

CHAPTER V

CONCLUSION

5.1. Conclusion

The identity of every Muslim woman cannot be homogenized since it merges with immensely diverse ethnicity, social class, levels of education and employment, geographical location, language, gender and age. However, the stereotypes that constructed by Western media categorize them into the same characters and attributes that they have to carry. Melanie Elturk is a Muslim woman influencer who brings forth her individualism in her business account, Haute Hijab's Instagram posts. In order to finish this study, the question comes up with 'how does Haute Hijab construct Melanie Elturk's Muslimah identity?'

In answering the research questions, the writer found that in the representational meaning, Haute Hijab applies the conceptual structure in almost every picture of Melanie Elturk. This process helps the writer reveals how Melanie Elturk's identity is constructed. The answer discovered by analysing every elements, including outfits, the setting of place, the gesture, and even the dominant colours in the pictures, that defines Elturk's identity itself. These mentioned things closely related to the meaning of success, active, and confident woman.

Regarding interpersonal meaning, Haute Hijab indicates a medium engagement with the viewers, as based on the gazes, the distances, and the angles chosen. In the terms of gaze, half of the pictures present Elturk as maintaining imaginary relationship with the viewers through eye contacts, while half of the

others do not. In the term of gaze, almost every picture applies far social distances which present Elturk as stranger than a friend to the viewer. However, through the majority of frontal and medium angles applied, the viewers are involved in Elturk's world and matter, and given equal power relation.

Meanwhile, all of the compositional meaning of the eight posts is strong. Elturk's figure is consistently positioned on the centre of the frames. The majority of the pictures also have high salience and strong framing. Those elements are actually important to present Elturk's image at the clearest and obvious level. Since her figure is not distracted by any other participants, the viewer can recognize her more easily.

In the textual analysis, the writer found that among the six process types, Haute Hijab uses relational, material, and mental the most. Relational process is useful to relate Melanie Elturk with the positive qualities and characters that she desires, such as successful, enlightened, and determined. Material process is used to explain all of the activities that Elturk physically did, thus asserting her as an active individual. At last, mental process expresses her positive feeling and excitements towards her own achievements.

Melanie Elturk constructs her Muslimah identity as the opposite with the stereotypes of Muslim women in Western media. From the eight posts that the writer has chosen, there are five posts which give the message to the reader about Melanie Elturk as a confident and successful woman in business and fashion field. She is also shown to be positive, determined, and content with her life. Those are represented by visual elements such as her smiling facial expression, symbolism

of colors that appear on her clothes and makeup. There are also transitivity processes that support this construction such as relational to relate herself with her achievements, mental to show how she reacts and feels towards her accomplishments, and material to present the activities that she does to build and maintain her success. All of those discussions counteract the idea that Muslim women are oppressed in their lives.

Haute Hijab also brings the idea that Melanie Elturk is a Muslim woman who has a high self-agency. The writer found that from the eight posts that have been chosen, Melanie always shows that she is a person with freedom to choose. This is represented by how she wears her outfits and does activities with consent. Moreover, relational processes are utilized to relate herself with identities that she puts up on her behalf, mental processes depict her positive feelings and reactions about her activities, and material processes explain the activities that she does consciously. All of those results become an example that Melanie a Muslim woman who is not submissive or lacking of agency.

Besides counteracting the oppressed and submissive stereotypes about Muslim women, the writer also found that Haute Hijab constructs Melanie's identity as an active person, thus defeating the stereotypes about passive Muslim women. From the eight posts that the writer has chosen, there are five posts that presents Melanie as an active and responsible business woman. This construction is represented by the narrative of her activities and the choice of clothes that support her high mobility. There are also several occasion such as fashion events, business trips or being featured in magazines to show that Melanie actively participates in public spheres. Regarding written elements, material processes are

used to explain her activities and relational processes show that those activities and clothes belong to her.

Lastly, Muslim women are assumed that they wear hijab due to the force attempted by their family or socio-religious organizations. Though, the writer found that from the eight posts, Melanie shows that she wears hijab with conscious consent. This is represented by how she pairs her hijab with other fashion elements and becomes confident in them. Indeed, the combinations of clothes and hijabs are employed to build a fashionable Muslim woman image of herself. Furthermore, material processes state that hijab makes her religious identity becomes obvious, verbal process show that hijab articulates her religious identity, and relational processes relate her hijab and religious identity with proudness and honor.

