763.
- Connor, U. (2000). Variation in rhetorical moves in grant proposals of US humanists and scientists . pp.1-28.
- Ding, H. (2007). Genre analysis of personal statements: Analysis of moves in application essays to medical and dental school. *English for Specific Purposes*, 368-392.
- Donohue, J. P. (2012). Using systemic functional linguistics in academic writing development: An example fromfilm studies. *Journal of English for Academic Purposes*, V.11 4–16.
- Drotar, D. (2009). Editorial: How to Write an Effective Results and Discussion . *Journal of Pediatric Psychology*, vol.34 no.4. 340-343.
- Fisher, J. P., Jansen, J. A., Johnson, P. C., & Mikos, A. G. (2006). Guidelines for writing a research paper for publication. *Marry Ann Libert.Inc*.
- Graf, J. (2008). Handbook of Biomedical Research Writing: The Results and Discussion Section. Version 1. 1-19.
- Gruber, H., & Huemer, B. (2008). Two Views on Text Structure: Using Rhetorical Structure Theory and Regiter and Genre Theory in Improving Students' Academic Writing . *Systemic Functional Linguistics in Use*.

- Halleck, G. B., & Connor, U. (2006). Rhetorical moves in TESOL conference proposals. *English for Specific Purposes*, 70-86.
- Halliday, M. A. (2004). *Introduction to Functional Grammar (3rd edition)*. Great Britain: Oxford University Press.
- Hess, D. R. (2004). How to Write an Effective Discussion. Vol.49 No10 1238-1241.
- Holmes, R. (1997). Genre Analysis, and the Social Sciences: An Investigation of the Structure of Research Article Discussion Sections in Three Disciplines. *English for* Specific Purpose, Vol. 16, No. 4, pp. 321-337.
- Hopkins, A., & Evans, T. D. (1988). A Genre-based Investigation of the Discussion Sections in Articles and Dissertations . *English for Specific Purposes*, Vol.7, pp. 113-121.
- Hyon, S. (1996). Genre in Three Traditions: Implications for ESL. *TESOL Quarterly*, Vol. 30, No. 4, pp. 693-722.
- Krippendorff, K. (2004). *Content Analysis An Introduction to Its Methodology*. London: SAGE Publications.
- Lazarton, A. (2009). Qualitative Research in Applied Linguistics: A Progress Report. *TESOL Quarterly*, 455-472.
- Martin, J. R. (2002). Meaning Beyond the Clause: SFL Perspectives. In *Annual Review' of Applied Linguistic* (pp. 22, 52-74). USA: Cambridge University Press.
- Moritz, M. E., Meurer, J. L., & Dellagnelo, A. K. (2008). Conclusion as Components of Research Articles Across Portuguese as a Native Language, English as a Native Language and English as a Foreign Language: A Contrastive Genre Study. *the ESPecialist*, 233-252.
- Parkinson, J. (2011). The Discussion section as argument: The language used to prove knowledge claim. *English for Specific Purposes*, 164-175.
- Paul, K. (2003). Fourteen Steps to Writing an Effective Discussion Section. San Fransisco Edit.
- Peacock, M. (2002). Communicative moves in the discussion section of research articles. *System*, System 30 479–497.
- Ruiying, Y., & Allison, D. (2003). Research articles in applied linguistics: moving from results to conclusion. *English for Specific Purposes*, 22, 365-385.
- Sadeghi, V., & Samuel, M. (2013). Genre analysis of the letters of appeal. *Discourse Studies SAGE*, 15(2) pp.229–245.
- Safnil. (2000). *Rhetorical Structure Analysis of Indonesian Research Articles*. Australia: Australian National University.

- Safnil. (2013). A Genre-Based Analysis on the Introductions of Research Articles Written by Indonesian Academics. *TEFLIN Journal*, 180-200.
- Sandelowski, M. (2000). Whatever Happened to Qualitative Description? 23, 334-340.
- Swales, J. (1990). *Genre Analysis: English in academic and research setting*. Cambridge University Press.
- Upton, T. A., & Cohen, M. A. (2009). An approach to corpus-based discourse analysis: The move analysis as example. *Sage Publications*, Vol 11(5): 585–605.

Analysis Clause 1 RA-1 Exploring Teachers' Knowledge of Second Language Pronunciation Techniques: Teacher Cognitions, Observed Classroom Practices, and Student Perceptions AMANDA BAKER									
NO. CLAUSE	CONJ.	ANALYSIS CLAUSE	PROCESS						
PARAGRAPH 1									
RA-1		This study has examined the cognitions and practices of experienced ESL teachers, with a specific focus on the pronunciation oriented techniques used in their courses.	material						
RA-2		One of the main findings is that controlled techniques dominated the knowledge base of pronunciation teaching for all five teachers and that, in terms of pedagogy, of all the techniques used, guided techniques appear to have been used less frequently, even in comparison with free techniques.	relational identifying						
RA-3	that	controlled techniques dominated the knowledge base of pronunciation teaching for all five teachers	relational attributive						
RA-4	and that	in terms of pedagogy, of all the techniques used, guided techniques appear to have been used less frequently, even in comparison with free techniques.	mental						
RA-5		to have been used less frequently, even in comparison with free techniques.	material						
RA-6		From a historical perspective, these findings are not surprising.	relational attributive						
RA-7		For centuries, pronunciation pedagogy was considered synonymous with imitative intuitive and analytic-linguistic approaches in which controlled techniques formed the foundational core of teaching.	relational attributive						
RA-8		Although the traditional approaches to pronunciation teaching are criticized in today's communicative era, many of these controlled techniques continue to be valued, as demonstrated by their use by experienced teachers in the present study.	relational attributive						
RA-9	Although	the traditional approaches to pronunciation teaching are criticized in today's communicative era	mental						
RA-10	as	demonstrated by their use by experienced teachers in the present study.	material						
RA-11		In fact, the widespread use of controlled techniques in the five teachers' classrooms is, to a certain degree, advantageous to learners.	relational attributive						

RA-12		Research has demonstrated that controlled techniques can have a positive impact on the development of learner intelligibility (e.g., Couper, 2003; Derwing et al., 1998) or on phonological improvement (e.g., Saito, 2007).	verbal
RA-13		controlled techniques can have a positive impact on the development of learner intelligibility (e.g., Couper, 2003; Derwing et al., 1998) or on phonological improvement (e.g., Saito, 2007).	relational possessive
		PARAGRAPH 2	
RA-14		The dominance of controlled techniques in the classroom might nevertheless raise some concerns.	mental
RA-15		The less frequent use of guided (semicontrolled) or free techniques may limit the potential development of comprehensible learner pronunciation in authentic conversations.	material
RA-16		Research has shown that the use of communicative activities involving dyadic interaction has the potential for greater impact on learner uptake and automatic use of targeted features of pronunciation than focus-on-form instruction alone (Saito & Lyster, 2012).	verbal
RA-17		the use of communicative activities involving dyadic interaction has the potential for greater impact on learner uptake and automatic use of targeted features of pronunciation than focus-on-form instruction alone (Saito & Lyster, 2012).	relational attributive
RA-18	Furthermore,	recent research suggests that with grammar-oriented focus on form the combined use of controlled activities with communicative activities can have a stronger positive impact on learner retention and automatization of grammatical structures than the use of mechanical activities or drills alone (Khatib & Nikouee, 2012).	verbal
RA-19		the combined use of controlled activities with communicative activities can have a stronger positive impact on learner retention and automatization of grammatical structures than the use of mechanical activities or drills alone (Khatib & Nikouee, 2012).	relational possessive
RA-20		This research indicates that guided practice (such as information-gap activities involving a two-way exchange of information that provide the learner with opportunities to monitor their use of target features) is an important component in the development of comprehensible pronunciation.	verbal

RA-21		guided practice (such as information-gap activities involving a two-way exchange of information that provide the learner with opportunities to monitor their use of target features) is an important component in the development of comprehensible pronunciation.	relational attributive
RA-22		In the present study, although all five teachers used guided techniques in addition to controlled techniques, the use of guided techniques was limited.	relational attributive
RA-23	although	all five teachers used guided techniques in addition to controlled techniques	material
RA-24		This suggests that even though four of the teachers received training in pronunciation pedagogy, their knowledge base of guided techniques and of how to integrate them effectively into lessons may have needed further development.	verbal
RA-25		even though four of the teachers received training in pronunciation pedagogy, their knowledge base of guided techniques and of how to integrate them effectively into lessons may have needed further development.	material
RA-26	that even though	four of the teachers received training in pronunciation pedagogy	material
RA-27		That said, future research still needs to determine the degree to which controlled techniques should be coupled with guided techniques to enhance learner comprehensibility for use in free activities or outside the classroom.	verbal
RA-28		future research still needs to determine the degree to which controlled techniques should be coupled with guided techniques to enhance learner comprehensibility for use in free activities or outside the classroom.	mental
		PARAGRAPH 3	
RA-29		Shifting to the examination of teachers' cognitions with their actual practices, the second half of the study focused more specifically on three beliefs that emerged from the data.	mental
RA-30	First,	the two teachers of lower level students shared the belief that listening discrimination activities formed an important initial step to achieving successful phonological production.	relational possessive
RA-31		This belief was reflected in their use of numerous listening discrimination activities in their OC classes, thereby demonstrating a strong connection between their beliefs and practice.	relational attributive
RA-32	thereby	demonstrating a strong connection between their beliefs and practice.	relational attributive

RA-33		Their beliefs are furthermore supported by research that has demonstrated a positive connection between training in listening perception and enhanced phonetic production (Bradlow, Pisoni, Yamada, & Tohkura, 1997) and that has suggested that phonological improvement is maintained over long periods of time (Bradlow, AkahaneYamada, Pisoni, & Tohkura, 1999).	relational attributive
RA-34		The teachers' beliefs and practices, grounded in empirical research, suggest that the two teachers appeared to be providing students with the initial building blocks required to improve the comprehensibility of their speech.	verbal
RA-35	that	the two teachers appeared to be providing students with the initial building blocks required to improve the comprehensibility of their speech.	relational attributive
RA-36		to be providing students with the initial building blocks required to improve the comprehensibility of their speech.	material
		PARAGRAPH 4	
RA-37		The second set of beliefs shared by the two teachers of intermediate-level learners emphasized the importance of kinesthetic/tactile teaching for improving learner pronunciation.	relational attributive
RA-38		The beliefs and practices of both Ginger and Abby demonstrated that they placed considerable value on techniques involving physical movement in order to improve learner pronunciation.	verbal
RA-39	that	they placed considerable value on techniques involving physical movement in order to improve learner pronunciation.	mental
RA-40		These beliefs are shared by other specialists in the field who recommend the use of physical movement and/or gesture in pronunciation work (e.g., Acton, 1984, 2001; CelceMurcia et al., 2010; Gilbert, 1991; Graham, 1986; Murphy, 2004).	relational possessive
RA-41		Although empirical research has yet to be conducted on the impact of kinesthetic/tactile techniques on pronunciation learning, the use of these techniques has frequently been employed not only in ESL education (e.g., Asher, 2000), but in voice training as well (e.g., Hardison & Sonchaeng, 2005).	material
RA-42	Although	empirical research has yet to be conducted on the impact of kinesthetic/tactile techniques on pronunciation learning	material

RA-43	Nevertheless,	more research is needed to determine the effectiveness of using kinesthetic/tactile techniques to enhance learner comprehensibility.	relational possessive
RA-44		to determine the effectiveness of using kinesthetic/tactile techniques to enhance learner comprehensibility.	mental
RA-45		The third belief—a concern that pronunciation instruction can be boring—was shared by the two teachers whose courses were more textbook driven than the others.	relational possessive
RA-46		One reason for this belief may be the result of what Prabhu (1992) refers to as overroutinisation.	relational intensive identifier
RA-47		Because textbooks regularly use the same techniques from one unit to the next, the teachers' concern over the potential tedium associated with the pronunciation components of their lessons may have derived from the overroutinisation of techniques in their courses.	relational circumstancial
RA-48	Because	textbooks regularly use the same techniques from one unit to the next,	material
RA-49		In the case of Tanya, whose course was devoted almost entirely to pronunciation, the frequent use of similar techniques likely resulted in her perception that her lessons may be boring, despite the time and effort she spent devising additional activities to provide a certain zest to her lessons.	mental
RA-50	that	her lessons may be boring, despite the time and effort she spent devising additional activities to provide a certain zest to her lessons.	relational attributive
RA-51		In the case of Vala, another potential reason for this concern with boredom could be her lack of training in pronunciation pedagogy.	relational intensive identifying
RA-52	As	Vala noted, her lack of education frequently led to the use of the same few techniques in the limited amount of time that she allotted to pronunciation instruction.	verbal
RA-53		As Vala noted, her lack of education frequently led to the use of the same few techniques in the limited amount of time that she allotted to pronunciation instruction.	relational circumstancial
		PARAGRAPH 5	
RA-54	Finally	one of the study's major findings relates not so much to the specific area of pronunciation pedagogy as to the study of teachers' cognitions in general.	relational attributive

RA-55		The process of investigation confirmed that teachers' self-reports of their beliefs, knowledge, and practices are limited in providing a sufficiently accurate and elaborated picture of teachers' cognitions, especially in representing their knowledge of pronunciation-oriented techniques.	verbal
RA-56		teachers' self-reports of their beliefs, knowledge, and practices are limited in providing a sufficiently accurate and elaborated picture of teachers' cognitions, especially in representing their knowledge of pronunciation-oriented techniques.	relational attributive
RA-57	in	providing a sufficiently accurate and elaborated picture of teachers' cognitions, especially in representing their knowledge of pronunciation-oriented techniques.	material
RA-58	For example,	in representing their knowledge of pronunciation-oriented techniques, the interview and observation data frequently provided complementary information, with each source of data supplying information that the other did not.	material
RA-59		Only through the combination of teachers' self-reports and classroom observations, and further supported by student reports, can a sufficiently detailed picture be produced .	material
RA-60		As advocated by Borg (2003), studies of teachers' cognitions require an examination of teachers' actual pedagogical practices.	relational attributive
RA-61	As	advocated by Borg (2003)	verbal
RA-62		Without the inclusion of observed practice, cognitions that are implicit remain hidden from view	relational attributive
RA-63	Likewise,	classroom practices alone cannot reveal the rationale underlying teachers' decision making in the classroom, especially in determining how various contextual factors might influence teachers' cognitions (Burns, 1996).	mental
RA-64	Ultimately,	teachers' cognitions and classroom practices are mutually shaped	material
RA-65	and	informed	material
RA-66	but	are also transformed	material
RA-67	and	molded by additional contextual variables, such as curriculum and the learners themselves.	material

	Analysis Clause 2 RA-1 Exploring Teachers' Knowledge of Second Language Pronunciation Techniques: Teacher Cognitions, Observed Classroom Practices, and Student Perceptions AMANDA BAKER									
No	Clause	Conj	C1	P1	Process	P2	P3	C2		
PARAGRAPH 1										
RA-1	This study has examined the cognitions and practices of experienced ESL teachers, with a specific focus on the pronunciation oriented techniques used in their courses.			This study (actor)	Has examined (material)	the cognitions and practices of experience ESL teachers (goal)		with a specific focus on the pronunciation oriented techniques used in their courses. (matter)		
RA-2	One of the main findings is that controlled techniques dominated the knowledge base of pronunciation teaching for all five teachers and that, in terms of pedagogy, of all the techniques used, guided techniques appear to have been used less frequently, even in comparison with free techniques.			One of the main findings (identified)	is (relational identifying)	that controlled techniques dominated the knowledge base of pronunciation teaching for all five teachers and that in terms of pedagogy, of all the techniques used, guided techniques appear to have been used less frequently, even in comparison with free techniques (identifier)				

RA-3		that		controlled technique (carrier)	dominated (relational attributive)	the knowledge base of pronunciation teaching for all five teachers and that in terms of pedagogy, of all the techniques used, guided	
RA-4		and that		of all techniques used, guided technique (senser)	appear (mental)	to have been used less frequently, even in comparison with free techniques (phenomenon)	
RA-5					to have been used (material)	even in comparison with free techniques (goal)	less frequently (manner)
RA-6	From a historical perspective, these findings are not surprising.		From a historical perspective (angle)	these findings (carrier)	are (relational attributive)	not surprsing (attribute)	

RA-7	For centuries, pronunciation pedagogy was considered synonymous with imitative intuitive and analytic-linguistic approaches in which controlled techniques formed the foundational core of teaching.		For centuries, (time)	pronunciation pedagogy (carrier)	was considered (relational attributive)	synonymous with imitative intuitive and analytic-linguistic approaches in which controlled techniques formed the foundational core of teaching. (attribute)	
RA-8	Although the traditional approaches to pronunciation teaching are criticized in today's communicative era, many of these controlled techniques continue to be valued, as demonstrated by their use by experienced teachers in the present study.		Although the traditional approaches to pronunciation teaching are criticized in today's communicative era	many of these controlled techniques (carrier)	continue (relational attributive)	to be valued (attribute)	as demonstrated by their use by experienced teachers in the present study. (manner)
RA-9		Although		the traditional approaches to pronunciation teaching (phenomenon)	are critized (mental)		in today's communicative era (time), as demonstrated by their use by experienced teachers in the present study (manner)
RA-10		as			demonstrated (material)	by their use by experienced teachers (actor)	in the present study (location)
-------	---	----	----------------------	---	--	--	------------------------------------
RA-11	In fact, the widespread use of controlled techniques in the five teachers' classrooms is, to a certain degree, advantageous to learners.		In fact, (manner)	the widespread use of controlled techniques in the five teachers' classrooms (carrier)	is (relational attributive)	advantageous to learners. (attribute)	to a certain degree, (degree)
RA-12	Research has demonstrated that controlled techniques can have a positive impact on the development of learner intelligibility (e.g., Couper, 2003; Derwing et al., 1998) or on phonological improvement (e.g., Saito, 2007).			Research (sayer)	has demonstrated (verbal)	that controlled techniques can have a positive impact on the development of learner intelligibility (e.g., Couper, 2003; Derwing et al., 1998) or on phonological improvement (e.g., Saito, 2007). (report)	
RA-13				controlled techniques (possesser)	can have (relational possessive)	a positive impact on the development of learner intelligibility (e.g., Couper, 2003; Derwing et al., 1998) or on phonological improvement (e.g., Saito, 2007)(possessive)	

	·	PARAG			
RA-14	The dominance of controlled techniques in the classroom might nevertheless raise some concerns.	The dominance of controlled techniques in the classroom (senser)	might nevertheless raise (mental)	some concerns. (phenomenon)	
RA-15	The less frequent use of guided (semicontrolled) or free techniques may limit the potential development of comprehensible learner pronunciation in authentic conversations.	The less frequent use of guided (semicontrolled) or free techniques (actor)	may limit (material)	the potential development of comprehensible learner pronunciation in authentic conversations. (recepient)	
RA-16	Research has shown that the use of communicative activities involving dyadic interaction has the potential for greater impact on learner uptake and automatic use of targeted features of pronunciation than focus-on-form instruction alone (Saito & Lyster, 2012).Image: Communication is a structure communication is a structure structure communication is a structure 	Research (sayer)	has shown (verball)	that the use of communicative activities involving dyadic interaction has the potential for greater impact on learner uptake and automatic use of targeted features of pronunciation than focus-on-form instruction alone (Saito & Lyster, 2012). (report)	

RA-17			The use of communicative activities involving dyadic interaction (carrier)	has (relational attributive)	the potential for greater impact on learner uptake and automatic use of targeted features of pronunciation than focus-on-form instruction alone (attribute)	
RA-18	Furthermore, with grammar-oriented focus on form, recent research suggests that the combined use of controlled activities with communicative activities can have a stronger positive impact on learner retention and automatization of grammatical structures than the use of mechanical activities or drills alone (Khatib & Nikouee, 2012).	Furtherm ore,	recent research (sayer)	suggests (verbal)	that with grammar- oriented focus on form (manner), the combined use of controlled activities with communicative activities can have a stronger positive impact on learner retention and automatization of grammatical structures than the use of mechanical activities or drills alone (Khatib & Nikouee, 2012). (report)	

RA-19		that	the combined use of control activities with communicativ activities (possessor)	A	a stronger positive impact on learner retention and automatization of grammatical structures than the use of mechanical activities or drills alone (Khatib & Nikouee, 2012). (posessed)	
i ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ; ;	This research indicates that guided practice (such as information-gap activities involving a two-way exchange of information that provide the learner with opportunities to monitor their use of target features) is an important component in the development of comprehensible pronunciation.		the research (sayer)	indicates (verbal)	that guided practice (such as information- gap activities involving a two-way exchange of information that provide the learner with opportunities to monitor their use of target features) is an important component in the development of comprehensible pronunciation. (report)	