All of the visual and written elements analysed have contributed in constructing Melanie Elturk's Muslimah identity as successful, respected woman in both business and fashion field. She is also portrayed as having positive, determined, and encouraging characters, sometimes fun and creative, always active, passionate, responsible and professional for her business, and fashionable in pairing hijab with other fashion elements to build her desired impression. This way, Elturk has done some virtual performance by using visual and textual signs in front of the public which is her viewers at Instagram. In return of this identity construction, the viewers will get impression that she is as those identities she implied in the posts.

5.2. Recommendation

After finishing the analysis of the construction of Muslimah identity through Haute Hijab's Instagram posts, the writer hopes that this study will be useful to those who are interested in analyzing the meaning behind images and texts, and can contribute to the media discourse and the cultural study. The writer also recommends to those who are interested to conduct the research about the comparison of Muslimah identities between two different figures or how Muslimah identity constructions are commodified to market hijab products.



REFERENCES

- Abdullahi, M. (2018, November 30). Forgotten women: the impact of Islamophobia on Muslim women in Sweden, Brussels, Swedish National Report to the European Network Against Racism (ENAR). Retrieved January 1, 2020, from EU FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS DATABASE website: <https://fra.europa.eu/en/databases/anti-muslim-hatred/node/2130>
- Ahmed, Sameera. (2020). Converging Identities, Emerging Discourses: Muslim Female Voices in British Media. *ESSACHESS - Journal for Communication Studies*. 12. 79-97.
- Alters, S. & Schiff, W. (2009). *Essential Concepts for Healthy Living*. Jones & Bartlett Publishers. p. 143. ISBN 978-0763756413.
- Aly, A. & Walker, D. (2007). Veiled Threats: Recurrent Cultural Anxieties in Australia. *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs*, 27(2), 203-214.
- Barker, C. (1999). *Television, Globalization and Cultural Identities*. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- Bell, D. (2001). *An Introduction to Cybercultures*. London; New York, N.Y.: Routledge.
- Bennoune, K. (2007). Secularism and Human Rights: A Contextual Analysis of Headscarves, Religious Expression, and Women's Equality Under International Law, 45 *COLUM. J. TRANSNAT'L L.* 367, 397-98.
- Bilge, S. (2010). Beyond Subordination vs. Resistance: An Intersectional Approach to the Agency of Veiled Muslim Women, 31 *J. INTERCULTURAL STUD.*, 1, 21, DOI: 10.1080/07256860903477662.
- Blanco, J. F., Doering, M. D., Hunt-Hurst, P., & Lee, H. V. (2016). *Clothing and Fashion: American Fashion from Head to Toe*. Santa Barbara, California: Abc-Clio, An Imprint of Abc-Clio, Llc.
- Blommaert, J., & Varis, P. (2015). Culture as Accent: The Cultural Logic of Hijabistas. *Semiotica: Revue Publ. Par l'Association Internationale de Semiotique*, 2015(203), 153–177. <https://doi.org/10.1515/sem-2014-0067>
- Bloor, T., & Bloor, M. (2013). *The functional analysis of English: a Hallidayan approach*. London; New York, N.Y.: Routledge.
- Bradford, J. (2014). *Fashion Journalism* (p. 129). London: Routledge.