RA-21		that		guided practice (such as information-gap activities involving a two- way exchange of information that provide the learner with opportunities to monitor their use of target features) (carrier)	attributive)	an important component in the development of comprehensible pronunciation. (attribute)	
	In the present study, although all five teachers used guided techniques in addition to controlled techniques, the use of guided techniques was limited.		all five teachers	the use of guided techniques (carrier)	was (relational attributive)	limited (attribute)	
RA-23		although		all five teachers (actor)	1 N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N N	guided techniques in addition to controlled techniques (goal)	

RA-24	This suggests that even though four of the teachers received training in pronunciation pedagogy, their knowledge base of guided techniques and of how to integrate them effectively into lessons may have needed further development.			This (sayer)	suggests (verbal)	that even though four of the teachers received training in pronunciation pedagogy, their knowledge base of guided techniques and of how to integrate them effectively into lessons may have needed further development. (report)	
RA-25			even though four of the teachers received training in pronunciation pedagogy, (matter)	their knowledge base of guided techniques and of how to integrate them effectively into lessons (senser)	may have needed (material)	further development (phenomenon)	
RA-26		that even though		four of the teachers (actor)	received (material)	training in pronunciation pedagogy (goal)	

RA-27	That said, future		That (sayer)	said (verbal)	future research still	
	research still needs to			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	needs to determine	
	determine the degree				the degree to which	
	to which controlled				controlled techniques	
	techniques should be				should be coupled	
	coupled with guided				with guided	
	techniques to				techniques to	
	enhance learner				enhance learner	
	comprehensibility for				comprehensibility for	
	use in free activities				use in free activities	
	or outside				or outside	
	the classroom.				the classroom.	
					(verbiage)	
RA-28			future research	still needs to	the degree to which	
			(senser)	determine	controlled techniques	
				(mental)	should be coupled	
					with guided	
					techniques to	
					enhance learner	
					comprehensibility for	
					use in free activities	
					or outside	
					the classroom.	
					(phenomenon)	
 			PARAG	рари 2		
			rakag	лагп э		

RA-29	Shifting to the examination of teachers' cognitions with their actual practices, the second half of the study focused more specifically on three beliefs that emerged from the data.	Shifting to the examination of teachers' cognitions with their actual practices (purpose)	the second half of the study (senser)	focused (mental)	more specifically on three beliefs that emerged from the data. (phenomenon)	
RA-30	First, the two teachers First of lower level students shared the belief that listening discrimination activities formed an important initial step to achieving successful phonological production.		the two teachers of lower level students (possessor)	shared (relational possessive)	the belief that listening discrimination activities formed an important initial step to achieving successful phonological production. (possessed)	
RA-31	This belief was reflected in their use of numerous listening discrimination activities in their OC classes, thereby demonstrating a strong connection between their beliefs and practice.		This believe (senser)	was reflected (relational attributive)	in their use of numerous listening discrimination activities in their OC classes (attribute)	thereby demonstrating a strong connection between their beliefs and practice (result)

RA-32		thereby		(relational	a strong connection between beliefs and practice (attribute)	
RA-33	Their beliefs are furthermore supported by research that has demonstrated a positive connection between training in listening perception and enhanced phonetic production (Bradlow, Pisoni, Yamada, & Tohkura, 1997) and that has suggested that phonological improvement is maintained over long periods of time (Bradlow, AkahaneYamada, Pisoni, & Tohkura, 1999).		Their beliefs (attribute)	furthermore (relational attributive)	supported by research that has demonstrated a positive connection between training in listening perception and enhanced phonetic production (Bradlow, Pisoni, Yamada, & Tohkura, 1997) and that has suggested that phonological improvement is maintained over long periods of time (Bradlow, Akahane Yamada, Pisoni, & Tohkura, 1999). (carrier)	

RA-34	The teachers' beliefs and practices, grounded in empirical research, suggest that the two teachers appeared to be providing students with the initial building blocks required to improve the comprehensibility of their speech.		The teachers' beliefs and practices, grounded in empirical research, (sayer)	suggest (verbal)	that the two teachers appeared to be providing students with the initial building blocks required to improve the comprehensibility of their speech. (report)	
RA-35		that	the two teachers (carrier)	appeared (relational attributive)	to be providing students with the initial building blocks required to improve the comprehensibility of their speech.(attribute)	
RA-36				to be providing (material)	students (beneficiary)	with the initial building blocks required to improve the comprehensibility of their speech. (manner)

			PARAG	RAPH 4		
RA-37	The second set of beliefs shared by the two teachers of intermediate-level learners emphasized the importance of kinesthetic/tactile teaching for improving learner pronunciation.		The second set of beliefs shared by the two teachers of intermediate- level learners (carrier)	emphasized (relational attributive)	the importance of kinesthetic/tactile teaching for improving learner pronunciation. (attribute)	
RA-38	The beliefs and practices of both Ginger and Abby demonstrated that they placed considerable value on techniques involving physical movement in order to improve learner pronunciation.		The beliefs and practices of both Ginger and Abby (sayer)	demonstrated (verbal)	that they placed considerable value on techniques involving physical movement in order to improve learner pronunciation. (report)	
RA-39		that	they (senser)	placed (mental)	considerable value on techniques involving physical movement in order to improve learner pronunciation. (phenomenon)	

RA-40	These beliefs are shared by other specialists in the field who recommend the use of physical movement and/or gesture in pronunciation work (e.g., Acton, 1984, 2001; CelceMurcia et al., 2010; Gilbert, 1991; Graham, 1986; Murphy, 2004).			These beliefs (possessor)	are shared (relational possessive)	by other specialists in the field who recommend the use of physical movement and/or gesture in pronunciation work (e.g., Acton, 1984, 2001; CelceMurcia et al., 2010; Gilbert, 1991; Graham, 1986; Murphy, 2004) (possessed).	
RA-41	Although empirical research has yet to be conducted on the impact of kinesthetic/tactile techniques on pronunciation learning, the use of these techniques has frequently been employed not only in ESL education (e.g., Asher, 2000), but in voice training as well (e.g., Hardison & Sonchaeng, 2005).		Although empirical research has yet to be conducted on the impact of kinesthetic/tacti le techniques on pronunciation learning (matter)	the use of these techniques (actor)	has frequently been employed (material)		not only in ESL education (e.g., Asher, 2000), (location) but in voice training as well (e.g., Hardison & Sonchaeng, 2005). (concession)
RA-42		although		empirical research (actor)	has yet to be conducted (material)	on the impact of kinesthetic/tactile techniques on pronunciation learning (goal)	

RA-43	Nevertheless, more research is needed to determine the effectiveness of using kinesthetic/tactile techniques to enhance learner comprehensibility.	more research (possessor)	is needed (relational possessive)		to determine the effectiveness of using kinesthetic/tactile techniques to enhance learner comprehensibility. (purpose)
RA-44			to determine (mental)	the effectiveness of using kinesthetic/tactile techniques to enhance learner comprehensibility. (phenomenon)	
RA-45	The third belief—a concern that pronunciation instruction can be boring—was shared by the two teachers whose courses were more textbook driven than the others.	The third belief—a concern that pronunciation instruction can be boring— (possessed)	was shared (relational possessive)	by the two teachers whose courses were more textbook driven than the others. (possessor)	
RA-46	One reason for this belief may be the result of what Prabhu (1992) refers to as overroutinisation.	One reason for this belief (identifier)	may be (relational intensive identifier)	the result of what Prabhu (1992) refers to as overroutinisation. (identify)	

RA-47	Because textbooks		Because	the teachers'	may have	from the	
1.1 1-47	regularly use the		textbooks	concern over the	derived	overroutinisation of	
	same techniques from		regularly use	potential tedium	(relational	techniques in their	
	one unit to the next,		the same	associated with	circumstancial	^	
	the teachers' concern		techniques	the)	(circumstancial)	
	over the potential		from one unit	pronunciation	/	(circumstaneiar)	
	tedium associated		to the next,	components of			
	with the		(reason)	their lessons			
	pronunciation		(Icasoff)	(carrier)			
	components of their			(carrier)			
	lessons may have						
	derived from the						
	overroutinisation of						
	techniques in their						
	courses.						
	courses.						
RA-48		Because		textbooks (actor)	regularly use	the same techniques	from one unit to the
					(material)	(goal)	next, (location)
RA-49	In the case of Tanya,		In the case of	the frequent use	likely resulted	that her lessons may	in her perception
	whose course was		Tanya,	of similar	(mental)	be boring, despite the	(location)
	devoted almost		whose course	techniques		time and effort she	
	entirely to		was devoted	(senser)		spent devising	
	pronunciation, the		almost entirely			additional activities to	
	frequent use of		almost entirely to			additional activities to provide a certain zest	
	•						
	frequent use of		to			provide a certain zest	
	frequent use of similar techniques		to pronunciation			provide a certain zest to her lessons.	
	frequent use of similar techniques likely resulted in her		to pronunciation			provide a certain zest to her lessons.	
	frequent use of similar techniques likely resulted in her perception that her		to pronunciation			provide a certain zest to her lessons.	
	frequent use of similar techniques likely resulted in her perception that her lessons may be		to pronunciation			provide a certain zest to her lessons.	
	frequent use of similar techniques likely resulted in her perception that her lessons may be boring, despite the		to pronunciation			provide a certain zest to her lessons.	
	frequent use of similar techniques likely resulted in her perception that her lessons may be boring, despite the time and effort she		to pronunciation			provide a certain zest to her lessons.	
	frequent use of similar techniques likely resulted in her perception that her lessons may be boring, despite the time and effort she spent devising		to pronunciation			provide a certain zest to her lessons.	
	frequent use of similar techniques likely resulted in her perception that her lessons may be boring, despite the time and effort she spent devising additional activities to		to pronunciation			provide a certain zest to her lessons.	
	frequent use of similar techniques likely resulted in her perception that her lessons may be boring, despite the time and effort she spent devising additional activities to provide a certain zest		to pronunciation			provide a certain zest to her lessons.	

RA-50		that		Her lessons (carrier)	may be (relational attributive)	boring (attribute)	despite the time and effort she spent devising additional activities to provide a certain zest to her lessons. (contigency)
RA-51	In the case of Vala, another potential reason for this concern with boredom could be her lack of training in pronunciation pedagogy.		In the case of Vala	another potential reason for this concern with boredom (identifier)	could be (relational intensive identifying)	her lack of training in pronunciation pedagogy (identify)	
RA-52	As Vala noted, her lack of education frequently led to the use of the same few techniques in the limited amount of time that she allotted to pronunciation instruction.	As		Vala (sayer)	noted (verbal)	her lack of education frequently led to the use of the same few techniques in the limited amount of time that she allotted to pronunciation instruction. (verbiage)	
RA-53			As Vala noted	her lack of education (carrier)	frequently led (relational circumstancial)	to the use of the same few techniques in the limited amount of time that she allotted to pronunciation instruction. (circumstancial)	

			PARAC	GRAPH 5		
RA-54	Finally, one of the study's major findings relates not so much to the specific area of pronunciation pedagogy as to the study of teachers' cognitions in general.	Finally,	one of the study's major findings (carrier	relates (relational attributive)	to the specific area of pronunciation pedagogy as to the study of teachers' cognitions in general. (attribute)	not so much (manner)
RA-55	The process of investigation confirmed that teachers' self-reports of their beliefs, knowledge, and practices are limited in providing a sufficiently accurate and elaborated picture of teachers' cognitions, especially in representing their knowledge of pronunciation- oriented techniques.		The process of investigation (sayer)	confirmed (verbal)	that teachers' self- reports of their beliefs, knowledge, and practices are limited in providing a sufficiently accurate and elaborated picture of teachers' cognitions, especially in representing their knowledge of pronunciation- oriented techniques. (report)	

RA-56		that		teachers' self- reports of their beliefs, knowledge, and practices (carrier)	are (relational attributive)	limited (attribute)	in providing a sufficiently accurate and elaborated picture of teachers' cognitions, especially in representing their knowledge of pronunciation- oriented techniques. (matter)
RA-57		In			providing	a sufficiently accurate and elaborated picture of teachers' cognitions, .	especially in representing their knowledge of pronunciation- oriented techniques (manner)
RA-58	1 '	For example	In representing their knowledge of pronunciation- oriented techniques, (manner)	the interview and observation data (actor)	frequently provided (material)	complementary information, with each source of data supplying information that the other did not. (goal)	

RA-59	Only through the combination of teachers' self-reports and classroom observations, and further supported by student reports, can a sufficiently detailed picture be produced.		Only through the combination of teachers' self- reports and classroom observations, and further supported by	a sufficiently detailed picture (goal)	can be produced. (material)		
	r		students reports (manner)				
RA-60	As advocated by Borg (2003), studies of teachers' cognitions require an examination of teachers' actual pedagogical practices.		As advocated by Borg (2003) (point of view)	studies of teachers' cognitions (carrier)	require (relational attributive)	an examination of teachers' actual pedagogical practices. (attribute)	
RA-61		As			advocated (verbal)	by Borg (2003) (sayer)	
RA-62	Without the inclusion of observed practice, cognitions that are implicit remain hidden from view		Without the inclusion of observed practice (manner)	cognitions that are implicit (carrier)	remain (relational attributive)	hidden from view (attribute)	

RA-63	Likewise, classroom	Likewise	classroom	cannot reveal	the rationale	
NA-03	practices alone cannot		practices alone	(mental)	underlying teachers'	
	reveal the rationale	,	(senser)	(mental)	decision making in	
	underlying teachers'		(senser)		the classroom,	
	decision making in				especially in	
	the classroom,				determining how	
	,				various contextual	
	especially in					
	determining how				factors might	
	various contextual				influence teachers'	
	factors might				cognitions (Burns,	
	influence teachers'				1996). (phenomenon)	
	cognitions (Burns,					
	1996).					
RA-64	Ultimately, teachers'	Ultimatel	teachers'	are mutually		
		у,	cognitions and	shaped		
	classroom practices		classroom	(material)		
	are mutually shaped		practices (goal)			
	and informed, but are					
	also transformed and					
	molded					
	by additional					
	contextual variables,					
	such as curriculum					
	and the learners					
	themselves.					
RA-65		and		informed		
				(material)		
RA-66		but		are also		
				transformed		
				(material)		
RA-67		and		(are) molded	by additional	
				(material)	contextual variables,	
					such as curriculum	
					and the learners	
					themselves (actor)	
					, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	

	Macro	Micro		Represen	ntation of Micro Moves into the Proc	ess
No	Moves	Moves	Skripsis	Process	RAs	Process
1	Stating Background Information of the Study	Purpose	х		The study <i>has examined</i> the cognitions and practices of experienced ESL teachers, with a specific focus on the pronunciation oriented techniques used in their courses (RA1-1)	This purpose is stated in the form of a material process "has examined". The process of examining has "the study" as the actor and the concept being studied "cognition and practices of experienced ESL teachers" as goal of the process examined.
2			x		The purpose of the current study <i>was</i> to investigate the role of task modeling in attention to question forms during task planning time as well as during task performance. (RA2-1)	The process of investigation in second clause is stated in the form of material process "to investigate". The process of investigating has "the current study" as the actor and "the role of task modelling in attention to question forms during task planning time as well as during task performance" as the goal of the purpose.
			х		It also <i>examined</i> how task modeling affected question development. (RA2-3)	This statement is stated in the form of material process "examined". The process examining used "it" which refers to the study as the actor and "how task modelling affected question development" as the goal of second purpose.

3		Х	The current investigation is a novel contribution in that it aimed <i>to examine</i> whether and to what degree native-speaking raters with multilingual backgrounds differentially perceive L2 comprehensibility, that is, Singaporean raters who constantly used various models of English (SE, GA, RP) as their dominant language but also spoke at least one other language (e.g., Mandarin, Malay, Tamil) for daily communication purposes. (RA3-6)	This purpose of present study is stated in the form of material process "to examine". The process of examining has "The current investigation" as the actor to the goal "whether and to what degree native speaking raters with multilingual backgrounds differentially perceive L2 comprehensibility,"
	Focus	Х	with specific focus on the pronunciation oriented techniques used in their courses (RA1-01)	The focus of the study is stated in one sentence with the purpose of the study. Therefore, this statement is placed in the circumstances part as the circumstances of matter.
4		X	The findings provide insights into the linguistic forms learners <i>focused on</i> during planning time and whether attention to form is influenced by viewing modeling videos. (RA2-05)	This focus of the study stated in the form of material process "focused on". The process of focusing has "the linguistic forms learners" as the actor to the goal "during planning time and"

		X		with multilingual backgrounds differentially perceive L2 comprehensibility, that is, Singaporean raters who constantly used various models of English (SE, GA, RP) as their dominant language but also spoke at least one other language (e.g., Mandarin, Malay, Tamil) for daily communication purposes. (RA3-06)	This purpose of present study is stated in the form of relational attributive process "is" with "The current investigation" represents the carrier and "a novel contribution" represents the attribute. Futhermore, another clause "in that it aimed to examine" represents the circumstances of purpose of study.
5		First, it <i>is believed</i> that students' initiating moves play a crucial role in promoting learning. (SK2- 02)	The hypothesis is stated in the form of mental process "believed". The process of believing has "students' initiating moves play a crucial role in promoting learning." as the phenomenon.	Recently, a growing number of interaction studies <i>have</i> <i>suggested</i> that learners can be trained to become better interactors/feedback providers (e.g., Sato & Lyster, in press). (RA2-11)	This statement is stated in the form of verbal process "have suggested". The process of suggesting has "a growing number of interaction studies (e.g., Sato & Lyster, in press)" represents the sayer and "that learners can be trained to become better interactors/feedback providers" as the report.
		Students' initiating moves as a part of classroom interaction <i>is considered</i> as an important factor in generating learning opportunities. (SK2-04)	This statement is a further elaboration of students' initiating moves stated in the form of mental process "is considered". The considering has no senser being stated as it is a general truth with the phenomenon "an important factor in generating learning opportunities."		

6	Evaluating the findings of the study	statemen t	<i>found</i> that the teacher implemented the authentic assessment techniques of discussion and conversation, story retelling, portfolios, project, writing sample, and presentation to assess	the form of verbal process "was found" which "it" represents the research findings as the sayer and "that the teacher implemented the authentic assessment techniques of" as the general report of the findings.	One of the main findings <i>is</i> that controlled techniques dominated the knowledge base of pronunciation teaching for all five teachers and that, in terms of pedagogy, of all the techniques used, guided techniques appear to have been used less frequently, even in comparison with free techniques. (RA1-02-05)	The summary of the study used the form of relational identifying process "is". "One of the main findings" as the identifier" and "controlled techniques dominated the knowledge base of pronunciation teaching for all five teachers and that," as the identified of the findings.
			techniques in the classroom commonly with the pattern of developing goals the students should know and be able to do, selecting and	stated in the form of material process "used". The process of using has "the teacher" as the actor and "these techniques" as the goal under the circumstances of location "in the classroom".		The second elaboration of the findings is stated in the form of verbal process "are criticized". The process of critizing has also reported the first finding that "many of these controlled techniques continue to be valued, as demonstrated by their use by experienced teachers in the present study."

7	The findings of the study showed the reality that authentic assessment techniques provide a wide chance for students' participation in the classroom and also to be evaluated not only by their comprehension on the materials but also by their way in using, showing, and talking about their comprehension.(SK1-05)	This findings is stated in the form of relational process "provide". The process of providing has the carrier "authentic assessment techniques" carries the attribute "a wide chance for students' participation" which is further elaborated under the circumstances of location "in the classroom."	In the present study, although all five teachers used guided techniques in addition to controlled techniques, the use of guided techniques <i>was</i> <i>limited</i> . (RA1-22-23)	The findings is stated in the form of relational process "was" in which guided techniques act as the carrier and "limited" as the attribute. This findings clearly shown that there is unrelevant way to improve students pronunciation between previous studies suggestion and the practices implemented by teachers.
	It <i>is</i> also <i>found</i> that the students get more opportunity to speak up and have more time in interacting and using English. (SK1-06)	The first elaboration of the findings "students chance of participation" stated in the form of material process "get". The process of getting has "the students" as the actor and "more opportunity to speak up and" as the goal.	The teachers' beliefs and practices, grounded in empirical research, <i>suggest</i> that the two teachers appeared to be providing students with the initial building blocks required to improve the comprehensibility of their speech. (RA1-34-36)	The findings is stated in the form of verbal process "suggests" in which the report stated in the process of material "appeared". The process of appearing has "the two teachers" as the actor and the goal "to be providing students with the initial building blocks" as the first finding.