- Brown, D., & Fiorella, S. (2013). Influence Marketing: How to Create, Manage, and Measure Brand Influencers in Social Media Marketing | InformIT. Retrieved October 2, 2019, from pearson.com website: <https://www.pearson.com/us/higher-education/product/Brown-Influence-Marketing-How-to-Create-Manage-and-Measure-Brand-Influencers-in-Social-Media-Marketing/9780133391640.html>
- Bruculieri, J. (2019, August 3). Women and Pants: A Timeline of Fashion Liberation. Retrieved from Huffpost website: https://www.huffpost.com/entry/women-and-pants-fashion-liberation_1_5c7ec7f7e4b0e62f69e729ec
- Bureau Labour Statistics. (2018). Instagram: active users 2018 | Statista. Retrieved October 7, 2019, from Statista website: <https://www.statista.com/statistics/253577/number-of-monthly-active-instagramusers/>
- Choudhury, C.A. (2009). Empowerment or Estrangement?: Liberal Feminism's Visions of the "Progress" of Muslim Women, 39 U. BALT. L.F. 153, 158-59.
- Cheek, J. (2008). Foucauldian discourse analysis. *The Sage Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods*, 1, 355–357.
- Chris. (2014, October 17). Body Language of Arms Akimbo. Retrieved February 16, 2020, from Nonverbal Body Language Dictionary website: <http://bodylanguageproject.com/nonverbal-dictionary/body-language-of-arms-akimbo/>
- Dillon, S. (2011). *The Fundamentals of Fashion Management*. New York: Bloomsbury Visual Arts.
- Delbridge, E. (2019, November 21). The 8 Best Business Magazines of 2019. Retrieved from The Balance Small Business website: <https://www.thebalancesmb.com/best-business-magazines-4176680>
- Detroit “Motor City,” Michigan. (n.d.). Retrieved February 16, 2020, from www.americaslibrary.gov website: http://www.americaslibrary.gov/es/mi/es_mi_detroit_1.html
- Ellison, N. B., & Vitak, J. (2015). Social Network Site Affordances and Their Relationship to Social Capital Processes. *The Handbook of the Psychology of Communication Technology*, 203–227. <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781118426456.ch9>

- Evolvi, G. (2017). Hybrid Muslim Identities in Digital Space: The Italian Blog Yalla. *Social Compass*, 64(2), 220–232. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0037768617697911>
- Fowler, R. (2009). *Linguistic Criticism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Functions of Safety Shoes. (2016, December 6). Retrieved February 16, 2020, from Gary for Boots website: <https://garyforboots.co.uk/news/functions-of-safety-shoes/>
- Gane, N., & Beer, D. (2008). *New Media: The Key Concepts*. Oxford; New York: Berg.
- Goetz, L. (2019, July 5). Top 10 Most Expensive Cities in the U.S. Retrieved from Investopedia website: <https://www.investopedia.com/articles/personal-finance/080916/top-10-most-expensive-cities-us.asp>
- Goffman, E. (2016). *The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life*. New York: Doubleday.
- Haleem, A. (2015). Covenance: Feminist Theory, the Islamic Veil, and the Strasbourg Court's Jurisprudence on Religious Dress-Appearance Restrictions, 5 DePaul J. *Women, Gender & L.*
- Hall, S. (1997). *Representation: Cultural Representations and Signifying Practices*. London Thousand Oaks, California: Sage in Association with the Open University.
- Hall, S., & Du Gay, P. (2012). *Questions of Cultural Identity*. London; Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Halliday, M. A. K., & Hasan, R. (1985). *Language, Context and Text: Aspects of Language in a Social-Semiotic Perspective*. Geelong: Deakin University Press.
- Halliday, M. A. K., & M, C. (2004). *An Introduction to Functional Grammar*. London& New York: Arnold.
- Hannover, B., & Kuhnen, U. (2002). “The Clothing Makes the Self” via Knowledge Activation. *Journal of Applied Social Psychology*, 32(12), 2513–2525. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1559-1816.2002.tb02754.x>
- Heller, E., & Mielke, J. C. (2004). *Psicología del color: cómo actúan los colores sobre los sentimientos y la razón*. Barcelona: Gustavo Gili.

- Huang, Y.-T., & Su, S.-F. (2018). Motives for Instagram Use and Topics of Interest among Young Adults. *Future Internet*, 10(8), 77. <https://doi.org/10.3390/fi10080077>
- Ibba, S., Orrù, M., Pani, F. E., & Porru, S. (2015). Hashtag of Instagram: From Folksonomy to Complex Network. *Proceedings of the 7th International Joint Conference on Knowledge Discovery, Knowledge Engineering and Knowledge Management*. <https://doi.org/10.5220/0005613502790284>
- Janson, E. (2011). Stereotypes that Define “Us”: The Case of Muslim Women. *ENDC Proceedings*, 14, 181–196. Retrieved from <http://www.ksk.edu.ee/toimetised>
- Kaplan, A. M., & Haenlein, M. (2010). Users of the world, unite! The challenges and opportunities of Social Media. *Business Horizons*, 53(1), 59–68. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bushor.2009.09.003>
- Kasuma, J., Yacob, Y., Jamadin, N., Shafiee, A. S., & Sulaiman, S. (2019). Celebrity Endorsement of Luxury Brands in Purchasing Pattern Among Generation Z Customers. *SSRN Electronic Journal*, 3(5). <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3500626>
- Kerboua, S. (2016). From Orientalism to neo-Orientalism: Early and contemporary constructions of Islam and the Muslim world. *Intellectual Discourse*, 24(1). Retrieved from <https://journals.iium.edu.my/intdiscourse/index.php/islam/article/view/681>
- Khan, Muhammad & Zahra, Sadaf. (2016). Portrayal of Muslim Women by Western Print Media: A Textual Analysis in Feministic & Orientalist Perspective. 17. 41-57.
- Kress, G. R., & Leeuwen, T. V. (2006). *Reading Images: The Grammar of Visual Design*. Lieu De Publication Non Identifié: Routledge.
- Kim, S. D. (2010, March 10). Skyscrapers express wealth and power of the city - eb247 - Opinion - Comment - Emirates24|7. Retrieved February 16, 2020, from www.emirates247.com website: <https://www.emirates247.com/eb247/opinion/comment/skyscrapers-express-wealth-and-power-of-the-city-2010-03-10-1.66898>
- Li, D. (2014, April 2). What’s the science behind a smile? | British Council. Retrieved February 16, 2020, from www.britishcouncil.org website: <https://www.britishcouncil.org/voices-magazine/famelab-whats-science-behind-smile>
- Lemke, J. L. (1990). *Using Language in the Classroom*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Melanie Elturk. (n.d.). Retrieved February 16, 2020, from Book A Muslim website: <https://bookamuslim.com/melanie-elturk/>

Melanie Elturk, CEO, Haute Hijab. (2014, October 3). Retrieved February 16, 2020, from Style Vanity website: <https://stylevanity.com/2014/10/melanie-elturk-haute-hijab.html>

Melanie Elturk Keynote Speaker Profile. (n.d.). Retrieved February 16, 2020, from www.aespeakers.com website: <https://www.aespeakers.com/speakers/melanie-elturk>

Merriam-Webster. (2016). *Merriam Webster's Collegiate Dictionary*. Springfield: Merriam-Webster.

Mondalek, A. (2018, March 2). The History of Women Wearing Pants As Power Symbol. Retrieved from HuffPost website: https://www.huffpost.com/entry/the-history-of-women-wearing-pants-as-power-symbol_n_5a99bb95e4b0a0ba4ad34fe7

Morris, P. H., White, J., Morrison, E. R., & Fisher, K. (2013). High heels as supernormal stimuli: How wearing high heels affects judgements of female attractiveness. *Evolution and Human Behavior*, 34(3), 176–181. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.evolhumbehav.2012.11.006>

Navarro, L. (2010). Islamophobia and Sexism: Muslim Women in the Western Mass Media. *Human Architecture: Journal of the Sociology of Self-Knowledge*, VIII (2).

New York Fashion Week Event Hosting. (n.d.). Retrieved February 16, 2020, from Spring website: <https://www.springstudios.com/event/new-york-fashion-week/>

Ogilvie, M., & Ryan, M. (2011). Lipstick: More than a Fashion Trend. Retrieved January 20, 2020, from <https://ro.ecu.edu.au/ecuworks2011/107/>

Ong'onda, A. N. (2016). Transitivity Analysis of Newspaper Headlines on Terrorism Attack in Kenya: A Case Study of Westgate Mall, Nairobi. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 6(9). Retrieved from http://www.ijhssnet.com/journals/Vol_6_No_9_September_2016/10.pdf

Paramboukis, O., Skues, J., & Wise, L. (2016). An Exploratory Study of the Relationships between Narcissism, Self-Esteem and Instagram Use. *Social Networking*, 05(02), 82–92. <https://doi.org/10.4236/sn.2016.52009>

Paton, E. (2016, November 1). Asserting a Muslim Fashion Identity. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from