8		the discussion in the classroom <i>happened</i> naturally using bilingual, English and Bahasa Indonesia. (SK1-26)	The second evaluation is stated in the form of relational process "happened" in circumstances of manner "naturally" with the carrier "the discussion in the classroom" that carries the attribute "using bilingual, English and Bahasa" as the finding.	A follow-up analysis of the qualitative nature of learners' think-aloud protocols <i>suggests</i> that watching the task modeling videos in the MG seemed to encourage learners to use a wider variety of learner-driven attention-to- form strategies, including translation or seeking assistance. (RA2-16)	This statement is stated in the form of verbal process "suggests". The process of suggesting has the results of researcher's "follow up analysis of the qualitative nature of learners' think- aloud protocols" represents the sayer and "that watching the task modelling videos in the MG" as the first finding report.
		the students talk without	This statement is stated in the form of material process "let" with the circumstances of manner "commonly" with "the teacher" as the actor and "the students" as the recepient to the goal "talk without suggesting of the using English instead of Bahasa Indonesia only." as the second findings.	Also, many concrete instances were found among the MG in which they processed task input to foster output opportunities. (RA2-19)	This statement is stated in the form of material process "were found" which "many concrete instances among the MG" represents the goal of the second findings.

9	In the interview, the teacher <i>did not mention</i> that she used discussion and conversation, however, the observation showed that discussion and conversation dominated the whole assessments applied in the classroom. (SK1-32)	The first clause is stated in the form of verbal process "did not mention". The process of mentioning has the actor "the teacher" and the report "she used discussion and conversation" as the findings.	On the other hand, although the learners from the NMG also <i>appeared</i> to focus on what to say during task performance, they often did not resolve their LREs or complete questions that they were trying to formulate. (RA2- 37)	This findings reported is stated in the form of material process "did". The process of doing has "they" represents the NMG participants as the actor and "not resolve their LREs or complete questions" as the goal
	However, the teacher <i>did</i> <i>not totally realize</i> the plan. (SK1-39)	This statement is stated in the form of material process "did realize" under the circumstances of manner "not totally". The process of realizing has "the teacher" as the actor and the goal "the plan"' as the findings.	With regard to attention to question forms, a main finding of this study <i>is</i> that the MG produced significantly more LREs than the NMG during both planning time and task performance. (RA2-47)	This statement is stated in the form of relational identifying process which "the MG produced significantly more LREs than the NMG during both planning time and task performance" as the identified of the identifier "a main finding" under the circumstances of matter "with regard to attention to question forms" as the summary of the first and second research findings.
10	Based on the finding, it was found that students initiated the interaction by questioning, stating statement, commanding and offering but unfortunately it was mostly done in bahasa Indonesia. (SK2-06)	in the form of verbal	Also, the overall frequency of attention to form by the NMG <i>was</i> low and largely confined to just a few learners. (RA2- 49)	This statement is elaboration of attention to form stated in the form of relational identifying process "was" which "the overall frequency of attention to form by the NMG" as the identifier and "low and largely confined to just a few learners." as the identified.

		the most dominant functioned to ask for teacher's explanation, confirmation, clarification and permission. (SK2-09)	The second findings is stated in the form of verbal process which the sayer mentioned in previous findings with the report "the question played the most dominant functioned to ask for teacher's explanation, confirmation, clarification and permission."	In terms of the nature of LREs produced during task performance regardless of groups, the majority of LREs <i>were</i> explicit questions, such as "How do you ask X? (RA2- 50)	This statement is further elaboration of the questions stated in the form of relational attributive process "were" which "the majority of LREs" represents the carrier and the attribute "explicit questions such as "How do you ask X?" as the conclusion.
11		And sometimes the students <i>did follow-up</i> after the teacher answered their questions. (SK2-12)	The third findings is stated in the form of material process "did". The process of doing has "the students" as the actor and "follow up" as the goal under the circumstances of time "sometimes" and matter "after the teacher answered their questions"		This statement showed the fourth findings which stated in the form of material process "employed". The process of employing has the "learners in the NMG" as the actor and "the same types of LREs" as the goal.

	teacher have provided the important input exposure to the target language in the form of words and statement. (SK2-27)	This statement is stated in the form of verbal process "found". The process of findings using the pronoun "it" represents the study of the author as the sayer under the circumstance of location "in the findings" and the report that stated in the form of material process "have provided" with the actor "the teacher" and the goal "the important input exposure to the target language in the form of words and statement"	Thus, though there <i>were</i> significant differences in the frequency of LREs during task performance in both groups, a qualitative analysis of LRE type showed that most focuses on form, in both experimental groups, were explicit questions in the L1. (RA2-63)	This statement is the general conclusion made by authors stated in the form of relational attributive "were" to address first conclusion which the attribute "significant differences in the frequency of LREs during task performance in both groups" as the conclusion of findings. The attribute is further explained the form of verbal process "showed" with the sayer represented by "a qualitative analysis" to the report "most focuses on form, in both experimental groups, were explicit questions in the L1."
12	target language. (SK2-55)	This statement is stated in the form of verbal process "found". The process of finding has the report "the teacher did not encourage the students to speak in the target language." as the findings under the circumstances of location "from further analysis"	According to the result of the t- test, the Singaporean raters <i>assigned</i> significantly better and more lenient comprehensibility scores to Japanese-accented speech samples than Canadian raters did. (RA3-16)	The first findings is related with the elaboration of degree of students being influenced by L2 comprehensibility judgments stated in the form of material process "assigned". The process of assigning has "Singaporean raters" acts as the actor and "significantly better and more lenient" as the goal under the circumstances of location "result of the t-test"

		And it <i>was found</i> that the target language was not good enough since there were some grammatical errors in her language that then indicates the reasons for students asked question. (SK2-39)	the form of verbal process "was found" with the report that stated in the form relational	reveal that, whereas the Canadian and Singaporean	The second findings is another elaboration of the degree stated in the form of verbal process "reveal". The process of revealing has "results of the correlation and regression analyses" as the sayer and the report "that, whereas the Canadian and Singaporean raters in particular, appeared to be stronger" as the findings.
13		As has (sic) been presented on findings, results in both questionnaire and interview <i>show</i> that respondents had positive perception towards the implementation of peer written feedback. (SK3- 01)	in the form of verbal process "show" which the sayer is the researcher that represented in the questionnaire and interview results to state the report "respondents had positive perception	Specifically the Singaporean raters <i>were</i> able to pay sufficient attention to lexicogrammar information-the extent to which the Japanese learners selected conceptually and contextually appropriate vocabulary items and delivered them using correct grammatical forms. (RA3-28)	This statement is further elaboration of general interpretation of first object stated in the form of relational attibutive process "were" which "Singaporean raters" as the carrier and the attribute "able to pay sufficient attention to lexicogrmmar" as the first specific results.

	Based on questionnaire and the interview result most of students <i>is</i> fine and even grateful when receiving written feedback from their peers. (SK3-09)	f from the questionnaire and interview provided a result which stated in the	In contrast, the Canadian raters' comprehensibility judgments <i>were</i> mainly based on the phonological accuracy and fluency of the L2 speech. (RA3-30)	This statement is further elaboration of general interpretation of second object stated in the form of relational attibutive process. "The Canadian raters' comprehensibility judgments" is the carrier and the attribute. "phonological accuracy and fluency of the L2 speech" as the second results.
14	In addition, students also claimed that the content of written feedback received include (sic) in (sic) grammar, content and organization of the writing (SK3-16)	feedback received by the students as the sayer of the verbal process "sayer" to the report "the		
	Students <i>appreciate</i> their peer for giving mark to the error so that they are able to notice where the error is (SK3-26)	process "appreciate" with		

15	Based on questionnaire and the interview result which is in accordance with Sultana (2009) (sic) <i>found</i> <i>out</i> that the students are hesitant to give written feedback to their peers since they are in the same level and still have imperfection in their works. (SK3-38)	The third findings' explanation is stated in the form of verbal process "found out". The process of finding has the sayer "the researcher which state the result of questionnaire and interview" and the report "the students are hesitant". The explanation also stated under circumstances "in accordance with Sultana (2009)" which aim to relate the present and previous study	X	
	However, students <i>tried to</i> <i>give</i> the complete detail written feedback in grammar and content areas including the ideas and organization of the writing. (SK3-43)	The fourth findings is stated in the form of material process "tried". The process of trying has "Students" acts as the actor while the goal is "to give the complete"	x	
16	To support their answer, students <i>stated</i> that they are indicating the errors by circling or underlining the errors and writing the correction in above or below the errors. (SK3-52)	The fourth findings stated in the form of verbal process "stated". The process of stating has a report the students method in giving feedback.	X	

	ſ		indica helpfu	eating the errors is iful and useful for ing the errors. (SK3-	The fifth findings stated in the form of mental process "agreed". The process of agreeing has "most of them" (students) act as the senser and "indicating the errors is helpful" is the phenomenon		
1	17	Evid	active some activi condu stages used a as write	ely participating while e others were doing ething out of the ities which was	stated in the forrm relational process "were" with the carrier "some students" carries the attribute "actively participating"	approaches in which controlled	The first elaboration is stated in the form of mental process " was considered". The process of considering has "pronunciation pedagogy synonymous with imitative intuitive and analytic-linguistic approaches in which controlled techniques formed the foundational core of teaching." as the general truth of pronunciation pedagogy while the senser is not cleary stated.
			result mean others langu move canno	ts of opportunities for hingful interaction with rs in the target uage, those initiating es by the students ot consider as hingful interaction. 2-25)	the form of relational identifying process "is" with "language learning" as the identifier and the identified "the results opportunities for meaningful interaction with others in the target language" as the general evidence.	A strong connection between the belief (listening discrimination) and practice <i>reflected</i> in their use of numerous listening discrimination activities in their OC classes thereby demonstrating a strong connection between their beliefs and practice. (RA01-31- 32)	The evidence is stated in the form of material process "was reflected" with the actor referred to the teachers which not stated under the circumstance of location "in their use of" and "in their OC classess"

18		used to deliver the written feedback. (SK3-08)	The first elaboration of "positive" in students' perception is stated in the form of material process "came from" which the actor is not clearly stated. This material process is explained under the circumstances of location "students' perception about their feeling when receiving peer written feedback, the content which was provided and the strategy used to deliver the written feedback. " Then, another evidence provided stated in the form of relational process "is" with "students" as the carrier and "fine" as the attribute.	Their beliefs <i>are</i> furthermore <i>supported</i> by research that has demonstrated a positive connection between training in listening perception and enhanced phonetic production (Bradlow, Pisoni, Yamada, & Tohkura, 1997) and that has suggested that phonological improvement is maintained over long periods of time (Bradlow, AkahaneYamada, Pisoni, & Tohkura, 1999). (RA1-33)	The evidence is stated in the form of material process "are supported" with the actor is the "research that has demonstrated" and the goal is "their belief". The support is further explained from the research that stated in the two forms of verbal process "has demonstrated" with the sayer are (Bradlow, Pisoni, Yamada, & Tohkura, 1997) to the report "a positive connection between training in listening perception and" and "has suggested" with the sayer are the same but in different years, 1999 to the report "phonological improvement is maintained over long periods of time"
				The beliefs and practices of both Ginger and Abby <i>demonstrated</i> that they placed considerable value on techniques involving physical movement in order to improve learner pronunciation. (RA1- 38-39)	The first explanation of the second belief is stated in the form of material process "demonstrated". The process of demonstrating has "The beliefs and practices of both Ginger and Abby" as the actor and the goal "considerable value on techniques involving physical movement" as the statement of evidence.