<http://www.nytimes.com/2016/11/03/fashion/islamic-fashion-vogue-arabia.html>

- Peluchette, J. V., & Karl, K. (2007). The Impact of Workplace Attire on Employee Self-perceptions. *Human Resource Development Quarterly*, 18(3), 345–360. <https://doi.org/10.1002/hrdq.1208>
- Pickering, M. (2015). Stereotyping and Stereotypes. *The Wiley Blackwell Encyclopedia of Race, Ethnicity, and Nationalism*, 1–2. <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781118663202.wberen046>
- Pihlaja, S. & Thompson, N. (2017). I love the Queen: Positioning in young British Muslim discourse. *Discourse, Context & Media*. 20, 52-58.
- Potts, J. (2009). Lifting the Veil on Fashion: Filling the Gaps Between Modesty and Fashion Apparels. *The Ohio State University. Department of Consumer Sciences Honors Theses*. <https://doi.org/http://hdl.handle.net/1811/44568>
- Rodriguez Mosquera, P. M., Khan, T., & Selya, A. (2017). American Muslims' Anger and Sadness about In-group Social Image. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 7. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2016.02042>
- Ryan, Thomas. "Seeing Ourselves: Exploring Race, Ethnicity and Culture." *Journal of Teaching and Learning* 3, no. 1 (2006).
- Salomon, D. (2013). Moving on from Facebook: Using Instagram to connect with undergraduates and engage in teaching and learning. *College & Research Libraries News*, 74(8), 408–412. <https://doi.org/10.5860/crln.74.8.8991>
- Schmitt, A., Rosing, K., Zhang, S. X., & Leatherbee, M. (2017). A Dynamic Model of Entrepreneurial Uncertainty and Business Opportunity Identification: Exploration as a Mediator and Entrepreneurial Self-Efficacy as a Moderator. *Entrepreneurship Theory and Practice*, 42(6), 835–859. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1042258717721482>
- Sheldon, P., & Bryant, K. (2016). Instagram: Motives for its use and relationship to narcissism and contextual age. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 58, 89–97. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2015.12.059>
- Sim, M. A. (2017). Unveiling the Secret Stories: Conservative Female Blogosphere in Turkey. *İleti-ş-Im, Galatasaray University Journal of Communication*, (26), 39–39. <https://doi.org/10.16878/gsuilet.324191>
- Tajfel, Henri (1981). "Social stereotypes and social groups". In Turner, John C.; Giles, Howard (eds.). *Intergroup behaviour*. Oxford: Blackwell. pp. 144–167. ISBN 978-0-631-11711-7.

- The Sun Symbol. (n.d.). Retrieved February 16, 2020, from www.braco.me website: <https://www.braco.me/en/about/sun-symbol/>
- Ting, Hiram & wong poh ming, Winnie & De Run, Ernest & Choo, Sally. (2015). Beliefs about the Use of Instagram: An Exploratory Study. *International Journal of Business and Innovation*. 2. 15-31.
- Unsworth, L., & Wheeler, J. (2002). Re-valuing the role of images in reviewing picture books. *Reading*, 36(2), 68–74. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-9345.00189>
- Unsworth, S., Gualmini, A., & Helder, C. (2008). Children's Interpretation of Indefinites in Sentences Containing Negation: A Reassessment of the Cross-Linguistic Picture. *Language Acquisition*, 15(4), 315–328. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10489220802338742>
- Van Es, M. A. (2017). Muslim Women as 'Ambassadors' of Islam: Breaking Stereotypes in Everyday Life. *Identities*, 26(4), 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1070289x.2017.1346985>
- Van Leeuwen, T. (2008). *Introducing Social Semiotics*. London: Routledge.
- Weiss, D. (2014). "That's Part of What We Do": The Performative Power of Vogue's Anna Wintour. *Vogue's Anna Wintour Journal of Magazine & New Media Research*, 1(1). Retrieved from <https://cjdept.unm.edu/research/recent/docs/weiss-thats-part-of-what-we-do-chapter-2014.pdf>
- Wiles, Ellen. (2007). Headscarves, Human Rights, and Harmonious Multicultural Society: Implications of the French Ban for Interpretations of Equality, 41 *LAW & SOC'Y REV.* 699, 723-24.
- Wood, A. F., & Smith, M. J. (2005). *Online Communication: Linking Technology, Identity, & Culture*. (2nd ed.). Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers.
- Yang, Y. (2016). A Social Semiotic Approach to Multimodal Discourse of the Badge of Xi'an Jiaotong University. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 6(8), 1596. <https://doi.org/10.17507/tpls.0608.11>
- Ziegler, R. (2006). The French "Headscarves Ban": Intolerance or Necessity?, 40 *J. MARSHALL L. REV.* 235, 24.