19			These beliefs <i>are shared</i> by other specialists in the field who recommend the use of physical movement and/or gesture in pronunciation work (e.g., Acton, 1984, 2001; CelceMurcia et al., 2010; Gilbert, 1991; Graham, 1986; Murphy, 2004). (RA1-40)	The second explanation is another evidence from previous study that stated in the form of relational posession process in which "other specialists" as the possessor and possessed "recommend these beliefs (second belief) in pronunciation work" as the evidence.
			This <i>is demonstrated</i> by the verbalization done by the participant in Example 5, who was thinking aloud during her pretask planning. (RA2-20)	This statement is an evidence of the second findings presented which stated in the form of verbal process "is demonstrated". The sayer is represented by "verbalization by group MG during pretask planning" and the report "the participant in Example 5, who was thinking aloud during her pretask planning." as evidence.
20			The decision making task she was planning for required that learners decide with their partners what additional facilities or shops are needed in the downtown area (English translations <i>are presented</i> in parentheses after each Korean utterance). (RA2-21)	This statement is further elaboration of verbalization done by the group MG during pretask planning as the first evidence stated in the form material process "required". The actor were "the learners" and the goal "the decision making task learners decide with their partners" were the second evidence.

			In Example 5, the learner from the MG often <i>used</i> Korean to process task input and plan for task performance (lines 1–4). (RA2-25)	This statement is second evidence stated in the form of verbal process "used" which "the learner from MG" as the sayer and the verbiage "Korean to process task input and plan for task performance" as the evidence.
21			She was also interested in checking with a teacher whether her language was accurate (lines 8–10), and asked explicit questions about vocabulary or question formation of both her teacher and even of a classmate (lines 4–5, line 13). (RA2-27)	This statement is the third evidence stated in the two clauses. The first clause used relational attributive process "interested" which the attribute is "in checking whether her language was accurate" the evidence and second clauses used verbal process "asked" which the verbiage is "explicit questions about" as another evidence.
			Although the questions that she attempted to formulate aloud during planning time were not always accurate, she often <i>produced</i> developmentally advanced question forms (i.e., Stages 4 or 5, lines 12–13). (RA2-31)	This statement is further elaboration of explicit questions in third evidence which stated in the form of material process "produced" that the actor is "she" as one of learners from MG group and "developmentally advanced question forms" as the goal

22			Example 6 <i>represents</i> what often happened during task planning time among the NMG. (RA2-41)	This statement is the evidence of the findings reported stated in the form of relational attributive process which "example 6" as the carrier and "what often happened" as the attribute under the circumstances of time "during task planning time among the NMG"
			Two learners in Example 6 <i>tended to rehearse</i> words, phrases, and occasional sentences, perhaps with a focus on pronunciation (line 16). (RA2-43)	This statement is further elaboration of attribute what happened in task planning of NMG which stated in the form of verbal process "tended to rehearse". "Two learners" acts as the actor and "words, phrases and" represents the verbiage.
23			Some questions <i>were</i> <i>attempted</i> , but there was little or no overt attention to form, as might have been illustrated through rephrases or asking partners or teachers for specific information about language form (line 17). (RA2- 44)	This statement is another elaboration of findings which stated in the form of material process "were attempted" which the goal is "some questions".
			This observation <i>is</i> <i>demonstrated</i> in Example 7, in which two learners from the MG were performing a decision-making task together: (RA2-53)	This statement is an evidence of observation on the findings stated in the form of material process "were performing" which the actor is "two learners from the MG" and the goal "a decision-making task together" as the evidence
24			In this excerpt, the majority of the questions <i>were</i> incomplete and ungrammatical, but learners did not pay attention to such linguistic issues (lines 1, 2, and 4). (RA2-54)	This statement is further elaboration of evidence given above stated in the form of relational attributive process "were" which "the majority of the questions" as the carrier and the attribute "incomplete and ungrammatical" as another evidence.
----	--	--	---	---
			When learners did not know how to ask something, they <i>tended to cut</i> the flow of the task and ask questions of each other in the first language (L1) about form (line 5). (RA2-56)	This statement is an elaboration of the attribute "ungrammatical and incomplete" stated in the form of material process "tended to cut" and "ask" which the actor is "they" represents the learner and "flow of the task" and "questions of each other in the first language (L1)" as the goal.
25			As discussed earlier, L2 comprehensibility well <i>reflects</i> the amount of effort raters make to collect as much as linguistic information as possible from accented L2 speech in order to grasp its overall meaning (Derwing & Munro, 2009). (RA3-23)	This first statement tries to answer of the questions presented by relating to the general state of previous study which stated in the form of relational process "reflects". "L2 comprehensibility" acts as the carrier and the attribute "the amount of effort raters" as evidence from previous study.

Previou Study	s It <i>is</i> opposite with Cazden (1988) that claimed students rarely asked question to the teacher except for procedures and admission. (SK2-10)	This statement is a compared finding from previous study which stated in the form of relational process "is" with the attribute "opposite". The attribute is further explained in the form of verbal process "claimed" with "Cazden 1988" as the sayer to the report "students rarely asked question"	several previous learner learner interaction studies that have highlighted the benefits	This statement is stated in the form of relational attributive process "are" which "these findings" represents the several findings from present study as the carrier and "in line with several previous learner" as the attribute.

26		Based on questionnaire and the interview result which is in accordance with Sultana (2009) (sic) found out that the students are hesitant to give written feedback to their peers since they are in the same level and still have imperfection in their works. (SK3-38)	The third findings' explanation is stated in the form of verbal process "found out". The sayer is "the researcher which state the result of questionnaire and interview" and "the students are hesitant" is the report. The explanation also stated under circumstances "in accordance with Sultana (2009)" which aim to relate the present and previous stud	native raters alike can simple 7- or 9-point rating scales to reliably judge various linguistic domains of L2 speaking proficiency such as the quality of vowels and consonants in L2 speech (Piske	This statement relates the findings of present study with the previous study that stated two clauses. The first clause is stated in the form of relational attributive process. "Our findings" acts as the carrier and "in line with previous L2" acts as the attribute which explained in further. The second clause explained the attribute "in line" which stated in the form of verbal process "has extensively shown". The researcher of "The L2 speech literature" acts as the sayer and "that even linguistically trained and native" represents the report from previous study.
----	--	---	--	---	---

		cases, students feel inferior after getting corrected by their peers and prefer to be corrected by the teacher. (SK3-11)	stated in the form of verbal process which Sultana (2009, p.12) is the sayer. This statement is taken from previous study which report "in some cases, students feel inferior after getting corrected by their peers and prefer to be corrected	The results presented here concur with previous research evidence that L2 speech assessment can be somewhat subject to raters' individual variability, such as familiarity with L2 accents (e.g., Bradlow & Bent, 2008; Isaac & Thomson, 2013; Kennedy & Trofimovich, 2008; Winke et al., 2013). (RA3-39)	The summary statement is stated in the form of relational process "concur" which relates "the results presented here" (present study) as the carrier and "previous research evidence" as the attribute
27		Zhen (2006) and Anderson (2010). (SK3-18)	This statement is stated in the form of relational attributive process which the attribute is "in line". It has a function to support previous statement with the word of present study with the previous study from Miao, Badger & Zhen (2006) and Anderson (2010).		

	Claim	It <i>shows</i> that students' IRF pattern did exist in classroom interaction. (SK2-14)	The interpretation of author is stated in the form of verbal process "shows" with the report "students' IRF pattern did exist in classroom interaction."	This research <i>indicates</i> that guided practice (such as information-gap activities involving a two-way exchange of information that provide the learner with opportunities to monitor their use of target features) is an important component in the development of comprehensible pronunciation. (RA1-20-21)	The author's statement is stated in the form of verbal process "indicates" which "this research/the author" represents sayer and the report "guided practice is an important component in the development of comprehensible pronunciation" as author's position in this research.
28		It <i>indicates</i> that there were two factors that probably caused the case happened; students did not matter the vocabularies and they were not confident enough to express their ideas in English. (SK2-18)	The interpretation of author is stated in the form of mental process "indicates" which the senser is not stated to the phenomenon "two factors that probably caused the case happened; and "	Because textbooks regularly use the same techniques from one unit to the next, the teachers' concern over the potential tedium associated with the pronunciation components of their lessons <i>may have derived</i> from the overroutinisation of techniques in their courses. (RA1-47-48)	The perception of the belief is stated in the form of mental process "may have derived" with "the teachers" as the senser to sense the phenomenon " the potential tedium associated with the pronunciation components of their lessons from the overrotinisation" as the perception.

	It <i>seems</i> the cause that the students did not have confident to deliver their curiosity and wish in English. (SK2-43)	the form of mental	It <i>seemed to be</i> the case that learners who were able to watch a video that modeled for them how to carry out a meaning task and also focus on linguistic resources before planning were better set up to think about what and how to plan for their upcoming tasks. (RA2-35)	This statement is stated the form of mental process "seemed" which "it" refers to the report have been mentioned above and the phenomenon "to be the case that learners who were able to watch videowere better set up to think about what and how to plan for their upcoming tasks." as the interpretation.
29	The positive perception arose since all of the students in this study used the direct ways to deliver written feedback. (SK3-49)	The first elaboration is from the author own interpretation stated in the form of mental process "arose" which the senser is not stated but under the circumstances of matter "since all of the students in this study"	A possible explanation for the nature of the LREs <i>is</i> the participants' low English proficiency overall. (RA2-66)	The explanation is stated in the form of relational identifying process which "the participants' low English proficiency overall." is the identified or interpretation of possible explanation for the nature of LREs as the identifier.
	Yet, it <i>is</i> still in surface area and contains the (sic) vagueness and ambiguity. (SK3-61)	This statement is stated in the form of relational attributive process "is" and "contains" which the content of written feedback is the carrier and surface area, vagueness and ambiguity are the attribute.	Arguably, this <i>was</i> due to the higher frequency of attention to question forms during planning time as well as during task-based interaction. (RA2- 84)	This statement is stated in the form of relational attributive process "was" which the carrier is "this" represents the advanced of learners in the MG and "due to the higher frequency of attention to" as the attribute.

30			had more relevant experience with various kinds of English accents on a daily basis (they regularly used various kinds of English models and spoke a	This statement is correlated with the previous statement stated in the form of verbal process "seems reasonable to assume" that "it" represents the experience of Singaporean raters and the report "that they easily and quickly adjusted" as the interpretation.
			the raters' familiarity with some common linguistic characteristic of nonnative	This statement is another interpretation stated in the form of relational existensial process "involves" which the existence "the raters' familiarity with" as the interpretation.

31			must have accumulated a great deal of experience in decoding	The second elaboration of the general interpretation presented in the form of material process "may be able to attend" which "they" (Singaporean raters) as the actor and "to universal characteristics of nonnative speech" as the goal.
			The dominance of controlled techniques in the classroom <i>might</i> nevertheless <i>raise</i> some concerns. (RA1-14)	This statement stated in the form of mental process in which the phenomenon "some concerns" as the claim of the evaluation. The phenomenon "some concerns" is discussed further.
32			The less frequent use of guided (semicontrolled) or free techniques <i>may limit</i> the potential development of comprehensible learner pronunciation in authentic conversations. (RA1-15)	The claim is first discussed in the form of material process "may limit" in which "guided or free techniques" as the actor and "the potential development of comprehensible learner pronunciation in authentic conversations" as the recepient
			Finally, one of the study's major findings <i>relates</i> not so much to the specific area of pronunciation pedagogy as to the study of teachers' cognitions in general. (RA1- 54)	The general claim is stated in the form of relational process "relates not so much" with "one of the study's major findings" as the carrier and attribute "the specific area of pronunciation pedagogy as to the study of teachers' cognitions in general." as the overall claim of study.

33			Only through the combination of teachers' self-reports and classroom observations, and further supported by student reports, <i>can</i> a sufficiently detailed picture <i>be produced</i> . (RA1-59)	The specific claim is stated in the form of material process "can be produced". The process of producing has the actor "the combination of teachers' self- reports and classroom observations, and further supported by student report" and the goal of process "sufficiently detailed picture".
			Still, despite the lack of different types of LREs, the fact that the MG used one type of LRE significantly more than the NMG <i>indicates</i> that task modeling before engaging in pretask modeling can tune learners in to focus more on form. (RA2-67)	The implication of study stated in the form of verbal process "indicates" which report the first conclusion "task modeling before engaging in pretask modeling can tune learners in to focus more on form." under the circumstances of matter "the fact that the MG used one type of LRE significantly more than the NMG "
34			Novel to this study is the finding that pretask modeling <i>served</i> an important role in allocating learners' attentional resources to certain linguistic codes (i.e., questions) during pretask planning. (RA2-70)	This statement is stated in the form of relational attributive process "is" which "this study" as the carrier and "the finding" as the attribute. The attribute is further explained that stated in the form of relational attributive process "served". The carrier is "pretask modelling" and the attribute "an important role in allocating learners'" as the implication under the circumstances of time "during pretask"

				In terms of learning, the current study showed that there <i>was</i> a positive relationship between task modeling and question development. (RA2- 80)	sayer is "the current study" and the report "there <i>was</i> a positive relationship between task modeling and question development." as the claim of the authors stated in the form of relational attributive process
35		the materials given <i>should</i> <i>give</i> learners the opportunity to examine the problem from a variety of theoretical and practical perspectives, rather than giving a single perspective to be imitated by the students (Thomas, 2014). (SK1-85)	This statement is related to the authentic assessment on the real world activity which taken from previous study of Thomas in 2014 stated in the form of material process "should give" with the goal is "the materials given" which the actor was not mentioned to the goal "the opportunity to examine the problem from a variety of theoretical and"	Research has demonstrated that controlled techniques <i>can</i> <i>have</i> a positive impact on the development of learner intelligibility (e.g., Couper, 2003; Derwing et al., 1998) or on phonological improvement (e.g., Saito, 2007). (RA1-12- 13)	This advantageous of controlled techniques in previous study stated in the form of relational possession in which "controlled techniques" as the possessor and possessed "positive impact on the development of learner intelligibility or on phonological improvement" as the evidence of attribute "advantageous".

		Students' initiating move <i>is</i> importance (<i>sic</i>) in generating opportunity for receiving input and producing output (Boulima cited in Warin, 2011). (SK2-05)	This statement is stated in the form of relational identifying process with "Students' initiating move" as the carrier and "importance (sic)" as the attribute from the previous study report.	focusing on processes of task performance. (RA2-75)	This statement is stated in the form of relational attributive process "exemplifies" which "this excerpt" referring to Slimani (1991) reports as the carrier and "the fact" as the attribute which is further elaborated. The elaboration stated in the form of mental process in two clauses. The first one is "can interpret" which the "learners" as the senser and "the task's goals differently than the intentions of their teacher" as the phenomenon. The second one is "might care" which the "learners" as the senser and "more about just getting the task done as quickly as possible rather than focusing on processes of task performance." as the phenomenon.
36		feedback <i>aimed to notice</i> the lexical items, syntax, word choice or style by crossing out the errors and provided with the correct ones. (SK3-24)	This statement is stated in the form of relational process "aimed to". This was taken from previous study stated that "this direct way of delivering written feedback" (crossing out the errors and provided with the correct ones) as the carrier and "notice the lexical items," as the circumstances of purpose.	For instance, previous researchers <i>argued</i> that verbalizing while engaging in tasks or planning can be reactive, acting as an additional processes rather than providing a true reflection of their thoughts (e.g., Jourdenais, 2001; Sachs & Suh, 2007). (RA2-92)	This statement is stated in the for of verbal process "argued" which "previous researchers" as the sayer and "that verbalizing while engaging in tasks or planning can be reactive," as the report.

		response about the content of the written feedback was in line with Miao, Badger & Zhen (2006) and Anderson (2010) who <i>indicated</i> that the written feedback contains in grammar, content and the organization of the writing. (SK3-59)	the form of relational process "came from" which "the content of the written feedback" is the attribute and the	The current study operationalized question development based on a developmental sequence generated by Pienemann and Johnston (1987). (RA2-99)	This statement is stated in the form of material process "operationalized" which "the current study" as the actor and "question development based on" as the goal.
37				As highlighted by Mochizuki and Ortega (2008), it is <i>necessary to provide</i> effective guidance to learners who lack familiarity with processes of learner–learner interaction during task performance. (RA2- 114)	This statement is stated in the form of verbal process "highlighted" which "Mochizuki and Ortega (2008)" as the sayer of the report "it is necessary to provide effective guidance to learners who lack familiarity with processes of learner–learner interaction" under the circumstances of time "during task performance."

		As discussed earlier, L2 comprehensibility well <i>reflects</i> the amount of effort raters make to collect as much as linguistic information as possible from accented L2 speech in order to grasp its overall meaning (Derwing & Munro, 2009). (RA3-23)	This first statement tries to answer of the questions presented by relating to the general state of previous study which stated in the form of relational process "reflects". "L2 comprehensibility" acts as the carrier and the attribute "the amount of effort raters" as evidence from previous study.
38		Some scholars (e.g., Jenkins, 2002; Setter & Jenkins 2005) <i>have sought</i> to descriptively identify which linguistics errors are shared by many nonnative speakers with various L1 background without exerting much negative influence on speech intelligibility, such as mispronunciation of certain segmentals (e.g., interdental fricatives), schwa insertion in complex syllables, and monotonous (but not wrong) prosody. (RA3-32)	This statement from previous research is the elaboration of general interpretation that presented in the form of material process "have sought". "Some scholars (e.g., Jenkins, 2002; Setter & Jenkins 2005)" acts as the actor and "to descriptively identify" as the goal.

			uptake and automatic use of targeted features of pronunciation than focus-on- form instruction alone (Saito &	The second discussion of claim is stated in the form of verbal process "has shown" which "research/researchers ((Saito & Lyster, 2012)" as the sayer and "the use of communicative activities involving dyadic interaction has the potential for greater impact on learner uptake and automatic use of targeted features of pronunciation than focus-on-form instruction alone (Saito & Lyster, 2012)." as the report
39			Furthermore, with grammar- oriented focus on form, recent research <i>suggests</i> that the combined use of controlled activities with communicative activities can have a stronger positive impact on learner retention and automatization of grammatical structures than the use of mechanical activities or drills alone (Khatib & Nikouee, 2012). (RA1-18-19)	The third discussion of claim is stated in the form of verbal process "suggests" in which recent research/researchers (Khatib & Nikouee, 2012) as the sayer and "the combined use of controlled activities with communicative activities can have a stronger positive impact on learner retention and automatization of grammatical structures than the use of mechanical activities or drills alone (Khatib & Nikouee, 2012)." as the report

			As advocated by Borg (2003), studies of teachers' cognitions require an examination of teachers' actual pedagogical practices. (RA1-60-61)	This statement is stated in the form of verbal process "advocated" with "Borg, 2003" as the sayer to the report "studies of teachers' cognitions require an examination of teachers' actual pedagogical practices." as the reference from previous study.
40			As noted by Slimani (1991), learners <i>can interpret</i> instructional tasks differently (RA2-71)	This statement is stated in the form of mental process "can interpret" which "the learners" is the senser and "instructional tasks differently" as the phenomenon under the circumstances of point of view "as noted by Slimani (1991)"
			Yet multilingual raters, such as native speakers of SE, <i>may not</i> <i>need</i> many cognitive resources to do the task (relative to monolingual raters), thanks to their accumulative experience in the L2 accent-decoding process under multilingual conditions (Isaacs & Thomson, 2013) (RA3-47)	This statement is a further explanation of attribute "cognitively demanding task" that stated in the form of verbal process with "Isaac & Thomson, 2013" as the sayer to the report which stated in the form of mental process "may not need" with the senser is "native speakers of SE" and "many cognitive resources to do the task" as the phenomenon.

41	Evidence of the Claim	X	<i>confirmed</i> the reports of the knowledge, limited in pre- sufficiently elaborated pe cognitions, ec- representing of pronuncia	and practices are oviding a accurate and icture of teachers'	This statement is stated in the form of verbal process "confirmed" with "the process of investigation" as the sayer of the report that is further explained in the form of material process "are limited" with "teachers' self-reports of their belief, knowledge, and practices" as the actor to the goal "in providing, a sufficiently accurate and elaborated picture of teachers' cognitions, especially" as the evidence of the claim.
		X	their knowledge of oriented tech interview an frequently <i>p</i> complement with each so	d observation data <i>rovided</i> ary information, purce of data formation that the	This statement is stated in the form of relational attributive process "provided" with the carrier "the interview and observation data" and the attribute "complementary information, with each source of data supplying information that the other did not." as the example of evidence.
42			the MG <i>adv</i> question stag	0% of learners in <i>anced to</i> a higher ge, compared to hers in the NMG.	This statement is the evidence of the claim above stated in the form of relational attributive process. The process "advanced to" has the carrier "More than 70% of learners in the MG" and the attribute "a higher question stage, compared to 46% of learners in the NMG as the evidence.

	I	Limitatio n	Х	First as addressed previously, although think-alouds have been used as a methodological tool to gain insight into L2 learners' cognitive processes, the validity of using think- alouds as a research tool <i>needs</i> <i>to be considered</i> when interpreting the results. (RA2- 88)	This limitation is stated in the form of mental process "needs to be considered" which the senser is not stated to sense the phenomenon "the validity of using think-alouds as a research tool" under the circumstances of matter "when interpreting the results"
43			х	A second important caution <i>is</i> related to interpreting the acquisition of question formation. (RA2-98)	This limitation is stated in the form of relational attributive process "is related to" which a second important caution as the carrier and "interpreting the acquisition of question formation" as the attribute.
			Х	A third limitation is that all incidents of attention to form <i>should not be treated</i> as learning opportunities of equal quality. (RA2-101)	This limitation is stated in the form of relational attributive process "is" which "a third limitation" as the carrier and "all incidents of attention to form should not be treated as learning opportunities of equal quality." as the attribute.

44			X		One <i>might argue</i> that showing how other people performed the same tasks would limit learners' creative task performance. (RA2-110)	This limitation is stated in the form of verbal process "might argue" which "one" represents the general truth of performing tasks as the sayer and "that showing how other people" as the report. The report is stated in the form of relational attributive process "would limit" which "showing how other people performed the same tasks" as the carrier and "learners' creative task performance" as the attribute.
	Implicating the Study	ons of the field	While conducting story retelling assessment technique, the teacher <i>needs to provide</i> a rubric, (SK1-15)	The first suggestion stated in the form of material process "needs to provide" with "the teacher" as the actor and "a rubric" as the goal under circumstances of matter "while conducting story retelling assessment technique"	thus, one implication of this study's findings is that providing a concrete guide such as a task modeling video <i>may be</i> beneficial to young EFL learners. (RA2-77)	This statement is stated in the form of relational identifying process "is" which "this study's findings" as the identifier and the identified "providing providing a concrete guide such as a task modeling video may be beneficial to young EFL learners." as the implication of the study.

45	In case of the students retell the story, the teacher <i>should consider</i> of including the items of language component, story comprehension, str ategies in reconstructing the story, concept of story structure while recording the process. (SK1-17)	This statement is further elaboration of suggestion to make a rubric which stated in the form of mental process "consider" which the senser is "the teacher" and phenomenon "the items of language component, story comprehension,"	Our study adds that such raters' leniency per se <i>can be</i> <i>attributed</i> to their ability to sufficiently attend not only to main cues—pronounciation and fluency-but also to secondary cues-vocabulary and grammar—in making L2 comprehensibility judgements. (RA3-42)	This statement is stated in the form of verbal process "adds" as the continuous of previous study, "our study" acts as the sayer and the report "such raters' leniency per se can be attributed" as the contribution given from this study.
	In conducting the presentation, the teacher <i>needs to make</i> a briefing session before conducting the presentation. (SK1-55)	The suggestion n is stated in the form of material process "needs to make" with "the teacher" as the actor and "a briefing session before conducting the presentation" as the goal.		
46	Writing sample and project techniques conducted by the teacher still <i>needs</i> a variety in the form of the task and the criteria. (SK1- 62)	The suggestion is stated in the form of relational process "needs" with the "Writing sample and project techniques conducted by the teacher" as the carrier that carries "a variety in the form of the task and the criteria." as the attribute.		

	Beside, in the technique of project, there <i>is</i> an urgency of structuring much more details of needed criteria. (SK1-65)	This statement is stated in the form of existential process "is" with "an urgency of structuring much more details of needed criteria" as the existence.	
47	In conducting portfolio, as it is a tool for showing students' progress overtime and also providing overall picture of students' performance, the teacher <i>needs to pay attention</i> on some considerations. (SK1- 72)	The first suggestion of the object 3 is stated in the form of material process "needs to pay attention" with "the teacher" as the actor and "on some considerations" as the goal.	
	And also there <i>is</i> need of the use of a varied resources rather than a limited number of preselected references in order to habituating students to differentiate relevant and irrelevant information related to the topic. (SK1-86)	This statement is further elaboration of assessment process stated in the form of existential process "is" with "need of the use of a varied resources rather than a limited number of preselected references" as the existence under circumstances of purpose "in order to habituating students to"	

So , it was teacher's responsibility to give opportunities to the This suggestion statement is stated in the form of relational process "was"	<i>needs to give</i> more chance to all student to evaluate their problems given by using varied perspective and construct their own meaning toward a topic. (SK1-87)	This statement is the conclusion of the application of authentic assessment which stated in the form of relational process "is" with "this" related to the purpose of assessment as the carrier to carry the attribute "why the teacher needs to give more chance to all student to evaluate their problems given" under the circumstances of manner "by using varied	
	So, it <i>was</i> teacher's responsibility to give opportunities to the	perspective and construct their own meaning toward a topic." This suggestion statement is stated in the form of relational process "was"	

49	Recomm endation for future study	X	That said, future research still <i>needs to determine</i> the degree to which controlled techniques should be coupled with guided techniques to enhance learner comprehensibility for use in free activities or outside the classroom. (RA1-27-28)	The recommendation is stated in the form of material process "needs to determine" in which future research as the actor and the goa "the degree to which controlled techniques should be coupled with guided techniques" as the recommendation.
		Х	However, more research <i>is</i> <i>warranted</i> that specifically focuses on what linguistic characteristic overlap among nonnative speakers of English in Singapore and Japan. (RA3- 37)	This recommendation is the following interpretation that generated for future study which stated in the form of material process "is warranted". "More research" acts as the actor and "specifically focuses on what linguistic characteristics" as the goal of recommendation.
50		X	Future studies might do a methodological comparison of concurrent versus retrospective data collection <i>to gauge</i> insight into learners' cognitive processes during pretask planning in order to see if there is a difference. (Ra2-96)	This recommendation is stated in the form of material process "might do" which the "future studies" as the actor and "a methodological comparison of concurrent versus retrospective data collection to gauge insight into learners' cognitive processes during pretask planning in order to see if there is a difference." as the goal.

		X	Future studies that employ an even wider variety of evidence of language learning development targeting various structures <i>are certainly</i> <i>warranted</i> , for example, using measures of accuracy or other measures of interlanguage emergence. (RA2-100)	This recommendation is stated in the form of material process "are certainly warranted" which the future studies as the actor and "employ an even wider variety of evidence of language learning development targeting" as the goal.
51		X	Although the current study reports on the frequency of attention to form, the quality of resolving any questions or feedback raised during LREs <i>should be addressed</i> in future studies. (RA2-103)	This recommending statement is stated in the form of material process "should be addressed" which the process of addressing has "the quality of resolving any questions or feedback raised during LREs" as the goal and "future studies" as the actor.
		X	In addition, more detailed qualitative analyses <i>would be</i> useful to examine how linguistic issues attended to during planning time are addressed or revisited during task performance. *RA2-108)	The recommendation of methodology is stated in the form of relational attributive process "would be" which "more detailed analyses" as the carrier of the attribute "useful". The useful of the analyses is further explained in the form of non-finite clause "to examine" as a material process and the goal "how linguistic issues attended to during planning time are addressed or revisited during task performance."

52		X	Therefore, other guided planning strategies <i>should be</i> <i>examined</i> and <i>compared</i> to pretask modeling in terms of their effectiveness in future studies. (RA2-112)	This recommendation is stated in two clauses. The first clause is stated in the form of material process "examined" which "other guided planning strategies" as the goal. The second clause is stated in the form of relational process "compared to" which "other guided planning strategies" as the carrier and "pretask modelling in terms of their effectiveness" as the attribute of the process under the circumstance of location "in the future studies"
		Х	Nevertheless, more research <i>is</i> <i>needed to determine</i> the effectiveness of using kinesthetic/tactile techniques to enhance learner comprehensibility. (RA1-43- 44)	This recommendation is stated in the form of material process "is needed to determine" with the "more research" as the actor and the goal "the effectiveness of using kinesthetic/tactile techniques" as the recommendation.

Biografi Penulis



Namanya adalah Ferina Kemala Rahmawati, Lahir di Jakarta, 07 Februari 1995, ia adalah anak pertama dari tiga bersaudara, buah dari pasangan Cik Mansyur dan Tri Cahyani. Ferin adalah panggilan akrabnya, ia terlahir di keluarga yang sederhana yang bertempat tinggal di Vila Anggrek Blok B 2 no.19 Karang Satria, Bekasi. Penulis berkebangsaan asli Indonesia dan beragama Islam.

Ketika berumur 5 setengah tahun, ia memulai pendidikan di SD Mutiara 17 Agustus kemudian setelah lulus dia melanjutkan pendidikannya di SMP Negeri 1 Bekasi di tahun 2006. Selepas lulus dari SMP di tahun 2009, dia melanjutkan pendidikannya di SMA Negeri 4 Kota Bekasi. Kini, ia telah menjadi seorang guru bahasa Inggris di SMP Swasta di daerah Bekasi dengan berbekal pengalamannya selama menjadi mahasiswa di jurusan Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris Universitas Negeri Jakarta. Ia dinyatakan lulus di Universitas Negeri Jakarta pada bulan Januari di tahun 2017 pada tanggal 27 dengan judul skripsi *The Moves of the Discussion Sections of the English Study Program* Skripsis *and TESOL Quarterly Journal: a Qualitative Analysis*.

Penulis